

AGENDA # 3

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	PRESENTED: November 7, 2007
TITLE: 479 Commerce Drive – PUD-SIP, Modifications to a Previously Approved Hotel. 9 th Ald. Dist. (07907)	REFERRED: REREFERRED: REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	ADOPTED: POF:
DATED: November 7, 2007	ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Lou Host-Jablonski, Chair; Marsha Rummel, Bonnie Cosgrove, Bruce Woods, Richard Slayton, John Harrington and Jay Ferm.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of November 7, 2007, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL** of a PUD-SIP. Appearing on behalf of the project were Gary Brink and Barry Perkl. Prior to the presentation staff noted that the Commission had granted final approval of a PUD-SIP for a “Homewood Suites Hotel” located at 479 Commerce Drive. Recent modifications to the interior unit type and number have resulted in several modifications to the detailing and fenestration of the building’s exterior façade, especially in regard to projecting elements affecting the appearance of the building, therefore staff has required formal consideration by the Commission of the collective modifications at this time. Brink then provided an overview of the collective changes to the various building elevations. Brink further elaborated that the changes were based on modifications to the room mix and type resulting in alterations to the previously approved building footprint. The elimination of a double queen 1-bedroom unit type with an increase in the number of studios resulted in a less pronounced building footprint. Following a review of the various elevational modifications, the Commission noted the following:

- Need to look at architecturally, drawings would benefit if they had shadow lines.
- The simplification of the roofline with elimination of upper gable end features about the 4th story portion of the hotel as it connects to the 1-story hotel commons area.
- A proposed alternate roofline treatment presented by Brink was favored, which incorporated subgable roof treatment to further break up the roofline.
- Issues with the blankness of the north façade noted with a request to eliminate the gable treatment for hip end treatment on the north elevation.
- The chimney on the modified version of the plan was noted as not as handsome with preferences for the chimney design as originally proposed.

ACTION:

On a motion by Slayton, seconded by Rummel, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL**. The motion was passed on a unanimous vote of (7-0). The motion provided for the following:

- A continuation of the eave line across lower portions of the gable end roof treatment on the north elevation, as well as elimination of the gable roof treatment for a hip roof treatment.
- A beefing up of the chimney design similar to that as previously proposed, in addition to alterations involving the incorporation of subgables on the upper roofline.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 5, 5, 5, 6 and 6.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 479 Commerce Drive

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	5
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	6
	-	5	-	-	-	-	-	5
	-	5	-	-	-	-	-	5
	-	6	-	-	-	-	-	6

General Comments:

- Original design was better, but the changes are acceptable, with the modifications discussed.