

From: [Lindsey Lee](#)
To: [Scanlon, Amy](#); [REDACTED]
Cc: [Rummel, Marsha](#); [MNA Board](#); [Steve Steinhoff](#); [Gary Tipler](#); [Darcy Haber](#)
Subject: 906 Williamson St. proposed curved roof element
Date: Sunday, April 26, 2015 1:35:28 PM

Resending due to formatting error. Amy can you include this version in the record. Thank you, Lindsey

Dear Amy Scanlon, City of Madison Preservation Planner, and members of the Landmarks Commission,

I am writing you about the 906 Williamson Street project that will be before you April 26, 2015.

In the Preservation Planners' Staff Report she recommends to the Commission that the curved roof elements be removed. Her analysis is that the "(a)pplicant has previously explained that the curved roof elements speak to the Quonset hut/Trachte building curved roofs that existed in the industrial corridor, but those structures are not in the visually related area. A curved roof is a striking form that is not compatible with the flat and pitched roofs of the buildings in the visually related area."

At various neighborhood meetings, including MNA Preservation and Development committee meetings, I believe the general consensus was that this was the best visual element of the design.

I strongly disagree with the underlying premiss of the Preservation Planner's argument that in historical districts new architectural forms can never be introduced and instead new designs should be limited to what already exists in the surrounding area.

It is not honoring nearby landmark buildings by constructing next to them bland, purposefully unremarkable, new buildings. The *BEST* way to honor landmark buildings of the past is to encourage the designing and building of unique structures that might potentially be considered by future generations worthy of their own landmark designation.

In consideration of Willy Street in particular, this is a community that celebrates diversity and creativity. I like to say that we are not beige but purple! When new designs are proposed for our unique community they should be vibrant and strikingly interesting. Cookie cutter concepts should be left for the suburbs.

Finally, when Janine Glaeser and Randy Bruce first showed this metal curved roof design to the Preservation and Development committee, I predicted that even though it was well received by people who saw it in our neighborhood, the first criticism it received from the Landmarks Commission Randy would quickly compromise and say he will be happy to redesign it as a flat roof. After all, it will save his clients \$15,000 to just build a common flat roof compared to the more unique curved one that requires extra engineering and special metal fabrication.

I have the highest respect for the City of Madison Preservation Planner, but I believe her

analysis is flawed in this area. (Though, I wonder if she feels constrained in her analysis based on her reading of the ordinance.)

Thank you for your time and have a great meeting.

Lindsey Lee

■ Williamson Street