

From: Rpyramid@aol.com [mailto:Rpyramid@aol.com]
Sent: Wednesday, May 25, 2011 1:34 PM
To: Martin, Al
Subject: RE: 1102 South Park Street

To: Madison Urban Design Commission

Re: May 25 meeting, Agenda Item # 8, 1102 South Park Street

I see many problems with this proposed new Wingra Clinic at 1102 South Park Street

No basement in new clinic? Mostly glass exterior walls? Where will everyone hide during a tornado?

Most buildings in the South recently hit by tornados have no basements and the tornados are just leaving a bare slab on grade, no more building.

If minimum parking needed is 4 stalls per 1000sf of clinic floor area = $4 \times 76.8 = 370.2$ stalls why does proposed parking = 220 stalls in ramp + 65 stalls surface parking = 285 stalls total? Seems this plan is at minimum 22 parking stalls short.

Proposed clinic = 19,182sf footprint with total of 67,800sf on 4 floors
Proposed parking ramp roughly = $172 \times 190 = 32,680$ sf per level with 2 proposed levels at and above grade. No parking proposed below grade. Parking ramp footprint is almost twice as big as proposed clinic! This is not acceptable urban land use.

Quote from proposed Wingra Clinic report-

" Subsurface soil conditions preclude the structure from being economically constructed with parking levels fully below street grades."

How do they know this? Were soil borings performed at the site?

Dean Clinic located just south of this site has similar soil conditions and has a full basement and is actually at the same or lower ground elevation than 1102 South Park Street block.

Expected soil conditions (my guess based on 20 years experience in geotechnical engineering and personally performing thousands of soil borings in the Madison area)---

Expect 4 to 8 feet of fill material then 1 to 3 feet of clay above clean washed beach sand. Various sandy glacial deposits below that. Expect groundwater approximately 20 feet or more below ground surface at corner of Fish Hatchery Road and Midland and 15 feet or more below ground surface near center of proposed building site.

With these expected soil conditions, I see no reason why the proposed clinic cannot have a full basement or one or two levels of parking beneath the clinic building. I see no reason why the proposed parking ramp cannot be modified in a combination of the following ways-

- Put parking under clinic and make clinic 5 floors high
- Design parking ramp with two parking levels below ground
- Put condos on top of parking ramp?

This location for the Wingra Clinic has major traffic problems. Proposed new curb cut for new entrance across from Emerson Street will have poor access/exit during heavy traffic conditions. Midland Street and High Street also have difficult ingress/egress during heavy traffic.

This proposed new Wingra Clinic at 1102 South Park Street will severely limit the future development potential of the remainder of this unique flatiron parcel in a prime location in Madison. It uses 2/3 of the entire developable parcel and does not allow the remaining parcel enough land for parking unless that parking is also entirely below a proposed building. Personally, I think the entire block at 1102 South Park Street should be developed as one parcel with whatever goes there utilizing the entire block with all parking located beneath the structure and a portion of the structure reaching 5 and 6 stories. The views of the city from the upper floors would be fantastic.

There are many other properties in South Madison that this proposed clinic could also fit on. Have they been thoroughly investigated? Why not put it directly across Park Street from the current Wingra Clinic in the Villager Mall complex? What about using the Former Army Armory property next to Copsps? Or the vacant property north of the Labor Temple? Did they investigate purchasing the Northeast corner of Park St and Badger Road including the Comstock Tire property?

If Wingra Clinic does not think any of those properties are suitable, they should start from scratch with the parcel at 1102 South Park Street. Why not purchase the remaining two parcels at the corner of Park Street and Midland and fully utilize the entire southern part of the block? Why not put the parking beneath the clinic and place the entire building complex in the area where the proposed parking ramp was located? Dean clinic just to the south does not have any frontage on Park Street and the frontage on Fish Hatchery Road is the back of the building with the main entrance on South Street. Patients seem to have no trouble finding it.

Sincerely,
Ron Shutvet
925 Lake Court
Madison WI
608-358-8807