

AGENDA # 9

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	PRESENTED: November 7, 2007
TITLE: 301-321 North Hamilton Street, 318-324 East Johnson Street, 308-310 North Hancock Street - PUD-GDP for a 4-Story Residential Building. 2nd Ald. Dist. (07908)	REFERRED: REREFERRED: REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	ADOPTED: POF:
DATED: November 7, 2007	ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Lou Host-Jablonski, Chair; Marsha Rummel, Bonnie Cosgrove, Bruce Woods, Richard Slayton, John Harrington and Jay Ferm.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of November 7, 2007, the Urban Design Commission **RECEIVED AN INFORMATIONAL PRESENTATION** on a PUD-GDP. Appearing on behalf of the project were Dave Paul and Ed Freer, The Alexander Company; Ald. Brenda Konkel, District 2; Erik Paulson, Neighborhood Steering Committee for the Block 658 Project; Phil Hees and Gene Devitt. The project provides for the redevelopment of a triangular shaped block bounded by North Hamilton Street, East Johnson Street and North Hancock Street. A redevelopment project requires that five residential buildings and a 2-story commercial building be demolished to allow for the development of a 4-story, 67-unit residential building, in combination with the maintenance of a 2-story commercial building at the apex of the corner of North Hamilton and East Johnson Streets referred to as the Pinkus McBride building. Ed Freer of the Alexander Companies presented a detailed overview of existing development in the block as adjacent block faces, in conjunction with plans for the block's redevelopment. Erik Paulson spoke in support of the project, along with Ald. Konkel who described the neighborhood process that led to her support as well as that of the neighborhood. Although in support Konkel noted concerns with the future SIP for the 4-story structure relevant to how it will integrate with the Rinder Grocery building's (Pinkus McBride's) architecture. She noted general support and comfort for the buildings height and mass by adjoining area residents. Following the presentation the Commission noted the following:

- Like plan overall, especially the maintenance of the Pinkus McBride building.
- The top level should tie in better to the underlying three stories and be more integrated.
- Question the setback at the fourth floor level's purpose with strong encouragement for a true 4-story building.
- A setback at the fourth floor level maintain it should be to provide usable open space for fourth story residents.
- Geometry of the access ramp to lower level parking, the street is important and how it works, provide more details.
- More greenspace above parking level, seems wasted. Other members disagree and feel that the greenspace is an opportunity space.

- Look at how terrace trees are incorporated along the Hamilton Street frontage, as well as other street frontages to create a good fit between the proposed building and adjacent street right-of-ways.
- Concern with corner treatment at both the corners of East Johnson at North Hancock Street, and North Hamilton at North Hancock Street; weak need to relate better to the streetscape, especially lake-facing corner including providing details on stoops/stairs and how they meet the street.
- Lake corner could be a “flat iron” type treatment. Also reexamine the corner treatment at Hamilton Street/Johnson Street.
- Problem with the use of cement masonry units working as the main material of the building at the street; need something of finer texture, a scale/grade issue.
- Consider steps or stoops from the garden plaza area to the street to allow for more use by residents, in addition to moving underground bike parking closer to the entry to the ramp area.

ACTION:

Since this was an **INFORMATIONAL PRESENTATION**, no formal action was taken by the Commission.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project is 5.

**URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 301-321 North Hamilton Street, 318-324 East Johnson Street,
308-310 North Hancock Street**

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	5	5	-	-	-	-	7	5

General Comments:

- Good concept, in the right place.