



Project Name & Address: 1233 Jenifer Street
Application Type(s): Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alteration in a historic district.
Legistar File ID # [53289](#)
Prepared By: William Fruhling, Acting Preservation Planner, Planning Division
Date Prepared: October 10, 2018

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Ted Hill – Hill Apartments
Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for front porch repairs

Background Information

Parcel Location/Information: The site is located at 1233 Jenifer Street in the Third Lake Ridge Local Historic District.

Relevant State Statute Section:

Wisc SS 62.23(7)(em)2m. In the repair or replacement of a property that is designated as a historic landmark or included within a historic district or neighborhood conservation district under this paragraph, a city shall allow an owner to use materials that are similar in design, color, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities.

Relevant Landmarks Ordinance Sections:

- 41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS.** A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.
- (1) New construction or exterior alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
 - (a) In the case of exterior alteration to a designated landmark, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (b) In the case of exterior alteration or construction of a structure on a landmark site, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (c) In the case of exterior alteration or construction on any property located in a historic district, the proposed exterior alteration or construction meets the adopted standards and guidelines for that district.
 - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City’s historic resources.

41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.

- (9) Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.
- a) Any exterior alterations on parcels zoned residential use that are located within 200 feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways:
 - (i) Height
 - (ii) Landscape treatment
 - (iii) Rhythm of mass and spaces
 - b) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical proportion and rhythm of solids to voids.
 - c) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical materials.
 - d) Alterations of the roof of any existing structure shall retain its existing historical appearance.
 - e) Alterations of the street facade(s) shall retain the original or existing historical proportional relationships of door sizes to window sizes.

Analysis and Conclusion

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to make alterations to the front porch. The exact scope of the project is unclear from the submittal materials, but at a minimum it will include the removal of the original railings and balusters and replacing them with a new system. This work was done without a Certificate of Appropriateness. Although a building permit was approved for this work, that does not negate the need for a Certificate of Appropriateness.

The drawings submitted for this request are not consistent with the work that has been done to date (i.e., the boxed out elements at the top and bottom of the posts were not built but are shown in the drawings). The drawings also do not provide enough detail, such as the dimensions of the railings and balusters, and do not accurately reflect the current or proposed condition (i.e., the foundation plan indicates a screen porch on the first floor).

A discussion of the relevant ordinance section of Chapter 41.23 follows:

41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.

- (9) Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.
- c) Although the exact scope of the project (specifically whether the upper porch is included) is somewhat vague, the work done to date that replaced the posts and railing of the first floor porch did not retain the original or existing historical materials. It seems clear from the photos that the design and dimensions of the recently removed posts were not original. However, it seems that the railings and balusters may have been original. Regardless, the work done to date does not include appropriate trim details at the top and bottoms of the posts, the railings are not hefty enough, and the size and spacing of the balusters are not compatible with historic porch railing design.

Recommendation

Staff does not believe that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed alteration are met and recommends that the Landmarks Commission refer this request to a future meeting, with the applicant providing additional information on the following items:

- 1) The specific scope of the project.
- 2) How the work done to date will be replaced or altered to meet the criterion cited above and include all post and railing details. This could largely be achieved by reinstalling the railings and balusters that were removed.