

AGENDA # 3

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	PRESENTED: October 15, 2008
TITLE: 718 South Orchard Street – Additions to a Three-Unit on a Lot With a Coach House, Amended PUD(GDP-SIP). 13 th Ald. Dist. (12027)	REFERRED: REREFERRED: REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	ADOPTED: POF:
DATED: October 15, 2008	ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Lou Host-Jablonski, Chair; Bruce Woods, Jay Ferm, John Harrington, Ron Luskin, Marsha Rummel, Dawn Weber, Richard Slayton and Richard Wagner.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of October 15, 2008, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL** of an Amended PUD(GDP-SIP) located at 718 South Orchard Street. Appearing on behalf of the project were Todd Kiley, Duane Steinhauer and Greg Karn, with Lenny Kanter speaking in opposition. Todd Kiley, the applicant and Greg Karn, architect presented details on the revised site/building plans in response to the Commission's previous informational review (September 24, 2008) and Planning Division comments which emphasized downsizing of both the garage and parkside additions, including elimination of pavement encroachment into the adjacent park with additional elimination of impervious area onsite for landscaping adjacent to an adjoining lot line. Kanter spoke in opposition noting his general support but also declaring issue with the potential obstruction of park and lake view effects by both additions. Following a review of plan details, in combination with photographs of Kanter and Kiley's properties combined with aerial photographs, the Commission generally felt that any potential impacts were not obvious.

ACTION:

On a motion by Luskin, seconded by Weber, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL**. The motion was passed on a vote of (9-0).

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 5, 6, 6, 6, 6, 6, 7 and 7.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 718 South Orchard Street

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	7
	6	-	-	-	-	-	-	6
	5	6	6	-	-	-	-	6
	6	6	-	-	-	-	-	6
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	6
	-	7	-	-	-	-	-	7
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	6
	5	5	-	-	-	-	5	5

General Comments:

- Reasonable additions, and a good way to sensitively add a bit of density, appropriately.
- Nice use of native plant material.
- Nice attention to maintaining character of house.
- Well designed, attractive addition.

Stouder, Heather

From: Diana or Wes [busybees2@juno.com]
Sent: Sunday, October 19, 2008 9:14 PM
To: Stouder, Heather
Subject: RE: 718 S Orchard St

Heather

no, we will not be speaking in opposition, we are supportive of the changes, just reviewed the detail plans that a neighbor had printed out, looks the City had made some changes to the original drawings that were given to us, requiring larger setbacks. We reviewed the latest changes with the neighbor adjacent this house and he's said he will change his position to favorable after attending the review meeting a few nights ago. I feel too that the latest revisions look quite acceptable for all issues of concern, nice to see that there is a process and everyone has had a chance for input and have concerns addressed, thanks for your help.

Wes Slaymaker- 706 S. Orchard ST

-- "Stouder, Heather" <HStouder@cityofmadison.com> wrote:
Thank you, Diana and Wes, for your comments.

I will be sure to include these in the packet of materials the Plan Commission receives for review prior to the meeting on Monday, 10/20. Please note that due to a scheduling conflict, this particular meeting will be held in Room 260 of the Madison Municipal Building (215 MLK Jr. Blvd), rather than in the City Council Chambers as usual.

The public hearing portion of the meeting begins at 6:00 pm, and we anticipate that 718 S. Orchard Street will be among the first items discussed in that portion of the meeting. Do you plan to attend and speak in opposition to the project at this time? Please let me know, and I will be happy to answer any further questions you may have about procedural and other issues. Thank you again for your comments.

Sincerely,

Heather Stouder, AICP
Planner, Planning Division
P: 608-266-5974
F: 608-267-8739

-----Original Message-----

From: Diana or Wes [mailto:busybees2@juno.com]
Sent: Tuesday, October 14, 2008 9:14 PM
To: Stouder, Heather
Cc: todd@schultzelectricinc.com

Subject: 718 S Orchard St

Dear Heather,

We live at 706 S Orchard St, two houses north of the proposed Kiley addition at 718 S Orchard St.

We would like to show our support of the Kiley's making improvements and planning an addition, but we also have some concerns.

The whole neighborhood has a steep slope to the lake, we hope that there is a plan for proper rain and storm drainage. We hope that this is seriously addressed with proper measures so that on the south edge of their property, the rain doesn't flow and erode the slope toward the zoo parking lot.

Although the new structure would only slightly obscure our seasonal view of the lake, we have heard from neighbors that their view of the lake and adjacent park area would be obscured. We hope that an adjustment can be created so the views will be acceptable and the project can be continued with minimal modifications.

We are happy to have more owner occupied residents nearby and glad to see improvements in our neighborhood.

Thank you for taking our comments.

Sincerely,
Diana Cohen and Wes Slaymaker
706 S Orchard St
Madison, WI 53715

10/20/2008