

AGENDA # 4

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	PRESENTED: April 6, 2011
TITLE: 1907-1911 Monroe Street – PUD(GDP-SIP) for a 4-Story Commercial/Residential Apartment Building. 13 th Ald. Dist. (21200)	REFERRED: REREFERRED: REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: William A. Fruhling, Acting Secretary	ADOPTED: POF:
DATED: April 6, 2011	ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Marsha Rummel, Mark Smith, Dawn O’Kroley, Todd Barnett, Richard Slayton, John Harrington, R. Richard Wagner, Melissa Huggins, Jay Handy and Henry Lufler, Jr.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of April 6, 2011, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED INITIAL APPROVAL** of a PUD(GDP-SIP) located at 1907-1911 Monroe Street. Appearing on behalf of the project was J. Randy Bruce, representing Knothe & Bruce Architects, LLC. Bruce gave an overview of the project, showing how he responded to the Commission’s request for a somewhat more contemporary design. He presented a palette of materials. He stated that they hope to install a green roof, but they are getting prices now.

The Commission’s discussion focused on the following:

- Look at making the paver stepping stones on the northeast side of the building an actual surfaced walkway, but something other than plain concrete.
- The building materials and composition for the back portion (rear elevation and back portion of the side elevations) needs to be revisited. The discussion focused on the desire to incorporate some more of the building’s material and architecture in these areas as opposed to the more plain, residential design that includes lap siding. There was some discussion about perhaps incorporating a vertical break so the difference in materials makes more sense. The use of the “wood” composite panels or darker panels used on the front portions of the building was also discussed for the rear portion.
- There was some discussion about the use of corrugated metal on the penthouse and if that made it look too much like an addition, or whether it was appropriate because of the generous setbacks that it will only be visible from longer distances.

ACTION:

On a motion by Harrington, seconded by Slayton, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED INITIAL APPROVAL**. The motion was passed on a unanimous vote of (10-0). The motion requested that the architect consider the comments noted above before returning for final approval.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 6.5, 7, 7, 8, 8, 8 and 10.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 1907-1911 Monroe Street

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	6	6.5	-	-	-	-	7	6.5
	6	7	-	-	-	6	7	7
	7	7	5	-	-	6	8	7
	6	8	6	-	-	6	8	8
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	8
	10	10	8	-	-	-	10	10
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	8

General Comments:

- Nice project.
- Nice street front!
- Alleyway elevation could be Trespa and fiber cement panels vs. clapboards.
- Really great project but would like to see stronger/more integral skin on back side.