

## Bailey, Heather

---

**From:** Bailey, Heather  
**Sent:** Tuesday, January 6, 2026 9:09 AM  
**To:** 'Will G.'  
**Subject:** RE: 1123 Jenifer Street

Will,

There isn't an exemption. We are looking at the historic materials found on the feature that you're wanting to make an alteration on. You're dealing with a main roof on a house. Your comparables will be for the historic materials found on the main roof of other historic houses. If you were replacing the roof on a bay window, oriel window, or tower, then you would look at what historically was on that feature on your historic building, or in the case of new construction you would use the styles of roofs found on those features on similar historic buildings. Your argument that you want to use the style of roof found on small architectural features for the main roof on your house when historically that style of roofing material was not found on historic houses in the district and was only found on those smaller architectural features doesn't work. You also wouldn't put a conical roof on a house, but we see them on towers. Just as we wouldn't put the materials from a tower on the main roof of a house, we wouldn't have a conical roof on a house just because there are conical roofs on towers.

The question that we work with is what was historically on your roof and if we don't know that, then what type of roofing would have been on historic resources in the district. We know the answers to that question in this situation. But it's not the product that you've set your heart on, and I understand that's hard to let go of. There are metal roofing products that give the appearance of the historic materials found on your house and on other historic houses in the district. If you want a metal roof, then we can approve one that replicates the appearance of historic roofing materials. Standing seam metal roofs were not found on the roofs of historic houses in the district and there was never one on your house's roof.



**Heather L. Bailey, Ph.D.** (*she/her*)  
Preservation Planner  
Neighborhood Planning, Preservation + Design Section  
  
-----  
Department of Planning + Community + Economic Development  
Planning Division  
215 Martin Luther King, Jr. Blvd.; Suite 017  
PO Box 2985  
Madison WI 53701-2985  
Email: [hbailey@cityofmadison.com](mailto:hbailey@cityofmadison.com) Phone: 608.266.6552

---

**From:** Will G. <will.g@gmail.com>  
**Sent:** Monday, January 5, 2026 4:55 PM  
**To:** Bailey, Heather <HBailey@cityofmadison.com>  
**Subject:** Re: 1123 Jenifer Street

I don't see a material exemption for accessory roofs in the guidelines. Is that one of the unwritten rules that large apartment complexes get to follow?

On Mon, Jan 5, 2026, 4:12 PM Bailey, Heather <[HBailey@cityofmadison.com](mailto:HBailey@cityofmadison.com)> wrote:

Will,

You can find information on the appeal process here:

[MGO 41.20 Appeal to Common Council](#)

(1) The applicant, the alder of the district in which the subject property is located, or the owners of twenty percent (20%) of the number of parcels of property within two hundred (200) feet of the subject property may appeal to the Common Council the decision of the Landmarks Commission to approve or deny a Certificate of Approval or variance request.

(2) The appellant(s) shall file a petition of appeal with the City Clerk within fourteen (14) days of the Landmarks Commission's final decision. The petition shall indicate the identity and address of the petitioners and the specific grounds for appeal.

(3) Once a petition is filed, the City Clerk shall forward the petition to the Common Council. The Common Council shall set the appeal for a public hearing.

(4) After a public hearing, the Common Council may, by favorable vote of a majority of its members, reverse or modify the decision of the Landmarks Commission with or without conditions, or refer the matter back to the Commission with or without instructions, if it finds that the Commission's decision is contrary to the applicable standards under Secs. [41.18](#), [41.19](#), or any district-specific standards contained in Subchapter G.

In short, the Common Council must find that the Landmarks Commission incorrectly applied the standards of approval.

In terms of roofing, the building you just sent a picture of has a flat roof. And per the standards, any roofing material is allowed on a flat roof. If you're talking about the roofing on the oriel windows (the green projections), there is plenty of precedent for that type of roofing on bay windows, oriel windows, and on conical towers. Those are distinct architectural features and not a comparable for the main roof on a building. Do you still want me to include that building in your submittal materials?



**Heather L. Bailey, Ph.D.** (she/her)

Preservation Planner

Neighborhood Planning, Preservation + Design Section

---

Department of Planning + Community + Economic Development

Planning Division

215 Martin Luther King, Jr. Blvd.; Suite 017

PO Box 2985

Madison WI 53701-2985

Email: [hbailey@cityofmadison.com](mailto:hbailey@cityofmadison.com) Phone: 608.266.6552

---

**From:** Will G. <[will.g@gmail.com](mailto:will.g@gmail.com)>

**Sent:** Monday, January 5, 2026 4:03 PM

**To:** Bailey, Heather <[HBailey@cityofmadison.com](mailto:HBailey@cityofmadison.com)>

**Cc:** Madison Landmarks Commission <[landmarkscommission@cityofmadison.com](mailto:landmarkscommission@cityofmadison.com)>; Building Inspection General Mailbox <[BInspection@cityofmadison.com](mailto:BInspection@cityofmadison.com)>; Tony Hanfeld <[tony@isthmusroofing.com](mailto:tony@isthmusroofing.com)>; John Bottensek <[john@isthmusroofing.com](mailto:john@isthmusroofing.com)>; Heiser-Ertel, Lauren <[LHeiser-Ertel@cityofmadison.com](mailto:LHeiser-Ertel@cityofmadison.com)>; Mayer, Davy <[district6@cityofmadison.com](mailto:district6@cityofmadison.com)>

**Subject:** Re: 1123 Jenifer Street

Heather,

Can you provide me any information about the appeals process around decisions the landmarks commission makes? I asked the city, and they said to contact you.

On the subject of my roof, I was walking in my historic district today and saw a nice metal roof. The address is 838 Williamson St. There are better places to view it from the street, but I wanted my photo to include the EST 2025 date.

Anyway, looking forward to the meeting next Monday.

-Will

On Tue, Dec 2, 2025 at 12:16 PM Bailey, Heather <[HBailey@cityofmadison.com](mailto:HBailey@cityofmadison.com)> wrote:

January meeting it is!



**Heather L. Bailey, Ph.D.** (she/her)

Preservation Planner

Neighborhood Planning, Preservation + Design Section

---

Department of Planning + Community + Economic Development

Planning Division

215 Martin Luther King, Jr. Blvd.; Suite 017

PO Box 2985

Madison WI 53701-2985

Email: [hbailey@cityofmadison.com](mailto:hbailey@cityofmadison.com) Phone: 608.266.6552

**From:** Will G. <[will.gg@gmail.com](mailto:will.gg@gmail.com)>

**Sent:** Tuesday, December 2, 2025 11:54 AM

**To:** Bailey, Heather <[HBailey@cityofmadison.com](mailto:HBailey@cityofmadison.com)>

**Cc:** Madison Landmarks Commission <[landmarkscommission@cityofmadison.com](mailto:landmarkscommission@cityofmadison.com)>; Building Inspection General Mailbox <[BInspection@cityofmadison.com](mailto:BInspection@cityofmadison.com)>; Tony Hanfeld <[tony@isthmusroofing.com](mailto:tony@isthmusroofing.com)>; John Bottensek <[john@isthmusroofing.com](mailto:john@isthmusroofing.com)>; Heiser-Ertel, Lauren <[LHeiser-Ertel@cityofmadison.com](mailto:LHeiser-Ertel@cityofmadison.com)>; Mayer, Davy <[district6@cityofmadison.com](mailto:district6@cityofmadison.com)>

**Subject:** Re: 1123 Jenifer Street

I appreciate your desire to resolve this issue, but please follow your published administrative guidelines and include the item on the January agenda. I submitted it when I did because of a work conflict with the December meeting.

Thanks, Will

On Tue, Dec 2, 2025 at 9:44 AM Bailey, Heather <[HBailey@cityofmadison.com](mailto:HBailey@cityofmadison.com)> wrote:

Will,

While we are well past the submittal deadline, we have a short agenda for the December 8 meeting. I'll add this to the agenda. We've been clear about what roofing styles meet the standards and the Landmarks Commission has been consistent in their application of the standards. These are not decisions based upon "feelings" as you stated. These are based upon a historic evidence and long experience working with historic buildings. Staff will not be recommending approval of your application and will continue to recommend meeting the standards of approval. You'll get an email at the end of the week letting you know that the materials for this agenda item have posted and that you can register to attend the virtual meeting. I do recommend that someone from your project team attend the meeting to answer questions from the commission.



**Heather L. Bailey, Ph.D.** (she/her)

Preservation Planner

Neighborhood Planning, Preservation + Design Section

Department of Planning + Community + Economic Development

Planning Division

215 Martin Luther King, Jr. Blvd.; Suite 017

PO Box 2985

Madison WI 53701-2985

*Email: [hbailey@cityofmadison.com](mailto:hbailey@cityofmadison.com)*      *Phone: 608.266.6552*

**From:** Will G. <[will.gg@gmail.com](mailto:will.gg@gmail.com)>

**Sent:** Monday, December 1, 2025 4:25 PM

**To:** Madison Landmarks Commission <[landmarkscommission@cityofmadison.com](mailto:landmarkscommission@cityofmadison.com)>

**Cc:** Building Inspection General Mailbox <[BInspection@cityofmadison.com](mailto:BInspection@cityofmadison.com)>; Tony Hanfeld <[tony@isthmusroofing.com](mailto:tony@isthmusroofing.com)>; John Bottensek <[john@isthmusroofing.com](mailto:john@isthmusroofing.com)>; Bailey, Heather <[HBailey@cityofmadison.com](mailto:HBailey@cityofmadison.com)>

**Subject:** Re: 1123 Jenifer Street

You don't often get email from [will.gg@gmail.com](mailto:will.gg@gmail.com). [Learn why this is important](#)

*"compatible with roofing found on historic resources in the district"*

Let's not add words to the rules. There are metal roofs on historic buildings in my neighborhood therefore, I meet the standards for approval. Please don't make this harder than it already is. I'm not

interested in some disingenuous faux-wood metal shingle. I'm equally uninterested in the approved non-historic petroleum shingles. I want to have my application evaluated using the guidelines disseminated by your organization. Please include my application on the agenda.

Thanks, Will

On Mon, Dec 1, 2025 at 3:24 PM Madison Landmarks Commission <[landmarkscommission@cityofmadison.com](mailto:landmarkscommission@cityofmadison.com)> wrote:

Will,

The examples you provided do not show comparable materials – they show:

- 1123 Jenifer: A standing seam metal roof on a non-historic addition to a commercial building (a church, not a residence)
- 1128 Spaight: A non-historic metal roof that replicates shingles (not a standing seam roof) on a residence.
- 517 S Baldwin: A non-historic standing seam roof on a historic residential building (this would not be approved under the current ordinance, and was either approved under a previous ordinance or not approved at all)
- 1037 Williamson Street: A non-historic standing seam roof on the turret of a non-historic building
- 1012 Williamson: A historic standing seam metal roof on a historic commercial building (not residential)

- 430 S Thornton Ave: There was no photo visible in your attachment, but from google street view I see no standing seam metal roof:



I cannot administratively approve a standing seam metal roof on a residential building in this district as there no comparable examples of historic standing seam metal roofs on historic residences in this neighborhood.

Would you like me to have your item added to a Landmarks Commission agenda? It is in your right to have them discuss your item, but please note it will not have staff support as you have not provided any comparable examples that meet the standards.

If you would like to consider a metal roof that replicates shingles and has a matte finish, we would be happy to review them for compliance. As noted, we do allow metal roofs if they adequately replicate the historic roofing material that would have been in this neighborhood during the period of significance.

Thank you,



**Meri Rose Ekberg** (she, her, hers)

Community & Cultural Resources Planner

City of Madison Department of Planning &

Community & Economic Development

215 Martin Luther King Jr. Blvd., Ste. 017

Madison, Wisconsin 53703

**Email:** [mekberg@cityofmadison.com](mailto:mekberg@cityofmadison.com)

**Sign up for Madison Arts Newsletters for grants & opportunities**

**From:** Will G. <[will.gg@gmail.com](mailto:will.gg@gmail.com)>

**Sent:** Monday, December 1, 2025 12:01 PM

**To:** Madison Landmarks Commission <[landmarkscommission@cityofmadison.com](mailto:landmarkscommission@cityofmadison.com)>

**Cc:** Building Inspection General Mailbox <[BInspection@cityofmadison.com](mailto:BInspection@cityofmadison.com)>; Tony Hanfeld

<[tony@isthmusroofing.com](mailto:tony@isthmusroofing.com)>; Ekberg, Meri Rose <[MEKberg@cityofmadison.com](mailto:MEKberg@cityofmadison.com)>; John Bottensek

<[john@isthmusroofing.com](mailto:john@isthmusroofing.com)>

**Subject:** Re: 1123 Jenifer Street

You don't often get email from [will.gg@gmail.com](mailto:will.gg@gmail.com). [Learn why this is important](#)

**Caution:** This email was sent from an external source. Avoid unknown links and attachments.

Landmarks Commission-

I'm resubmitting my proposal for a metal roof. The proposal is unchanged, except for further examples that support your requirements around replacement materials. *"Replacement materials shall replicate the appearance of historic roofing materials found on the structure or be compatible with roofing found on historic resources in the district."* There are multiple examples in the PDF, one of which is 200 feet from my house.

The previous reason for rejection was "It is not in keeping with the historic character..." This decision was not based on the rules and is instead based on *feelings*. Please reevaluate. I will be attending the meeting and will be happy to answer questions related to my roof project.

Thank, Will Gustafson

On Mon, Aug 11, 2025 at 12:53 PM John Bottensek <[john@isthmusroofing.com](mailto:john@isthmusroofing.com)> wrote:



To Whom It May Concern,

Please reference the attached in regard to the permit application for 1123 Jenifer Street.

Kind regards,

**J.C. Bottensek**

**Project Manager**

**Certified Master Craftsman®**

**Master Craftsman Select Solar®**

**Office: 608-949-0533**

**Cell: 239-238-6733**

**[www.isthmusroofing.com](http://www.isthmusroofing.com)**

