

AGENDA # 3

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION **PRESENTED:** February 7, 2007

TITLE: 2607 Monroe Street – PUD(GDP-SIP) – 45 **REFERRED:**
Residential Units and Commercial Space. **REREFERRED:**
10th Ald. Dist. (05256) **REPORTED BACK:**

AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary **ADOPTED:** **POF:**

DATED: February 7, 2007 **ID NUMBER:**

Members present were: Lou Host-Jablonski, Acting Chair; Lisa Geer, Robert March, Bruce Woods, Cathleen Feland, Ald. Noel Radomski, Todd Barnett and Michael Barrett.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of February 7, 2007, the Urban Design Commission **RECEIVED AN INFORMATIONAL PRESENTATION** on a PUD(GDP-SIP) for 45 residential units and commercial space located at 2607 Monroe Street. Appearing on behalf of the project was J. Randy Bruce. Prior to the presentation, Bruce noted to the Commission that subsequent discussions with the Dudgeon-Monroe Neighborhood Association and area's Alderperson following the Commission's previous review of the project (December 20, 2006), modifications to the project have been provided as follows:

- The demolition of an existing apartment building on the northwesterly corner of the section of Knickerbocker Street and Arbor Drive to allow for the enlargement of the proposed 49-unit apartment building (previously proposed as 45-units) in order to present a more consistent street face.
- Relocation of the underground parking entry to Knickerbocker Street due to problems with its previous location on Arbor Drive in conflict with an adjacent bicycle path.
- Additional landscaping has been added to the proposed residential structure's easterly Arbor Drive façade in order to provide for an enhanced screening between the site and the adjacent park, in addition to a rain garden area.
- The utilization of pervious pavement between the buildings at the plaza, including sidewalks and adjacent woonerf.
- The residential building adjacent to "Papa Phil's" building will be reconstructed with a unified façade consistent with the architecture of other buildings on Monroe Street.
- The façade of the 49-unit residential building has been reduced in height at its Arbor Drive and Knickerbocker Street frontages to four-stories in height with a stepback above the third story with a modified roofline treatment.

Following the presentation, the Commission noted the following:

- Like the updated version and rhythm of the façade on the residential structure.
- Relative to the setback between the 3rd and 4th stories for the residential building abutting Arbor Drive and Knickerbocker Street; the setback detracts from the architecture of the building, would rather see a

true 4-story building without the setback. Bruce noted that the setback provides for rooftop patios for the 4-story units.

- Consider providing over-scaled awnings on the front façade of the “Papa Phil’s” renovated structure.
- Concern with the renovation of the “Papa Phil’s” building; should be concentrating on utilizing durable materials.
- On the residential apartment structure, the fourth level needs to be done well and allow for hard durable materials. The materials should be similar to that utilized on the lower three levels.
- Within the woonerf area look at different paving treatment to enhance its look as pedestrian-friendly and provide less of an emphasis on its use for vehicular circulation.
- Look at making addition to the “Papa Phil’s” building different to maintain the character of Monroe Street.

ACTION:

Since this was an **INFORMATIONAL PRESENTATION**, no formal action was taken by the Commission.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 6 and 7.5.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 2607 Monroe Street

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	6	6	-	-	-	6	6	6
	6	8	-	-	-	6	9	7.5

General Comments:

- Appreciate the integration of permeable paving and infiltration areas within the site landscape. Please continue to work with Parks to add to the shade tree transition into Wingra Park. Building is very attractive and compliments the existing neighborhood.
- The Arbor Drive elevation is well-developed. The Knickerbocker elevation, and the alleyway elevations are in need of more work. The alley should be a woonerf which de-emphasizes cars and gives priority to peds and bikes. Paving treatments, landscaping, etc. can give this space a lived-in feel rather than as a sterile drive aisle. Care should be taken with the 4th story so that it will look good both up close and from an ice shanty on Lake Wingra. Consider keeping the plain-jane façade of Papa Phil’s – diversity in architecture enlivens Monroe Street! Keep the sizable awnings.
- Minimizing building design across the street is not desirable.
- Great start. Keep materials rich and don’t cheapen the penthouse area.
- Improved plan re: massing.
- Good fit for neighborhood.
- Nice improvements and fine responsiveness to the neighborhood. This is well-designed, appropriate infill.