

AGENDA # 1

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	PRESENTED: September 22, 2010
TITLE: Report of the Façade Grant Staff Team – 554 West Main Street and 1221 Williamson Street. (19822)	REFERRED: REREFERRED: REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	ADOPTED: POF:
DATED: September 22, 2010	ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Marsha Rummel, Mark Smith, Dawn O’Kroley, Todd Barnett, Richard Slayton, John Harrington, R. Richard Wagner, Melissa Huggins, Jay Handy.

SUMMARY:

- **554 West Main Street**

At its meeting of September 22, 2010, the Urban Design Commission **REFERRED** consideration of a Façade Improvement Grant located at 554 West Main Street. Appearing on behalf of the project were Craig Wilson and Steve Shulfer and Jenny Dechant of Shulfer Architects, representing Echo Tap. The main proposal is for the south façade which is currently EIFS. The project will renovate the storefront on Bedford and allow more light into the front and mezzanine areas of the building, improve the entryways and fit into the neighborhood context. The existing parapet and some portions of the stone masonry would remain. An expansion with larger storefront windows will bring in more light, and a 2-story addition to the back will provide a more accessible entryway. Shulfer stated that using brick for the entire project in an attempt to match what is happening in the neighborhood is financially unfeasible. They also want to create their own identity in the neighborhood. Comments and questions from the Commission were as follows:

- The turret reads too residential.
- I’m not sure how this architecture fits.
- It looks like the Nitty Gritty.
- The windows on the Bedford Street side don’t seem to be fitting with the architecture; they look a little pedestrian.
- Something about the 5 windows works better for me; works with the round tops above.
- Look for a way to simplify this to blend better with the neighborhood. I commend the owner for investing in this; it’s fabulous.
- The personality of the business isn’t reflected in the architecture. It’s a little bit too fussy for what I think of as the Echo Tavern.
- Why is the door looking like it still faces the parking lot rather than Bedford Street?
- I’m disappointed that this isn’t seen as an opportunity to refocus on the entryway at the corner. This seems very suburban to me.
- The architecture is just a little bit too busy.
- It seems like you have 3 or 4 different messages kind of fighting at the same time.

- I also support the rehabilitation and strengthening the business on the corner; that's wonderful.
- You could treat this as if it were two different buildings from a design concept. It might fit into the neighborhood a little bit better.
- **1221 Williamson Street**

At its meeting of September 22, 2010, the Urban Design Commission **ACCEPTED** the report of the Façade Grant Staff Team for 1221 Williamson Street. Appearing on behalf of the project were Elizabeth Cwik and Wynston Estis, both representing the Willy St. Co-op. Cwik presented details of the plans for renovation to the Jenifer Street façade of the building. The plans call for addressing the façade from one end to the other by removing the metal awnings left over from the Eagles Club and installing new cast stone caps on all the stone piers to accent those features. Accent painting will be done to liven up the building. They will use as many salvaged and recycled materials as possible. They have acquired barn doors that will be hung in the existing alcove, along with LED string lights to give a glow from inside and show a presence in the neighborhood where it is currently dark at night. They envision this back area being used much more once it's cleaned up. They will attach a 6'x6' cedar trellis to the building that will come out about 8-12' with a wrought iron arbor using native grape or bittersweet, as well as something edible to keep with the Co-op's mission. Light fixtures will be mounted on the sides of the piers to avoid glare into the neighborhood. An automated system will be installed to control the lighting. Galvanized steel canopies will be installed over the doors for rain cover. The neighborhood has seen these plans at the joint façade/driveway meeting; however, most neighbors were far more interested in the plans for the driveway. Comments and questions from the Commission were as follows:

- You may want to look at a wall washer rather than a light fixture that will glow out the bottom.

ACTION:

On a motion by O'Kroley, seconded by Harrington, the Urban Design Commission **REFERRED** consideration of a façade grant located at **554 West Main Street**. The motion was passed on a vote of (8-0). The motion provided for the following:

- Do something different at the corner to reinforce the entry and relate rear entry to the streetside.
- Look to commercial examples for window patterns and spacing.

On a motion by Harrington, seconded by Slayton, the Urban Design Commission **ACCEPTED** the report of the Façade Grant Staff Team for **1221 Williamson Street**. The motion was passed on a vote of (8-0). The motion required the use of a fixture that has a top shroud without view of the source of light.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 4, 5, 5, 5, 5 and 6 (554 West Main Street) and 6, 6.5, 7, 7, 8 and 8 (1221 Williamson Street).

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 554 West Main Street

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	-	5	-	-	-	-	4	5
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	6
	-	4	-	-	5	-	5	5
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	4
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	5
	-	4	-	-	6	-	5	5

General Comments:

- Just too busy – especially the north façade – why doesn't it face Main Street or the corner of Main and Bedford?
- Please rethink architectural vocabulary, too busy.
- Excellent façade grant project, further study design? Historic precedent. Consider exterior/alcove display of outstanding special event menus.
- Corner entry loses importance architecturally, too busy.
- Too many textures...simplify.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 1221 Williamson Street

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	-	6	-	6	-	-	7	6
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	8
	-	7	-	-	-	-	7	7
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	6.5
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	8
	-	7	-	-	-	-	7	7

General Comments:

- Very nice work! Welcome improvement.
- Nice work.
- Great.
- Excellent refinements.