

## AGENDA # 6

City of Madison, Wisconsin

---

REPORT OF: LANDMARKS COMMISSION

PRESENTED: 6/1/20

TITLE: 1311 Jenifer St - Exterior Alteration in the  
Third Lake Ridge Hist. Dist. -  
Construction of front porch and  
replacement of five windows; 6th  
Ald. Dist.

REFERRED:

REREFERRED:

REPORTED BACK:

AUTHOR: Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner

ADOPTED:

POF:

DATED: 6/5/20

ID NUMBER: 60542

---

Members present were: Anna Andrzejewski, Richard Arnesen, Katie Kaliszewski, Arvina Martin, and David McLean. Excused were: Betty Banks and Maurice Taylor.

### **SUMMARY:**

*Valerie Kozel, registering in support and available to answer questions*

Bailey said that the proposed work involves constructing a new front porch and replacing five first floor windows. She showed the window key and pointed out that two windows are on the street façade, noting that the Third Lake Ridge standards emphasize street façades. She referenced a Sanborn map, which showed that the house originally had a front porch, as did all of the other houses in the vicinity. She discussed the standards, including 41.18(1)(d) which discusses frustrating the public interest and 41.23(9)(c) regarding retaining original or existing historic materials in alterations of the street façade, with which she noted this project is in conflict. She pointed out that reintroducing the porch will go back to the house's original rhythm. She said that staff recommends approval of the porch as proposed and recommends rehabilitation of the five historic windows rather than replacement. From the submitted materials, she said that the windows appear to be repairable. However, if the commission determines that replacement is appropriate, the proposed replacement windows would replicate the existing and are appropriate. She said that the applicant's submission argues that replacement is more economical than repair.

Kozel said that she is looking forward to moving ahead with the porch. She said that she would love to rehab the windows and had a contractor, Gabriel Achten, look at the windows and she received an estimate of \$600-1000 per window for repair. She said that the windows are old and have pulleys and ropes missing. She said that it is an expensive process to rehab and is beyond her financial means. She said that the proposed replacements are consistent with the replacement windows upstairs in the house and are 50-60% of the cost for repair. McLean said that \$600-1000 is not unreasonable and is actually fairly cheap to repair windows of this size. He said that for rehabilitation, it sounds like a deal relative to the cost of new windows. He asked what replacement windows were being proposed. Bailey said they are simple one-over-one Marvin wood inserts and will replicate the existing windows exactly. McLean asked if the upstairs windows on the front of the house had already been replaced. Kozel confirmed that the two front and two back upstairs windows are Marvin replacements. She said that she is not proposing to replace the exterior trim, just the inserts, which are estimated to cost \$450-550 per insert. McLean said that the front windows upstairs appear to have a thin vertical muntin bar in the upper and lower lites, and asked if the first floor windows would have the same vertical muntin in each lite. Kozel said that remains to be determined, but she would go ahead with them,

though she didn't think the front two windows were original. Bailey said that we don't know if they are original, but they certainly look historic and have been there a long time.

Kaliszewski said that per the standards, the porch is fine. She said that they typically ask for more information when considering replacement of windows, and asked if commissioners felt they had enough information. Arnesen said he is on the fence about the windows because the sash inserts are nice and don't destroy the exterior trim, though the existing windows don't seem to be in particularly bad shape. He said that in other circumstances, the commission has certainly asked people to come back in order to demonstrate the irreparability of windows. He said that these windows might not be in that bad of shape, which could be reflected in the inexpensive price to fix them. Andrzejewski asked Bailey to speak to inserts versus a whole window replacement. Bailey said that typically window replacements include the whole window frame and sashes. In this case, it is just the glass and sashes, so the window frame itself would remain. Andrzejewski asked about other recent window replacement projects in this historic district for context, and Bailey said they have been holding with the standard to see if windows are deteriorated beyond repair or if repair is economically unreasonable. She said that for these windows, they appear to be repairable and are not in such a deteriorated condition that the amount of intervention required would be economically unreasonable. She reiterated McLean's statement that the price quoted for repair is reasonable for window repair in Madison. Arnesen said that with the numbers presented, if you take the high end of the Marvin sashes and the low end of repair estimates, they are within \$50 of each other, per window. He said that he doesn't think that meets the financial hardship criteria.

**ACTION:**

**A motion was made by Arnesen, seconded by Martin, to approve the request for the Certificate of Appropriateness for constructing a new front porch. The motion passed by voice vote/other.**

**A motion was made by Arnesen, seconded by McLean, to refer the request for the Certificate of Appropriateness for the replacement of five windows to a future meeting to allow the applicant to submit additional documentation of window conditions. The motion passed by voice vote/other.**