



Project Name & Address: 1314 Jenifer Street

Application Type(s): Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations in the Third Lake Ridge historic district.

Legistar File ID # 56712

Prepared By: Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner, Planning Division

Date Prepared: July 22, 2019

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Vaughn Brandt

Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness to build a covered rear porch entry.

Background Information

Parcel Location/Information: The site is located in the Third Lake Ridge Local Historic District.

Relevant State Statute Section:

Wisc SS 62.23(7)(em)2m. In the repair or replacement of a property that is designated as a historic landmark or included within a historic district or neighborhood conservation district under this paragraph, a city shall allow an owner to use materials that are similar in design, color, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities.

Relevant Landmarks Ordinance Sections:

- 41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS.** A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.
- (1) New Construction or Exterior Alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
 - (a) In the case of exterior alteration to a designated landmark, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (b) In the case of exterior alteration or construction of a structure on a landmark site, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (c) In the case of exterior alteration or construction on any property located in a historic district, the proposed exterior alteration or construction meets the adopted standards and guidelines for that district.
 - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City’s historic resources.

41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.

- (9) Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.
- a) Any exterior alterations on parcels zoned residential use that are located within 200 feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways:
 - (i) Height
 - (ii) Landscape treatment
 - (iii) Rhythm of mass and spaces
 - b) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical proportion and rhythm of solids to voids.
 - c) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical materials.
 - d) Alterations of the roof of any existing structure shall retain its existing historical appearance.
 - e) Alterations of the street facade(s) shall retain the original or existing historical proportional relationships of door sizes to window sizes.

Analysis and Conclusion

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to retroactively approve a design for the first-floor rear porch area. At its August 6, 2018, meeting, the Landmarks Commission approved a design for an already constructed enclosure of the rear porch with some conditions to make that enclosure be more in keeping with the architectural style of the house and be more in keeping with the applicable standards for exterior alterations. Upon inspection of the completed work, Building Inspection found that the applicant had modified the first-floor porch area with a different design. The Preservation Planner advised the applicant that he could either complete the work as he had been approved to do or to ask the Landmarks Commission if they would approve his latest design.

The previous conditions of approval were: "If it remains, the rear addition should have appropriate materials used for its components. The rake board should be wood or composite or wrapped with aluminum. The walls should be lap siding that terminates at an apron board to transition to the foundation material."

Staff still believes that these conditions are the most appropriate. The partially enclosed porch entry has a window that is off-center, partially covers the eastern support beam and leaves a gap between the window and the lap-sided wall to the west. The partially enclosed porch entry is clad in green aluminum and should be clad in lap siding with an apron board to transition to the foundation material. The lap boards should be flush with the house, not projecting at a variety of angles across the length of the first-floor porch area.

The brackets that project northward and are used to store long ladders do not have precedent elsewhere on the house. At the last Landmarks Commission meeting where the commission reviewed ongoing work at this property (May 20, 2019), the Certificate of Appropriateness was to clad the brackets (which are perpendicular to the now proposed projecting beams) to have them match the appearance of the decorative roof brackets. To now approve these projecting beams for them to be used as outdoor storage seems contradictory in its intent.

Finally, staff is concerned about introducing new solar lights on the third floor balcony where they will project light out to neighboring properties throughout the night. This style of deck lighting is not in character with the house or the period.

A discussion of the relevant ordinance sections follows:

41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS. A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.

- (1) New Construction or Exterior Alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
 - (a) N/A
 - (b) N/A
 - (c) Proposal must meet the Third Lake Ridge Historic District standards, which primarily focus on the street façade of a historic resource.
 - (d) This standard stresses that alterations made to structures in historic districts should be carefully evaluated to ensure retention of historic significance and character in the district. Protecting the historic resources means using appropriate materials for the components. The suggested materials and configurations are out of character with this house and with the district.

41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.

- (9) Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.
 - a) Any exterior alterations on parcels zoned residential use that are located within 200 feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways:
 - (i) No changes are proposed to the height.
 - (ii) No changes are proposed to the landscape.
 - (iii) The rhythm of mass and spaces is off center for the proposed design. The window for the porch entry should either be removed entirely or centered into the opening with framing and/or appropriate siding installed on the sides.
 - b) No changes are proposed to the street façade.
 - c) No changes are proposed to the street façade.
 - d) No changes are proposed to the street façade.
 - e) No changes are proposed to the street façade.

Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness could be met and staff recommends that the Landmarks Commission approve the proposal with the following conditions:

1. Deny installation of the solar lights on the third floor deck
2. Siding for any enclosed sections of the porch should be lapsiding that terminates at an apron board to transition to the foundation material
3. Apron board must be flush with the wall plane and may be wrapped with aluminum
4. Eastern picture window on rear porch should be removed or centered on bay for the enclosed porch entry with siding or trim details to be approved by staff.