

AGENDA # 1a

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	PRESENTED: February 16, 2011
TITLE: 3910 Mineral Point Road –Street Graphics Variance for Sign Replacement and Wayfinding Improvements. 11 th Ald. Dist. (21261)	REFERRED: REREFERRED: REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	ADOPTED: POF:
DATED: February 16, 2011	ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Marsha Rummel, Mark Smith, Dawn O’Kroley, Richard Slayton, John Harrington, R. Richard Wagner, Melissa Huggins and Henry Lufler, Jr.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of February 16, 2011, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL** of a Comprehensive Design Review/Street Graphics Variance for sign replacement and wayfinding located at 3901 Mineral Point Road. Appearing on behalf of the project was Deb Harvey. Appearing in opposition to the project was Steve Holtzman. Matt Tucker, Zoning Administrator appeared to answer any questions. Prior to the presentation staff noted a review of the signage package details of the submittal. Matt Tucker, Zoning Administrator found that consideration did not require review under the standards for “Comprehensive Design Review” and could be addressed under the standards for sign variances. Harvey presented details of the proposed monument sign at Mineral Point Road, noting the need for a more visible sign for the east-west traffic. The goal is to create a more visible sign to last the test of time as well as incorporate some of the design elements/materials of the church. The church wants enough visibility to prevent accidents at this somewhat dangerous intersection. The new design would be a 12” thick Tennessee limestone slab, 8’ 8” by 3’ 6”, to pick up the stone on the façade of the church. The sign will be incorporated between new pedestrian walkways from the street, moving it to the center of the site and be quad lit with an average of 40 footcandle. The request for the variance is to allow a just under 30 square foot sign at 10-foot setback from the lot line, and to surround it with a low level evergreen garden. Changes to a wayfinding sign would include opaque acrylic panels with the “stop” sign at the exit from the parking lot onto Larkin Street featuring a “flag” sign attached to the post.

Holtzman spoke to his concern to the proliferation of commercial signs in residential neighborhoods. This church in particular freely displays banners that are in excess of what is allowed, even after they were told not to by the City. He noted their sloppiness and lack of sensitivity to being in a residential district.

Comments and questions from the Commission were as follows:

- Is this a normal amount of light for a sign like this?
 - We worked with an electrical engineer and the footcandle levels came from the Zoning Division. Staff noted that the lighting levels would have to meet code requirements.

ACTION:

On a motion by Slayton, seconded by O’Kroley, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL**. The motion was passed on a vote of (7-0). The motion provided for the following:

- The lights shall go off at 10:00 p.m., unless there is a church event, as well as code compliancy for lighting.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 6.5, 7, 7, 7 and 8.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 3910 Mineral Point Road

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	-	-	-	-	7	-	-	7
	-	-	-	-	6.5	-	-	6.5
	-	-	-	-	7	-	-	7
	-	-	-	-	7	-	7	7
	-	-	-	-	8	-	-	8

General Comments:

- Well integrated site/signage/architecture. Comprehensive submittal excellent.