



Department of Transportation

Thomas Lynch, PE, PTOE, PTP, AICP, Director of Transportation
Building

Madison Municipal

215 Martin Luther King Jr Blvd
Suite 109
P.O. Box 2986
Madison, Wisconsin 53701-2986
Phone: (608) 266-4761
Fax: (608) 267-1158

September 29, 2021

Re: Proposed Changes to Draft TDM Measures

From: Philip Gritzmacher, AICP

The Department of Transportation is currently finalizing a draft of the Transportation Demand Management (TDM) plan that contains a number of refinements from the May 2021 draft. The primary goals of the new draft are to respond to stakeholder feedback, ensure that the plan is achievable and equitable for all that may take part in the program, and ensure that measures are given adequate credit for their difficulty, effectiveness, and cost.

The primary refinements being made include:

Significant Measure Modifications

- Removal of base points for simplicity
- Reorganization of measures for clarity
- Removal of measures that have minimal impact or may be unclear
- Removal of redundant measures
- Separation of measures that contain multiple options for simplicity
- Increase in points for measures that are complex to implement or potentially expensive
- Reduction in points for measures that are simple to implement or inexpensive
- Replacement of "location efficiency" with transit proximity points and location modifiers for simplicity and to move away from proprietary algorithms (e.g. "walkscore")
- Significant increasing the points for priced parking measures to incentivize utilization
- Addition of telework and flexible work schedules measures to respond to post-pandemic norms
- Removal of the ability to pay for points, since this may be viewed to be an impact fee and could lead to buying-out of program

Transit Proximity Points

- Projects located within BRT service area receive 5 base points
- Projects located within all-day transit service area receive 3 base points
- Projects located within transit service area receive 1 base point

Location Modifiers:

To address expressed concerns that there are fewer opportunities for mitigation points in outlying areas, and a desire to not discourage catalyzing development, four TDM zones are proposed.

- Projects located in the downtown or campus area must achieve 100% of total calculated TDM point requirements
- Projects located within mixed use areas outside of the downtown/campus areas must achieve 90% of total calculated TDM point requirements (isthmus, near east side, near west side)
- Projects located in the lower density areas outside of the downtown area (east side, west side, south side) must achieve 80% of total calculated TDM point requirements
- Project located outside of the beltline or interstate must achieve 65% of total calculated TDM score. (far east side, far west side, south side)
- Projects located outside transit, bike share, or carshare service areas only receive 50% points for proposing utilization of these measures to meet TDM requirements, since the development likely would have lower usage of these measures

Overall Program Modifications:

- Residential projects with less than 25 dwelling units and modest parking provision (less than 100% of requirements) are exempt from TDM program
- Employment uses of less than 25,000 sq. ft. and modest parking provision (less than 100% of requirements) are exempt from TDM program
- Planned multi-use sites (including the malls) would have TDM requirements based on redevelopment area – not entire site.

With these modifications, there has yet to be a consensus on how to implement TDM in new detached single family developments. These developments are major drivers of VMT and congestion within the area; however, application of the TDM program is problematic, since programmatic measures are likely impossible to implement and many other infrastructure measures are impractical or entirely not applicable. Ideas for how to resolve include:

- Requiring TDM measures at time of planning (bike paths, off-site pedestrian connections, transit facilities, etc.)
- Implementing transportation impact fees per dwelling unit, as many other communities in the area do.

Implementing a traffic impact fee may be the best approach, since this provides the City with flexibility to mitigate traffic issues and incentivize active transportation and transit in the future. While the MSO allows for fee collection for transportation purposes, the geography in which collected monies could be used and impact fee amount would need to be further researched and defined, if pursued.

PROPOSED TDM MEASURES - DRAFT FOR COMMENT

Significant Change?	New Category	Measure Type	New Measure Name	Previous Measure Name	New Points	Previous Points	New Considerations & Description	Eligible Use Categories				Justification
								Residential	Employment	Commercial	Institutional	
	Active Transportation Strategies	Infrastructure	Dedicated Access to Bike Parking	Enhanced access to bike parking (Bike Parking Option 1)	1	1	Provide a convenient and separate access to the bike parking area without stairs (e.g. on the same level as the entrance, or via a ramp or elevator).	Y	Y	Y	Y	No change
	Active Transportation Strategies	Infrastructure	Indoor covered bike parking near Entrance	Indoor Covered Bike Parking Near Entrance (Bike Parking Option 2)	1	1	Locate the bike parking in a covered, indoor space, less than 100 feet from the main entrance.	Y	Y	Y	Y	No change
✓	Active Transportation Strategies	Infrastructure	Improve Surrounding Bicycle Infrastructure	Off-site bike infrastructure	1-4	2-8	Improve bicycle infrastructure (bicycle lanes, cycle tracks, new crossings, bike-ped paths, etc.) within 500 ft. of project consistent with city plans, ordinances, and federal requirements. One point per amenity or one point per 100 ft. of infrastructure, up to 4 points.	Y	Y	Y	Y	Reduced points because off-site bicycle infrastructure is extremely difficult to implement on land not controlled by the developer. Did not want over emphasize a measure with limited applications.
✓	Active Transportation Strategies	Infrastructure	Bicycle Lockers or Secure Storage Room	Bike user facilities (Option 1)	2	1	Provide lockers for secure, long-term storage of bikes: 1 locker for every 20 DUs or 30 employees.	Y	Y	Y	Y	Increased points to acknowledge the upfront costs and coordination needed to implement.
	Active Transportation Strategies	Infrastructure	Bicycle Maintenance Facilities	Bike user facilities (Option 2)	1	1	Provide a bicycle maintenance station for on-site employees, tenants, residents and visitors. Tools and supplies should include at minimum: a bicycle pump, wrenches, a chain tool, lubricants, tire levers, hex keys/ Allen wrenches, torx keys, screwdrivers, and spoke wrenches.	Y	Y	Y	Y	No change
	Active Transportation Strategies	Infrastructure	Clothes Lockers and Showers	Bike user facilities (Option 3)	1	1	Provide 1 shower along with 5 clothes lockers for every 30-50 bike parking spaces.	Y	Y	Y	Y	No change
	Active Transportation Strategies	Programmatic	Shared Fleet of Bicycles	Shared fleet of bikes	2	2	Provide an on-site shared fleet of free loner bicycles for use by residents/ employees. Fleet should include at least 1 bicycle for every 10 DUs or 30 employees, with a minimum of 5 bikes.	Y	Y	N	Y	No change
✓	Active Transportation Strategies	Infrastructure	Improve Surrounding Pedestrian Infrastructure	Off-site pedestrian infrastructure	1-4	2-8	Improve pedestrian infrastructure (side walks, curb ramps, crosswalk, RRFB, etc.) on adjacent properties within 500 ft. of project consistent with city plans and ordinances and federal accessibility requirements. 1 point per 100ft of infrastructure, up to 4 total points.	Y	Y	Y	Y	Reduced to discourage utilization of this measure which will likely be difficult to implement. Would also need to fit within approved ordinances and accessibility guidelines, requiring additional staff review.
	Active Transportation Strategies	Infrastructure	Traffic Calming Measures	Traffic calming	2	2	Install traffic calming measures such as speed humps and roundabouts. One point per small-dollar measure (e.g. pedestrian flags, temporary speed hump) and two points per large-dollar measure (e.g. RRFB, permanent speed hump). Must be located within 500 ft. of project and be consistent with city plans, ordinances, and federal requirements. One point per amenity or one point per 100ft of infrastructure, up to 4 points.	Y	Y	Y	Y	No change
✓	Shared Mobility Strategies	Infrastructure	Install a bike share station	Bike share (Option 1)	6	4	Coordinate with the operator of the existing bike share network to pay for and install a bike share station within ¼ mile of the project.	Y	Y	Y	Y	Increased points to acknowledge the upfront costs and coordination needed to implement.
✓	Shared Mobility Strategies	Programmatic	Provide complimentary bikeshare membership or passes	Bike share (Option 2)	2	2 or 4	Provide complimentary bikeshare membership to each employee or building tenant.	Y	Y	Y	Y	Reduced points to closer align with carshare memberships, which cost the same amount.

✓	Shared Mobility Strategies	Programmatic	Provide a Shuttle bus	Provide shuttle bus/vanpools	3	3-5	Provide a complementary shuttle services for employees or resident. 3 points for shuttles circulating within one-mile radius of the site or providing service to major transit hubs or facilitating a complete trip. (Not applicable for residential uses)	N	Y	Y	Y	Simplified measure, removing specificity. It is assumed that the shuttle would reduce VMT by consolidating parking and/or picking up at transit services.
✓	Shared Mobility Strategies	Programmatic	Provide Vanpool		3		After ensuring that such a service is not duplicative of existing vanpool offerings (state Vanpool), establish and maintain a vanpool program for residents or employees. (Not applicable for residential uses)	N	Y	Y	Y	Removed from "Provide Shuttle Bus/Vanpools" to add emphasis to the need to exhaust existing options before establishing a new vanpool. Will reduce VMT by ensuring all existing vanpools are well-utilized.
✓	Shared Mobility Strategies	Programmatic	Shared Fleet of Vehicles	Car share (Option 1)	1	4	Provide cars for shared use by employees or residents.	Y	Y	Y	Y	Reduced, since this may not have significant VMT reduction benefits, depending on how it is implemented.
✓	Shared Mobility Strategies	Programmatic	Provide car share parking space	Car share (Option 2)	1	2	Contract with car-share provider (such as Zipcar) to place vehicles on site for use by car-share provider's customers.	Y	Y	Y	Y	Reduced, since this is relatively inexpensive - potentially no cost - and potentially low impact.
✓	Shared Mobility Strategies	Programmatic	Subsidized car-sharing memberships	Car share (option 3)	2	1-2	Offer subsidized car-share memberships - covering the cost of membership, at a minimum) to every resident or employee for using car-share. Car-share vehicles must be located on-site or within a quarter-mile walking distance.	Y	Y	Y	Y	
✓	Shared Mobility Strategies	Programmatic	Emergency Ride Home program	Guaranteed ride home program	2	1	Work with the Greater Madison MPO to establish an Emergency Guaranteed Ride Home account. Promote the program to all employees or residents that do not drive to work.	N	Y	Y	Y	
✓	Transit Strategies	Programmatic	Subsidize Monthly Transit Passes OR daily passes	Provide transit passes (Option 1)	1-3	2-8	Provide subsidized monthly transit passes to employees/residents (one per DU or employee). 1 point per 25% subsidy, up to 75%.	Y	Y	Y	Y	This was divided into two categories - subsidize and complementary. Complimentary offers 7 points and in combination with the transit modifiers, potentially provides more points than the previous draft.
✓	Transit Strategies	Programmatic	Complementary Transit Passes	Provide transit passes (Overall?)	7		Provide complementary monthly transit passes to employees/residents (one per DU or employee).	N	Y	Y	Y	
✓	Transit Strategies	Infrastructure	Fund transit facilities and amenities	Contribute to bus facilities	1-4	1-8	Build or fund transit facilities and existing or proposed stops including benches, trash receptacles, shelters, and real-time arrival screens. Up to 1 point per feature, up to a maximum of 4 points. Metro Transit must accept proposal prior to points being awarded.	Y	Y	Y	Y	Reduced to discourage reliance on measure. Could lead to investment in inappropriate infrastructure in periphery. If high-value measures are desired, could occur in "innovative measures."
	Transit Strategies	Programmatic	Validate Transit Passes or provided free two-ride passes	Transit measures for patrons/visitors/students (Option 1)	2	2	Validate Transit Passes or provided two-ride passes for all residents, employees, or visitors	N	N	Y	N	Consolidated with two-ride pass measure
	Transit Strategies	Programmatic	Sell Madison Metro passes	Transit measures for patrons/visitors/students (option 3)	2	2	Sell Madison Metro transit passes to visitors, patrons or students. All potential beneficiaries should be clearly informed about the availability of transit passes through appropriate signs or communication channels. Must verify eligibility with Metro Transit.	N	N	Y	Y	No change
	Information Strategies	Programmatic	Marketing & informational campaign	Marketing and informational campaign (Option 1)	1	1	Provide informational material/brochures on TDM and various sustainable transportation options as part of a welcome packet/orientation packet. Organize at least one tailored promotional campaign annually.	Y	Y	Y	Y	No change
	Information Strategies	Infrastructure	Active Transportation Wayfinding, Maps, and Signage	Multimodal wayfinding signs	1	1	Provide all-weather signs, maps, and wayfinding signage that indicate the direction of nearby alternative commute routes, bicycle and pedestrian paths, and nearby major destinations and amenities.	Y	Y	Y	Y	No change

✓	Information Strategies	Programmatic	Alternative Transportation Kiosk	Real-time bus/shuttle/vanpool arrival screen	2	1	Install and operate a kiosk providing alternative transportation information. The kiosk could include bike route system maps, information about TDM programs, and include a screen displaying real-time travel information for buses in the nearby vicinity.	Y	Y	Y	Y	No change
	Land Use Strategies	Infrastructure	Provide Affordable Housing at 30% of AMI	Affordable housing	10	1-10	Provide affordable housing. 1 point is awarded for every 10 percent of units that are offered at or below 30 percent of AMI. Maximum of 10 points. Only applicable to residential developments.	Y	N	N	N	Separated from 60% AMA for simplicity
	Land Use Strategies	Infrastructure	Provide Affordable Housing at 60% of AMI	Affordable housing	5	1-5	Provide affordable housing. One point is awarded for every 20 percent of units that are offered at or below 60 percent of Annual Median Income (AMI). Maximum of 5 Points. Only applicable to residential developments.	Y	N	N	N	Separated from 30% AMA for simplicity
✓	Land Use Strategies	Infrastructure	Add to Land Use Mix	Add land use mix (Option 1)	1-5	2-4	Provide two or more land uses onsite, allowing users to drive less. One point per additional use outside of the primary use. Maximum of 5 points.	Y	Y	N	Y	Simplified measure, increased value for projects with more uses.
✓	Land Use Strategies	Programmatic	On-site Childcare Facility	Daycare facility (option 2)	4	2	Establish an on-site daycare facility, to be used by residents or employees. Points are additive to land-use mix points awarded under LU-3.	Y	Y	N	Y	Increased due to difficulty and potential impact. Could enable parents to utilize alternative transportation for part of or entire trip.
	Land Use Strategies	Programmatic	Provide Other Specific Trip-reducing Service	Other trip-reducing services	1	1	Provide any other trip-reducing service for building users, such as on-site food service for employees, pet-care service, laundry, playroom, dog walking/park, or a business center/co-working space.	Y	Y	N	Y	No change, other than adding co-working space.
✓	Land Use Strategies	Infrastructure	Proximity to Public Transportation	Bus service	1, 3, or 5	3	Locate development within close proximity to existing or planned public transit service. 1 point for locating within the transit service area, 3 points for locating within the all-day service area, 5 points for locating within the planned BRT service area. (see map)	Y	Y	Y	Y	Utilized measure as partial replacement to location efficiency. Rewards development within transit services.
✓	Parking Strategies	Programmatic	Parking cash-out	Priced parking (option 1)	10	5	Offer all employees the choice to forgo free parking for an in-lieu cash payment equal to the market rate cost of parking. Cannot be used in combination with unbundle parking or parking fees. Not applicable for Residential Developments.	N	Y	Y	Y	Priced parking is one of the most impactful measures for ensuring that residents/employees make decisions about driving based on cost. Also difficult for developers due to project financing.
✓	Parking Strategies	Programmatic	Unbundle Parking	Priced Parking (option 3)	10	5	Lease or sell parking separately from residential units or office spaces. Must be optional. Cannot be used in combination with parking fees or cash out.	Y	Y	Y	Y	Same as cash out.
✓	Parking Strategies	Programmatic	Market-rate Parking Fees	Priced Parking (Option 5)	10	5	Drivers must pay the full market value for parking. Properties offering validation not eligible for this strategy. Cannot be used in combination with cash out or unbundling.	Y	Y	Y	Y	Same as cash out.
✓	Parking Strategies	Programmatic	Shared parking agreement	Shared parking or off-site parking agreement	4	2	Keep parking capacity below the applicable parking minimum by sharing parking or off-site parking arrangement with a nearby land use, or allow users at another land use to park on-site such that that facility has parking capacity below applicable parking minimums. May utilize Parking Utility ramps.	Y	Y	Y	Y	This is a long-term agreement that could increase density and thus walkability. Likely requires layers and a long-term agreement. Could have high-impact due to appearance of less parking.
✓	Parking Strategies	Programmatic	Carpool preferential or free parking	Carpool preferential/free parking	1	2	Provide free or preferentially sited parking for carpool vehicles for employees, shoppers, students, or others as applicable.	N	Y	Y	Y	Reduced, due to low-cost, low-benefit.
	Delivery Strategies	Programmatic	Delivery Supportive Amenities	Delivery measures (Option 1)	1	1	Provide a secure area for receipt and temporary storage of deliveries by USPS, UPS, FedEx, and Amazon	Y	Y	Y	Y	Added clarification.
✓	Delivery Strategies	Programmatic	Package Drop-Off Area	Delivery measures (Option 2)	2	1	Provide an area to drop off packages for acceptance by USPS, UPS, FedEx, and Amazon	Y	Y	Y	Y	Increased due to coordination potential cost considerations.

	Delivery Strategies	Programmatic	Provide VMT-Reducing Delivery Services	Delivery Measures (Option 3)	1	1	Provide delivery services that reduce VMT from single-stop motorized deliveries. Qualifying services include deliveries by bicycle, on foot, or in a delivery vehicle that makes multiple stops.	N	Y	Y	Y	No change.
	Other Strategies	Programmatic	Join a Transportation Management Association	Join a Transportation Management Association (TMA)	3	1	Form or join a Transportation Management Association (TMA) to facilitate TDM activities such as marketing, outreach, and distribution services. Such TMA must be accredited by Transportation Engineering and must provide services that meet or exceed requirements for those for relevant measures claimed by the building under this program	Y	Y	Y	Y	Increased points to acknowledge difficult and encourage establishment of a TMA
✓	Other Strategies	Infrastructure	Other Innovative measures	Innovative measures	1 to unlimited	1-4	Provide measures not listed here. Points are awarded at the discretion of city staff.	Y	Y	Y	Y	Reduced cap. Very expensive innovative measures will now fit into category.
✓	Employer Policy Strategies	Programmatic	Flexible Work Schedules		1		Provide at least 25% of employees the opportunity to beginning AND end work shifts outside of peak traveling hours. Not applicable to residential developments.	N	Y	Y	Y	Does not reduce VMT, but could reduce congestion and improve bikeability/walkability during peak periods.
✓	Employer Policy Strategies	Programmatic	Teleworking / Work From Home		1		Provide at least 25% of employees the opportunity to work from home. Not applicable to residential developments.	N	Y	Y	Y	Yet undetermined if this will encourage VMT (short day-trips more frequently or moving further away) or will reduce trips by reducing need to drive. Will revisit in the future once more data is available.

*Transit, Bikeshare, and carshare measures worth 50% if located outside of 1/4 mile service area

*Projects would receive 1 points for locating within transit service area, 3 points for locating within all-day transit service area, and 5 points for locating within BRT corridor.

*Downtown / Campus required to earn 100% of available points, general urban / mixed use - 90%, suburban - 80%, periphery - 65%