



**Project Name/Address:** 901 Jenifer Street  
**Application Type:** Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alteration in historic district  
**Legistar File ID #** [54282](#)  
**Prepared By:** William Fruhling, Principal Planner, Planning Division  
Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner, Planning Division  
**Date Prepared:** January 9, 2019

## Summary

**Project Applicant/Contact:** Jerome Van Epps  
**Requested Action:** The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for a new roof on a residence in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District.

## Background Information

**Parcel Location:** The subject site is located in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District.

### Relevant State Statute Section:

**Wisc SS 62.23(7)(em)2m.** In the repair or replacement of a property that is designated as a historic landmark or included within a historic district or neighborhood conservation district under this paragraph, a city shall allow an owner to use materials that are similar in design, color, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities.

### Relevant Landmarks Ordinance Section:

- 41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS.** A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.
- (1) New construction or exterior alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
    - (a) In the case of exterior alteration to a designated landmark, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
    - (b) In the case of exterior alteration or construction of a structure on a landmark site, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
    - (c) In the case of exterior alteration or construction on any property located in a historic district, the proposed exterior alteration or construction meets the adopted standards and guidelines for that district.
    - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City's historic resources.

**41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.**

- (9) Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.
- a) Any exterior alterations on parcels zoned residential use that are located within 200 feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways:
    - (i) Height
    - (ii) Landscape treatment
    - (iii) Rhythm of mass and spaces
  - b) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical proportion and rhythm of solids to voids.
  - c) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical materials.
  - d) Alterations of the roof of any existing structure shall retain its existing historical appearance.
  - e) Alterations of the street facade(s) shall retain the original or existing historical proportional relationships of door sizes to window sizes.

**Analysis and Conclusion**

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to install a new roof. The applicant is proposing to use the Terrabella brand roofing material. Terrabella is a stamped steel product that is coated with stone so that its appearance is more similar to asphalt shingles than other metal roofing products. Although the Landmarks Commission has approved other types of metal roofs in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District, this is a newer material that has not been proposed in any of Madison’s local historic districts. The application includes materials from the manufacturer and the applicant has provided a product sample that will be shared at the Landmarks Commission meeting.

A brief discussion of the standards of 41.23(9) follows:

**41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.**

- (9) Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.
- a) N/A
  - b) N/A
  - c) N/A
  - d) As stated in the application, the original roofing material would likely have been wood shingles. Over the decades, the most common roof replacement material has been asphalt shingles, and this house currently has 40 year old asphalt shingles, per the application. The proposed replacement material comes in panels that are the equivalent of two “shingle” courses. The bottom edge of each “row of shingles” has a thickness of a little more than ½-inch. There is a minimal change in profile between “shingles” resulting in a relatively flat horizontal plane. Based on the sample submitted, staff has some concern that this will result in a striped appearance without the articulation between the “shingles”. However, this does not appear to be the case in the photographs from the manufacturer.
  - e) N/A

## **Recommendation**

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness for a new roof may be met and recommends that the Landmarks Commission approve the Certificate of Appropriateness.