

EVALUATION PANEL REPORT

Project: Mineral Point Road Reconstruction (USH12 to S High Point Rd)
Location(s): Citywide
Aldermanic District(s): District 9 (Ald. Conklin)
RFP: Contract 8734
Date: 10/06/2023

This Evaluation has been reviewed and approved by a Principal Architect 2, Principal Engineer 2, Deputy City Engineer, Deputy Division Manager, or the City Engineer. Yes No

A. Project Details

1. Background Information

This contract is for the preliminary design, environmental reporting, final design, plans, specifications and estimates for the reconstruction of Mineral Point Road from USH 12 to S High Point Rd.

B. Purchasing Details

1. Guidelines for RFP Evaluation

The City of Madison solicited proposals from qualified vendors through a Request for Proposal (RFP) process. The RFP and associated materials were posted on the City Engineering website and on two distribution networks, VendorNet and DemandStar, on July 7, 2023. RFP responses were due back on August 4, 2023.

Proposals were reviewed by a selection panel.

Qualification factors were weighted as shown.

Company Capability 10%

Project Team 25%

Similar Projects by Project Engineer 30%

Design Approach 30%

Local Preference 5%

Total 100%

2. RFP Respondents

SEH

Mead & Hunt

3. Disqualifications

No firms were disqualified.

4. Evaluation Panel

The technical evaluation panel was composed of 5 City Staff from the Engineering and Traffic Engineering Divisions. Costs were obtained in the proposal. It was stated in the RFP that the City will choose the proposal which best combines the necessary qualifications with the value for expenditure of public funds.

5. Evaluation Structure and Scoring

Evaluation for this RFP was conducted in one round. The technical evaluation panelists each performed their evaluation independently and the results were averaged. The final recommendation was based on the highest average of those scores.

Section C2 shows the proposal scoring.

October 10, 2023

6. Evaluation Timeline

July 7, 2023	– RFP issued
July 21, 2023	– Questions from Consultants due
July 28, 2023	– Answers to Consultant questions posted
Aug 3, 2023	– Proposals due
August 2023	– Panel evaluation
Oct 18, 2023	– Board of Public Works approval
Nov 7, 2023	– Common Council approval

C. Summary of Evaluation Panel Findings

1. Recommendation

Mead & Hunt

Based on the combination of the technical evaluation and proposed costs, the panel recommends that Mead & Hunt be approved as the consultant for the Mineral Point Road Reconstruction.

2. Evaluation and Scoring

The combined scoring of the panel can be found in the chart below.

	<u>SEH</u>	<u>Mead & Hunt</u>
Company Capability (10%)	9	9.4
Project Team (25%)	22.8	24
Similar Projects by Engineer (30%)	27.4	27.4
Design Approach (30%)	25.8	26.2
Local Vendor (5%)	0	0
Total	85	87

Notes:

1. Proposal review is the primary basis for evaluating the respondents (based on response to the RFP guidelines)

3. Fee Breakdown

The table below shows the fee break down for each firm. The consultants were allowed to submit pricing for all items or individual items within Schedule A or Schedule B. Costs were determined by comparing the 11 most used items in Schedule A and B for the previous 5 years. For partial submittals, costs were determined by comparing the 6 most used items for the previous 5 years.

	<u>SEH</u>	<u>Mead & Hunt</u>
Base Costs	\$475,200	\$376,400
If Authorized Items	\$24,000	\$44,300
Total	\$499,200	\$420,700

4. Local Preference

The City of Madison has adopted a local preference purchasing policy granting a scoring preference to local suppliers. Only suppliers who meet the criteria and are registered as of the bid's due date will receive preference.

www.cityofmadison.com/business/localPurchasing

Was the outcome of this bid changed by the local purchasing ordinance?

Yes

No

5. **Additional Proposal Discussion**

Overall, reviewers felt Mead & Hunt had a thorough and comprehensive project approach, solid project team, and very relevant experience. They were the lowest cost and have staff with a proven record of meeting the City of Madison's needs in a timely and cost-effective manner.