

AGENDA # 5

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	PRESENTED: December 21, 2005
TITLE: 8102 Watts Road – PUD-GDP, Two Hotel Developments	REFERRED:
	REREFERRED:
	REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	ADOPTED: POF:
DATED: December 21, 2005	ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Paul Wagner, Ald. Noel Radomski, Todd Barnett, Bruce Woods, Lisa Geer, Michael Barrett and Lou Host-Jablonski.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of December 21, 2005, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED INITIAL APPROVAL** of “option 2” site plan only of a PUD-GDP located at 8102 Watts Road. Appearing on behalf of the project were Gary Brink, Barry Perkel, David Glusick and Ald. Paul Skidmore. Perkel provided a Powerpoint presentation to the Commission consisting of site context and its physical characteristics. A review of the existing planning framework effecting development of the site was provided based on an amendment to the City’s Land Use Plan in September of 2001; cited consistency with its Community-Commercial designation for hotel and/or office development, emphasizing the 40-foot grade change across the development site, at an average slope of 6.5%, in addition to noting designated and restricted access points as required with the previous platting of the property. Perkel also noted that the topographic slope condition already provided for high the development with requests to consider structured parking would result in additional costs that would be difficult to recover under current market conditions. Perkel noted that development of structured parking was not compatible with the lower intensity of use that the two hotel sites would provide. The revised site plan as presented provided address for many of the Commission’s previously concerns, as well as the physical limitations on developing the site. The “revised plan solution” featured the following:

- The Homewood Suites building has been reoriented to address its Commerce Drive frontage, as well as the frontage with the shared main east-west private access drive; in combination with the relocation of the detention pond feature.
- The Hampton Inn and Suites building has been moved easterly abutting the existing Princeton Club site with a central parking field (surface parking) provided between the two hotel sites with an integrated landscape and pedestrian access plan.
- The relocated Hampton Inn and Suites building is potentially designed to take advantage of an existing fire access lane along its easterly boundary on the Princeton Club property.
- The overall PUD-GDP to develop these two hotel sites also includes provisions to create a commercial building to hold the corner of Commerce Drive and Watts Road to be two stories in height, as well as the creation of a restaurant pad site. The restaurant’s pad site building is also oriented to relate to its Watts Road frontage.

In conjunction with the presentation, it was noted that the applicant was requesting initial approval of the site plan only at this time, with specific details as to the bulk and mass of the design of the two hotel building sites to be provided with further consideration of the project by the Commission.

Following the presentation, the Commission expressed concerns on the following:

- Prefer the most recent scheme, relationship between buildings preferred and location of buildings/footprints adjusted to be now apartment-like where structured parking is not precluded if economics allow.
- Like new plans versus old. The two hotels not a pedestrian-friendly use.
- Like revised site plan where circulation is clarified, potential for shared parking provided as well as street orientation and play between entries.
- Like massing as well as advantage of providing smaller ponds, and emphasis and orientation to all streets including Beltline.
- Create a parking field by introducing more green area within the adjoining surface parking lots.

ACTION:

On a motion by Barnett, seconded by Ald. Radomski, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED INITIAL APPROVAL** of “option 2” site plan only of a PUD-GDP located at 8102 Watts Road. The motion was passed on a vote of (5-0-1) with Wagner abstaining. The motion provided for the approval of the revised site plan only with the following:

- Need a center node to anchor the corner building and introduce underground parking on the site.
- Strong encouragement for the introduction of vertical tree islands in parking rows with a strong request that the applicant attempt to utilize and share an existing fire lane on the adjoining Princeton Club property.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 4, 5.5, 6, 6, 6 and 7.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 8102 Watts Road

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	6	-	-	-	-	6	6	6
	7	-	-	-	-	6	6	6
	6	5	-	-	-	6	5	5.5
	6	-	6	6	-	6	6	6
	7	-	7	-	-	7	6	7
	4	-	4	-	-	4	3	4

General Comments:

- Much better solution. Strongly recommend shared use of Princeton Club fire lane and expansion of additional green space in parking lots.
- Why not put parking under entire west motel and make center court a landscaped deck? Thanks for the improvements – this is a much better site plan.
- Recommend moving forward with the recent option. Add more interior parking island between the hotels. Encourage strongly using Princeton Club’s fire lane.
- Applaud and appreciate applicant’s “homeowner’s” distinctive building footprints.
- This has no urban attributes whatsoever.