



Project Name/Address: 5 N Spooner Street

Application Type: Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations in historic district

Legistar File ID # [39061](#)

Prepared By: Amy L. Scanlon, Preservation Planner, Planning Division

Date Prepared: June 30, 2015

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Peter Lemberger, Tallard Apartments, LLC

Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations involving the construction of two basement egress windows, and other repairs in the University Heights Historic District

Background Information

Parcel Location: The subject site is located in the University Heights Historic District.

Relevant Landmarks Ordinance Sections:

33.19(12)(d) Criteria for the Review of Additions, Exterior Alterations and Repairs in TR-C2 and TR-C3 and TR-C4 Zoning Districts.

1. Height. N/A
2. Second Exit Platforms and Fire Escapes. Second exit platforms and fire escapes shall be invisible from the street, wherever possible, and shall be of a plain and unobtrusive design in all cases. In instances where an automatic combustion products detection and alarm system is permitted as an alternative to second exits pursuant to Section 28.08(2)(e) of the Madison General Ordinances, use of such a system shall be mandatory.
3. Repairs. Materials used in exterior repairs shall duplicate the original building materials in texture and appearance, unless the Landmarks Commission approves duplication of the existing building materials where the existing building materials differ from the original. Repairs using materials that exactly duplicate the original in composition are encouraged. (Renum. by ORD-08-00122, 11-22-08)
4. Restoration. Projects that will restore the appearance of a building or structure to its original appearance are encouraged and will be approved by the Landmarks Commission if such projects are documented by photographs, architectural or archeological research or other suitable evidence. (Renum. by ORD-08-00122, 11-22-08)
5. Re-Siding. Re-siding with aluminum or vinyl that replaces or covers clapboards or nonoriginal siding on buildings originally sided with clapboards will be approved by the Landmarks Commission provided that the new siding imitates the width of the original clapboard siding to within one (1) inch and provided further that all architectural details including, but not limited to, window trim, wood cornices and ornament either remain uncovered or are duplicated exactly in appearance. Where more than one layer of siding exists on the building, all layers except the first must be removed before new siding is applied. If insulation is applied under the new siding, all trim must be built up so that it projects from the new siding to the same extent it did with the original siding. (Renum. by ORD-08-00122, 11-22-08)

6. Additions Visible from the Street and Alterations to Street Facades. Additions visible from the street, including additions to the top of buildings or structures, and alterations to street facades shall be compatible with the existing building in architectural design, scale, color, texture, proportion of solids to voids and proportion of widths to heights of doors and windows. Materials used in such alterations and additions shall duplicate in texture and appearance, and architectural details used therein shall duplicate in design, the materials and details used in the original construction of the existing building or of other buildings in University Heights of similar materials, age and architectural style, unless the Landmarks Commission approves duplication of the texture and appearance of materials and the design of architectural details used in the existing building where the existing building materials and architectural details differ from the original. Additions and exterior alterations that exactly duplicate the original materials in composition are encouraged. Additions or exterior alterations that destroy significant architectural features are prohibited. Side additions shall not detract from the design composition of the original facade.
7. Additions and Exterior Alterations Not Visible from the Street. Additions and exterior alterations that are not visible from any streets contiguous to the lot lines upon which the building or structure is located will be approved by the Landmarks Commission if their design is compatible with the scale of the existing building and, further, if the materials used are compatible with the existing materials in texture, color and architectural details. Additions and alterations shall harmonize with the architectural design of the building rather than contrast with it. (Renum. by ORD-08-00122, 11-22-08)
8. Roof Shape. N/A
9. Roof Material. N/A

Analysis and Conclusion

A brief discussion of the related sections of 33.19(12)(d) follows:

1. Height. N/A
2. Second Exit Platforms and Fire Escapes. The existing guardrail on the small second story balcony on the North (right) façade is proposed to be replaced with a new railing to match the balcony railing on the front façade.
3. Repairs. N/A
4. Restoration. N/A
5. Re-Siding. The proposal includes the removal of three south side storm doors.
 - The single door would be replaced with wooden siding to match the existing. It is unlikely that the single door is original; therefore, its removal would provide a more historically appropriate appearance.
 - The double doors would be replaced by two double hung vinyl coated 34"x58" windows to match the style and size of the windows on the 1st floor. The remaining opening will be resided and trimmed to match the existing façade. If the Landmarks Commission prefers, the applicant is willing to just reside the area of the double doors in lieu of the new windows. Another option is to install the windows while maintaining the size of the door opening. Beneath the windows, the remainder of the opening could be infilled with a panel.
6. Additions Visible from the Street and Alterations to Street Facades. The removal of the existing materials (historic fabric) and replacement with new materials removes original architectural features of this building, however depending upon which option is pursued, will not diminish the integrity of the historic district, as the changes are to a side façade and only at the basement level. The applicant wishes to replace two basement windows with fire egress windows to make habitable rooms in the basement for their tenants. The applicant has shown three options. In all options, the window wells required for the egress windows will be 42" wide, with approximately 3 inches of foundation exposed on each side of the window. The well will be constructed of decorative concrete blocks textured and colored to match the

existing foundation. Windows will be set back from the exterior wall plane and trimmed out with wood to match the adjacent windows. The window well will be exposed about 2 inches to allow positive drainage away from the window well and adjacent foundation wall. The submission materials provide three options for the locations of the two window wells. Staff prefers option 2 which locates one window well toward the rear on the North side and the other is located on the rear elevation.

7. Additions and Exterior Alterations Not Visible from the Street. See notes above.
8. Roof Shape. N/A
9. Roof Material. N/A

Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed exterior alterations are met and recommends that the Landmarks Commission approve the request with the following conditions of approval:

1. The Applicant shall confirm the placement of the window in the thickness of the wall. The submission materials indicate the window would be set back 8 inches, but the adjacent basement windows appear to be closer to the exterior face.
2. Any new wood shall be painted within 12 months of installation.
3. The Landmarks Commission shall provide the applicant with direction for the treatment of the doors on the east elevation with final review and approval by the Preservation Planner.