

AGENDA # 1

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	PRESENTED: May 9, 2007
TITLE: 702 North Midvale Boulevard – Hilldale Redevelopment – PUD(SIP), Alteration to Previously Approved SIP, Plans for Building “M.” 11 th Ald. Dist. (04090)	REFERRED: REREFERRED: REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	ADOPTED: POF:
DATED: May 9, 2007	ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Paul Wagner, Chair; Lou Host-Jablonski, Todd Barnett, Michael Barrett, Marsha Rummel, Bruce Woods, Robert March and Richard Slayton.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of May 9, 2007, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL** of a PUD(SIP) for the redevelopment of Hilldale Mall. Appearing on behalf of the project were Scott McLamore and Cliff Goodhart. Prior to the presentation staff noted to the Commission that the alteration to the previously approved plans for Building “M” as part of the Hilldale Mall SIP #2 redevelopment involved the substitution of stucco on only those portions on the building as originally proposed in favor of EIFS necessary to accommodate LEEDS certification for the high rise condominium building in order to improve thermal performance. The issue to be resolved was noted as resolving issues with the thermally broken concrete balconies in combination with adding an additional layer of insulation over exterior stud walls. The detriment of the previously approved stucco system required a heavy cement board behind the finish coat, provided attachment issues in regards to the use of cement board over rigid insulation, in combination with the use of support heavy gauge metal channels and shelf angles adding significant cost and diminishing the desired thermal insulation necessary for LEEDS certification. The use of EIFS as a replacement will not require extensive metal framing to support finished layers but only involve 12% of the total building envelop area with the base coat mesh and polymer base finish coat the same as proposed with the stucco product. In order to resolve issues relevant to concerns with the EIFS application in heavy use areas a heavy duty impact resistant mesh will be provided in balcony areas below 4-feet. Following the presentation it was noted that EIFS could be used as good material when not used as a “blanket” application. It was further noted that the applicant should look at a limestone smooth finish with some concerns expressed that the substitution of EIFS for better general insulation may sacrifice some impact resistance. It was further noted the new technology for impact resistance makes it a more acceptable application with limited opportunities.

ACTION:

On a motion by March, seconded by Barrett, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL**. The motion was passed on a unanimous vote of (8-0). The motion required that the finish coat be smooth sandstone.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 6, 6, 7, 7, 7, 7, 8 and 9.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 702 North Midvale Boulevard

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	7
	-	7	-	-	-	-	-	7
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	6
	-	-	-	-	-	-	9	9
	-	6	-	-	-	-	-	6
	-	-	-	-	-	-	7	8
	-	7	-	-	-	-	7	7
	-	-	-	-	-	-	7	7

General Comments:

- EIFS, in this specific case and design, is appropriate. Kudos on LEEDS aspirations.
- Bravo for lead sand finish.
- An improvement. Thanks for bringing it back.
- LEEDS certification is exciting upgrade.
- Nice upgrade!