

AGENDA # 3

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	PRESENTED: March 17, 2010
TITLE: 5802 Odana Road – Comprehensive Design Review/Street Graphics Variance and Minor Façade Renovations in UDD No. 3. 19 th Ald. Dist. (17567)	REFERRED: REREFERRED: REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	ADOPTED: POF:
DATED: March 17, 2010	ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Bruce Woods, Marsha Rummel, John Harrington, Richard Slayton, Dawn O’Kroley, Jay Ferm, Mark Smith, Todd Barnett, Richard Wagner.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of March 17, 2010, the Urban Design Commission **REFERRED** consideration of a Comprehensive Design Review/Street Graphics Variance located at 5802 Odana Road. Appearing on behalf of the project were Jim Triatik, Dave Miller, Jim Emden, representing Badger Display Signs, Inc.; and Chad Kemnitz, representing Russ Darrow. Triatik appeared representing Don Miller. According to the combined consideration for minor exterior remodeling for a project located within Urban Design District No. 3, consideration for Comprehensive Design Review to provide for exceptions to the provisions in the sign ordinance, as well as street graphic variances from the provisions for Urban Design District No. 3. Triatik noted that the combined approvals were necessary to provide for the separate identification of three different automobile dealerships located on a single site combined with façade alterations to accommodate their individual identities. The franchises in question consist of Subaru, Mazda and Chrysler. Triatik presented details for a combination of façade alterations, ground signage and wall signage in association with the development of three franchise dealerships under the single ownership of Don Miller. The Don Miller ownership requires consideration of an additional ground sign not usually accommodated under the provisions of the sign ordinance. Triatik noted that there were no changes proposed with the façade or the signage of the Mazda franchise building on the site. Following a review of the proposal, the Commission noted the following:

- Provide a return of the application of alucabond on the front façade of the Subaru building.
- Concern with size and number of signs at the street exceeding code requirements.
- The Subaru wall sign huge where the Subaru and Don Miller portion of the wall signage cross architectural elements, needs resolution.
- The Chrysler, Jeep, Dodge Ram wall signage is too busy, not spaced in a regular pattern, should wrap around 10-15 feet on each side; if full on one side it should be full on all the others, it needs to be more substantial.
- Could support three pylon signs because there are three separate franchises, but to deal with spacing issues on wall signage.
- Ground signs need to flow together, the Chrysler wall signage is too busy and need to look at spacing and size with all signs are there.

- On the Subaru building, the size of the Subaru and Don Miller wall signs should be the same as Don Miller, both signs need to be consistent.
- The Subaru logo as detailed within photos on Page 7 of the application packet is smaller relevant to vertical column and should be the same as proposed on Page 12.
- The ground signage needs to provide consistency. Subaru should match Chrysler. The Don Miller sign too big for a pedestrian corner, needs to be scaled down to pedestrian scale. Also wanted to see what pylon sign would look like if code compliant (Don Miller ground sign).
- All ground signs need to be consistent in size and height.

ACTION:

On a motion by Barnett, seconded by Rummel, the Urban Design Commission **REFERRED** consideration of this item. The motion was passed on a vote of (8-0). The motion for referral required address of the above stated concerns and the following:

- The three ground signs should be looked at to be consistent in size and height with an alternative provided for the pylon sign (Don Miller) to show size and extent if conforming to all requirements of Urban Design District No. 3.
- The use of alucabond on the Subaru building should wrap around to be on both perpendicular sides fully or at a minimum of 10-15 feet.
- Look at spacing and scale of signs on the Chrysler building as well as that of the Subaru and Don Miller wall signage to be consistent with the above stated comments.
- Provide landscaping around base of all ground signs and fill wall signage as it appears with the curvature and warp of the existing front façade of both buildings.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 4, 5, 5, 5, 5, 5 and 5.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 5802 Odana Road

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	5
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	5
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	5
	-	-	-	-	4	-	-	4
	-	-	-	-	5	-	-	5
	-	6	-	-	5	-	4	5
	-	-	-	-	5	-	-	5

General Comments:

- Concern about detail of alucabond, provisions, fascia signs.
- Address spacing, kind of busy...
- Scale and spacing need review.
- If you want a variance, please state reason your project deserves a variance.
- Appropriate for the use. Bring pylon signs into conformance.