



**Project Name & Address:** 1142 Spaight  
**Application Type(s):** Certificate of Appropriateness for an addition and exterior alterations  
**Legistar File ID #** [79565](#)  
**Prepared By:** Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner, Planning Division  
**Date Prepared:** September 13, 2023

## Summary

**Project Applicant/Contact:** Rick Larson  
**Requested Action:** The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a rear addition to the existing principal structure.

## Background Information

**Parcel Location/Information:** The subject property is located in the Third Lake Ridge historic district.

### Relevant Ordinance Sections:

#### 41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.

- (1) New Construction or Exterior Alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
  - (a) In the case of exterior alteration to a designated landmark, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
  - (b) In the case of exterior alteration or construction of a structure on a landmark site, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
  - (c) In the case of exterior alteration or construction on any property located in a historic district, the proposed exterior alteration or construction meets the adopted standards and guidelines for that district.
  - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City's historic resources.

#### 41.26 STANDARDS FOR ADDITIONS.

- (1) General
  - (a) General
    2. A new addition shall be designed to be subordinate and compatible with the character of the structure.
    3. The addition shall be visually separated from the principal building.

4. The alignment, rhythm, and size of the window and door openings of the new addition shall be similar to those of the historic building.
- (b) Materials and Features
  1. A new addition shall be constructed on a secondary or non-character defining elevation so that historic materials and features are not obscured, damaged or destroyed.
  2. New additions that destroy significant historic materials or character-defining features are prohibited.
- (2) Building Site
  - (a) General
    1. Exterior additions to historic buildings shall be designed to be compatible with the historic character of historic resources within two hundred (200) feet and to maintain the pattern of the district.
- (3) Exterior Walls
  - (a) General
    1. Materials used for exterior walls of the addition shall be similar in design, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities of the historic building, but differentiated enough so that it is not confused as historic or original to the building.
  - (b) Wood
    1. Products that replicate wood shall have a smooth surface without textured faux wood grain.
- (4) Roofs
  - (a) General
    1. The form and pitch of the addition roof shall be similar to and compatible with the existing roof form and pitch.
  - (b) Materials
    1. Visible roof materials shall be similar to the historic roof materials on the structure.
- (5) Windows and Doors
  - (a) General
    1. Openings and the windows or doors in them shall be compatible with the overall design of the historic building.
    2. The new openings shall have similar dimensions, operation, components, and finish as the historic windows or doors of the structure.
  - (c) Entrance Doors and Storm Doors
    1. Doors shall be compatible with the overall design of the building.
    2. New door openings shall have a similar height to width ratio, components, and finish as the historic doors of the structure.
    3. Storm doors shall be full-light or full-view and have a non-reflective coating.
- (6) Entrances, Porches, Balconies and Decks
  - (a) Porch Elements
    1. The style of porch posts, balusters and rails shall be compatible with the overall design of the historic porch but, in most cases, not duplicate the historic features.
    2. Spaces beneath porches and stairs shall be enclosed with a framed lattice of crisscross design, narrow vertical boards, masonry, or other openwork design.
    3. All wood on exterior porches shall be painted or opaquely stained.
- (7) Building Systems
  - (a) Mechanical Systems
    3. Grilles, vents, equipment, and meters shall be placed in a location on an elevation not visible from the developed public right-of-way or on the roof. Grilles, vents,

equipment, and meters on elevations visible from the developed public right-of-way are prohibited, unless technically infeasible. Grilles, vents, equipment, and meters shall be finished or painted to match adjacent materials.

(c) Lighting and Electrical Systems

1. Decorative light fixtures shall be compatible in style and location with the overall design of the building.
2. Security light fixtures or security cameras shall be installed so that they are as unobtrusive as possible.
3. Exterior mounted conduit on elevations visible from the developed public right-of-way is prohibited.
4. Roof appurtenances such as antennas, satellite dishes, or communications equipment should be installed so that they are minimally visible from the developed public right-of-way and do not damage or obscure historic features.

## Analysis and Conclusion

The proposed project is for an addition to the rear of the house, which is a 2-story Folk Victorian constructed in 1891. While the footprint of the building appears to be original per the Sanborn maps, there are obvious alterations that have happened to the rear of the building. The building permit record is not clear as to when these alterations happened, but the result is that the front porch of the historic structure features hipped roofs and the rear wing has a mix of hipped and gabled. The proposed single-story addition would have a gable roof that replicates the style of roof found on the current rear wing of the house.

The narrative proposes LP Smartside cladding to replicate the reveal on the current clapboard siding, and metal clad double-hung windows. The BILCO Door on the rear would be removed with the addition covering over this space. A new rear entry will feature a simple stoop and steps down to grade. There are no details on the materials for the railing and the plans to not show the required screening beneath the porch and stairs. The final specifications for the new exterior door and the windows will also be required, but appear to meet the standards as proposed. Any exterior lighting or any possible new venting/mechanicals will also need a Certificate of Appropriateness prior to securing a building permit.

A discussion of relevant standards follows:

### 41.26 STANDARDS FOR ADDITIONS.

(1) General

(a) General

2. The new addition is designed to be subordinate and compatible with the character of the structure. It is using similar materials and architectural vocabulary but is located on the rear and is shorter than the existing historic building.
3. The addition is visually separated from the historic resource by both the difference in roof plane and that the wall plane is inset from the existing structure.
4. The general alignment of the windows on the addition align with the overall pattern on the historic resource and the location of the entry is in keeping with the character of the structure.

(b) Materials and Features

1. The addition if proposed to be constructed on a secondary elevation so that historic materials and features are not obscured, damaged or destroyed.
2. The rear of the structure has already had several changes over time and the proposal would not destroy any significant historic materials or character-defining features.

- (2) Building Site
  - (a) General
    - 1. The location and height of the addition is in keeping with the evolution of other historic resources in the vicinity and is compatible with the character of the district.
- (3) Exterior Walls
  - (a) General
    - 1. The clapboard siding will replicate the historic appearance of the historic resource, but the new materials and the proportions of the addition will help to differentiate the addition from the historic portions of the building. The application does not provide details about the current reveal and what is proposed. Those details would be helpful for ensuring that this standard is being met.
  - (b) Wood
    - 1. The LP Smartside proposed for the clapboard will need to be the smooth surfaced product, not the product with the false woodgrain texture.
- (4) Roofs
  - (a) General
    - 1. The form and pitch of the addition roof are proposed to be similar to and compatible with the existing roof form and pitch on the rear wing of the existing structure.
  - (b) Materials
    - 1. The roofing is proposed to match the existing shingles on the building.
- (5) Windows and Doors
  - (a) General
    - 1. Openings and the windows or doors in them appear to be compatible with the overall design of the historic building. Final specifications are needed.
    - 2. The new openings appear to have similar dimensions, operation, components, and finish as the historic windows or doors of the structure.
  - (c) Entrance Doors and Storm Doors
    - 1. The new door appears to be compatible with the overall design of the building from the drawings, but final specifications are required to ensure compliance with this standard.
    - 2. The new door opening appears to have a similar height to width ratio. Details on the components and finish would be provided in product specifications.
    - 3. It is unclear if there is proposed to be a storm door or just a single exterior door.
- (6) Entrances, Porches, Balconies and Decks
  - (a) Porch Elements
    - 1. The porch posts and balusters appear to be of a simple design and does not duplicate a historic feature.
    - 2. Spaces beneath porches and stairs shall be enclosed with a framed lattice of crisscross design, narrow vertical boards, masonry, or other openwork design. The current plans show the rear porch as open underneath.
    - 3. All wood on exterior porches shall be painted or opaquely stained. There is no detail on the treatment for the porch.
- (7) Building Systems
  - (a) Mechanical Systems
    - 3. Grilles, vents, equipment, and meters shall be placed in a location on an elevation not visible from the developed public right-of-way or on the roof. Grilles, vents, equipment, and meters shall be finished or painted to match adjacent materials.

There is currently no information in the plans on any potential grilles, vents, equipment, or meters that would be located on the addition.

(c) Lighting and Electrical Systems

1. Decorative light fixtures shall be compatible in style and location with the overall design of the building. It seems likely that there will be exterior lighting for the rear entrance, but there are no details in the plans about what that lighting may look like.
2. Security light fixtures or security cameras shall be installed so that they are as unobtrusive as possible.
3. Exterior mounted conduit on elevations visible from the developed public right-of-way is prohibited.
4. Roof appurtenances such as antennas, satellite dishes, or communications equipment should be installed so that they are minimally visible from the developed public right-of-way and do not damage or obscure historic features.

## Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness could be met and recommends the Landmarks Commission approve the project with the following conditions:

1. Final specifications for railings, porch decking, porch screening, stair materials, windows, doors, and siding be approved by staff.
2. Any new exterior lighting or mechanical/venting on the addition will need to either be submitted as part of this Certificate of Appropriateness or come in separately for an approval prior to being able to secure a building permit.