

## AGENDA # 7

City of Madison, Wisconsin

---

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	<b>PRESENTED:</b> July 9, 2008
TITLE: 119, 123 & 125 North Butler Street and 120 & 124 North Hancock Street - PUD(GDP) and PUD-SIP for a New 38- Unit Apartment Building with the Retention of Two Existing 2-Unit Buildings. 2nd Ald. Dist. (06302)	<b>REFERRED:</b> <b>REREFERRED:</b> <b>REPORTED BACK:</b>
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	<b>ADOPTED:</b> <b>POF:</b>
DATED: July 9, 2008	<b>ID NUMBER:</b>

---

Members present were: Lou Host-Jablonski, Richard Wagner, Bruce Woods, Marsha Rummel, Bonnie Cosgrove, Richard Slayton, John Harrington and Todd Barnett.

### **SUMMARY:**

At its meeting of July 9, 2008, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL** of a PUD(GDP) and PUD-SIP located at 119, 123 and 125 North Butler Street and 120 and 124 North Hancock Street. Appearing on behalf of the project was James McFadden, representing Cliff Fisher. McFadden presented an overview of the finalized buildings elevations, referencing a materials/color palette noting the use of the hardy product with recycled content for siding and asphalt roof shingles. McFadden provided a review of the roof deck design and landscaping in addition to lighting details. He noted that previously proposed access below the front porch from lower level units has now been eliminated. Following the presentation the Commission noted the following:

- Problem with removal of the previously proposed rain garden relevant to where stormwater goes. Need to provide for on-site facilities.
- The previously proposed green roof over the parking garage needs work.
- Need to relook at landscaping beyond the minimal level provided.
- The landscape plan provides for too many evergreens in mass and stacks. Need more deciduous flowering shrubs.
- Provide a rain garden in the north central area as previously proposed.
- Not keen on the crushed granite walkway as proposed.
- Create a shallow pond with a high inlet on the proposed "green roof."
- Need to provide more active programming for the roof space.
- Need to provide a walkable but usable surface for handicapped access on the garage's green roof.
- Place additional trees and landscaping in the blank space at the rear of the new building on the green roof.

**ACTION:**

On a motion by Slayton, seconded by Harrington, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL**. The motion was passed on a vote of (6-2) with Barnett and Rummel voting no. The motion required that further development of the green roof include a pond/rain garden amenities, including additional landscaping and improvements to walkways to return to staff for approval.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 4, 5, 5, 5, 5 and 7.

**URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 119, 123 & 125 North Butler Street and 120 & 124 North Hancock Street**

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
<b>Member Ratings</b>	-	-	5	-	-	-	-	-
	6.5	7	5.5	-	-	-	7.5	7
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	5
	5	5	5	-	-	5	5	5
	-	5	3	5	-	3	5	4
	5	5	4	-	-	5	6	5
	6	6	5	-	-	5	-	5

General Comments:

- Appreciate use of standard brick. Disruption of historic rhythms of block sets precedent. Put in rain gardens. Pathway should be accessible and make open space usable.
- Landscape planning needs work.
- The landscaping does not support site or architecture. Needs stormwater management plan.
- Landscape plan needs work, but plan is otherwise OK.
- Provide trees over structural column (mound earth) in yard. Provide rain garden(s).