

AGENDA # 1

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	PRESENTED: June 28, 2006
TITLE: 454 Gammon Road – Planned Commercial Site, Modifications to Previously Approved Elevations for “Granite City Brewery.” 9 th Ald. Dist. (04009)	REFERRED: REREFERRED: REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	ADOPTED: POF:
DATED: June 28, 2006	ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Lou Host-Jablonski, Acting Chair; Ald. Noel Radomski, Lisa Geer, Bruce Woods, Michael Barrett, Todd Barnett, Robert March.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of June 28, 2006, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL** for modifications to a previously approved elevations for “Granite City Brewery”. Appearing on behalf of the project were Sean Currie of Tri North Builders and Todd Lewis. The plans as presented by Currie provided for the replacement of the application of proposed stucco with EIFS (STO) on upper portions of the previously approved elevations for the “Granite City Brewery.” It was noted by Currie that the colors and textures of the previously approved stucco would be maintained. The rationale for the change was based on a substantial cost savings in labor. Other areas of the previously approved façades will remain with the durable materials as previously approved. Following the presentation, Host-Jablonski noted that any motion should recognize not setting a precedent for the use of EIFS based on the limits of its application on upper portions of the previously approved elevations in substitution for a stucco material. The use of EIFS as a substitute for stucco in this situation appears not to be inconsistent with the Commission’s developing policy relevant to its use at grade or at ground floor level.

ACTION:

On a motion by March, seconded by Barnett, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL**. The motion was passed on a vote of (7-0). The motion noted that the EIFS material was way above grade and ground levels of concern and was not replacing previously approved stone or durable materials and only utilized in portions of the upper elevation of the building in the same proportions as the previously approved application of stucco.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 5, 6, 6, 7 and 7.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 454 Gammon Road

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	5
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	6
	-	5	-	-	-	-	-	-
	-	7	-	-	-	-	7	7
	-	6	-	-	-	-	-	6
	-	7	-	-	-	-	7	7

General Comments:

- Under the context, proposed change of materials is appropriate.
- Change from stucco to EIFS works only because of the type of building and where it is located on building.
- Acceptable change given context, use of EIFS already on proposal.
- Fair substitution for this application.
- Change to EIFS is acceptable in this context because it is well above reach of potential damage.
- EIFS OK on upper reaches of a fairly ephemeral structure.