

AGENDA # 12

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION

PRESENTED: September 7, 2011

TITLE: 2501 West Beltline Highway –
Comprehensive Design Review,
Amendment to Existing Sign Package
for “Arbor Gate.” 14th Ald. Dist.
(23782)

REFERRED:

REREFERRED:

REPORTED BACK:

AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary

ADOPTED:

POF:

DATED: September 7, 2011

ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Richard Wagner, Marsha Rummel, Todd Barnett, Dawn O’Kroley, Henry Lufler, Mark Smith and John Harrington.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of September 7, 2011, the Urban Design Commission **REJECTED** a Comprehensive Design Review located at 2501 West Beltline Highway. Eric Marty presented a sign package for a new restaurant on the east elevation, noting that the lettering is different and the outline is white; color, materials, size and illumination all match the existing “Bonfyre” signs. It was generally noted that the sign as designed had a “tacked on” appearance and didn’t mesh well with the building’s architecture. The Commission and staff discussed the history behind the blade signage type for this building in light of the current proposal and the previously approved “Bonfyre” sign. The new sign’s design features which mimic that of “Bonfyre” was an issue with the reuse of a similar sign design that was previously allowed by not necessarily to be repeated with a new approval due to the existing sign as allowed not meshing well with the building’s architectural elements with the new blade sign noted as being more problematic as not consistent with the ordinance provisions of “Comprehensive Design Review.” Any further consideration of a blade sign on the easterly façade should look to be more compatible with the building’s architecture and not repeat issues and features allowed with the existing blade sign.

ACTION:

On a motion by Harrington, seconded by Rummel, the Urban Design Commission **REJECTED** this item. The motion was passed on a vote of (3-2-1) with Harrington, Rummel and O’Kroley voting in favor; and Lufler and Smith voting no; and Barnett abstaining.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 4 and 5.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 2501 West Beltline Highway

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	-	-	-	-	4	-	-	4
	-	-	-	-	5	-	5	5

General Comments:

- Make it better next time.
- Black cabinet and face please.