



**Project Name & Address:** 23 N Pinckney Street  
**Application Type(s):** Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations  
**Legistar File ID #** [73984](#)  
**Prepared By:** Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner, Planning Division  
**Date Prepared:** November 1, 2022

## Summary

**Project Applicant/Contact:** Drew Jenson, Sign Art Studio  
**Requested Action:** The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness to install new signage on the door and street façade.

## Background Information

**Parcel Location/Information:** The subject property is a Designated Madison Landmark.

### Relevant Ordinance Sections:

#### 41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.

(3) Signs. The Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for signs if it finds that the following are true:

- (a) Signs are located within the façade areas set aside for signs as part of the façade design or are integrated and compatible with the structure where the façade areas have not been set aside for signs;
- (b) New signs shall be consistent with the traditional signage pattern locations on a structure or a property, and shall feature materials and style of illumination typical of the period of significance for the property or district;
- (c) Signs shall comply with Chapter 31, MGO;
- (d) Signs shall comply with specific standards and guidelines adopted for historic districts under this ordinance.

### Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation

1. A property will be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces and spatial relationships.
2. The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.
3. Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or elements from other historic properties, will not be undertaken.

4. Changes to a property that have acquired historic significance in their own right will be retained and preserved.
5. Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.
6. Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.
7. Chemical or physical treatments, if appropriate, will be undertaken using the gentlest means possible. Treatments that cause damage to historic materials will not be used.
8. Archeological resources will be protected and preserved in place. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures will be undertaken.
9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work will be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.
10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

## Analysis and Conclusion

The proposed project is to add signs to the exterior masonry pilaster on the front façade. The submittals also show proposed signage on the entryway glass, consisting of two business logos in white vinyl. The door signage does not require a door permit and the Landmarks Commission does not review this type of signage as it is temporary and easily removable without permanent changes to the structure. The new signage on the façade consists of 2 circular ACM (composite) panels painted satin black with logos in white vinyl. The panels will each measure 1' 5" in diameter. The first-floor business, The Old Fashioned restaurant currently has signage that spans the full length of the signage band. The upstairs tenant is asking for this additional signage affixed to the pilaster adjacent to the entrance to the upstairs commercial space.

The subject property was constructed in 1871 and known as the Ellsworth Block. It was designated a Madison Landmark in 2007 as a rare remaining resource from the early commercial development of the Capitol Square. The Italianate commercial building is one of the more ornate commercial structures remaining on the Square from this time period. The sandstone façade's character-defining features include the rusticated banding on the first story and the ornate window surrounds.

The proposed new signage would be attached to the building at the masonry joints within the rusticated banding of the southernmost pilaster adjacent to the upstairs entry. If affixed with stainless steel fasteners, this should not permanently alter the historic building materials on the structure.

A discussion of the relevant ordinance sections follows:

### **41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS**

A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.

(3) Signs. The Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for signs if it finds that the following are true:

- (a) The first-floor business has occupied all of the signage band area. The proposed signage location will be compatible with a signage area for the façade in this instance.
- (b) Signage on the wall, adjacent to an entrance is common on historic commercial buildings downtown and the historic designation signage is nearby, in the entranceway.
- (c) In order to comply with Chapter 31, MGO, this signage will also need approvals from Zoning and the Urban Design Commission;
- (d) N/A

**Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation**

- 1. No proposed changes in use.
- 2. The installation of the signage in the masonry joints on the pilaster will allow for no permanent alteration to that feature.
- 3. The new signage will not create a false sense of history.
- 4. N/A
- 5. The rusticated banding of the pilaster will be preserved due the method of installation of the signage. Also the new signage will not completely obscure the pilaster.
- 6. N/A
- 7. N/A
- 8. N/A
- 9. By installing the new signage with stainless steel fasteners in the masonry joints, the proposed new signage will not destroy historic materials.
- 10. The proposed method of installation allows for future removal without permanent changes to the historic materials.

**Recommendation**

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness are met and recommends the Landmarks Commission approve the project with the following condition:

- 1. Signage be attached to the building in the masonry joints with stainless steel fasteners.