

PLANNING DIVISION STAFF REPORT

October 6, 2025

PREPARED FOR THE LANDMARKS COMMISSION



Project Name & Address: 1716 Chadbourne (District 5)
Application Type(s): Certificate of Approval for new construction
Legistar File ID # [89888](#)
Prepared By: Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner, Planning Division
Date Prepared: October 1, 2025

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Tracey Powers, Christensen Construction
Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Approval for construction of a new accessory structure

Background Information

Parcel Location/Information: The subject property is located within the University Heights local historic district

Relevant Ordinance Sections:

41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROVAL.

A certificate of approval shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.

- (1) New Construction or Exterior Alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of approval for exterior alteration or construction only if:
 - (a) In the case of exterior alteration to a designated landmark, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (b) In the case of exterior alteration or construction of a structure on a landmark site, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (c) In the case of exterior alteration or construction on any property located in a historic district, the proposed exterior alteration or construction meets the adopted standards and guidelines for that district.
 - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of approval is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City's historic resources.

41.27 STANDARDS FOR NEW STRUCTURES.

- (1) General.
 - (a) Primary Structures. The design for a new structure in a historic district shall be visually compatible with other historic resources within two hundred (200) feet in the following ways:
 1. Building Placement. When determining visual compatibility for building placement, the Landmarks Commission shall consider factors such as lot coverage, setbacks, building orientation, and historic relationships between the building and site.
 2. Street Setback. When determining visual compatibility for street setbacks, the Landmarks Commission shall consider factors such as the average setback of historic resources on the same block face within two hundred (200) feet, and the setback of adjacent structures.

3. Visual Size. When determining visual compatibility for visual size, the Landmarks Commission shall consider factors such as massing, building height in feet and stories, the gross area of the front elevation (i.e., all walls facing the street), street presence, and the dominant proportion of width to height in the façade.
4. Building Form. When determining visual compatibility for building form, the Landmarks Commission shall consider factors such as building type and use, roof shape, symmetry or asymmetry, and its dominant vertical or horizontal expression.
5. Architectural Expression. When determining visual compatibility for architectural expression, the Landmarks Commission shall consider factors such as the building's modulation, articulation, building planes, proportion of building elements, and rhythm of solids to voids created by openings in the façade.
- (b) Accessory Structures.
 1. Comply with requirements for new primary structures with other historic accessory structures serving as comparables.
 2. Minimally visible from the developed public right-of-way, or be minimally visible from the front of the property for corner lots.
 3. Clearly be secondary to the primary structure.
- (3) Exterior Walls.
 - (a) General.
 1. Materials used for new structures shall be similar in design, scale and architectural appearance to materials that date to the period of significance on historic resources within two hundred (200) feet, but differentiated enough so that it is not confused as a historic building.
- (4) Roofs.
 - (a) Form.
 1. Roof form and pitch shall be similar to the form and pitch of the roofs on historic resources within two hundred (200) feet.
 - (b) Materials.
 1. Roof materials shall replicate materials found on historic resources within two hundred (200) feet.
 2. Any roofing material shall be permitted on flat or slightly pitched roofs not visible from the developed public right-of-way.
 - (c) Skylights.
 1. Skylights visible from the developed public right-of-way shall be flat, parallel to the slope of the roof, and have the frame painted to match the roof material, and be located least twelve (12) feet back from the front edge of the roof.
 2. Other forms of skylights are allowed on elevations not visible from the developed public right-of-way.
- (5) Windows and Doors.
 - (a) General.
 1. Door and window styles should both match the style of the new structure and be compatible with those on historic resources within two hundred (200) feet.
 - (b) Windows and Storm Windows.
 1. Multi-light windows shall have true divided lights or simulated divided lights with muntin grids on the exterior and interior with spacer bars between the panes of glass.
 - (f) Garage Doors.
 1. Garage doors shall be similar in design, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities prevalent within the historic district.
- (7) Building Systems.
 - (a) Mechanical Systems.
 1. Mechanical equipment shall be screened if it is visible from the developed public right-of-way.

2. Static vents, electric vents, wind turbines, and attic fans visible from the developed public right-of-way are prohibited.
 3. Grilles, vents, equipment, and meters shall be finished or painted to match adjacent building materials.
- (c) Lighting and Electrical Systems.
1. Decorative light fixtures shall be compatible in style and location with the overall design of the building.
 3. Exterior mounted conduit on elevations visible from the developed public right-of-way is prohibited.

Analysis and Conclusion

The proposed project is to construct an accessory structure in the rear yard of the property at 1716 Chadbourne. The City issued a stop work order on this property for construction of a new accessory structure without a building permit or a Certificate of Approval in February of 2025. Staff has been working with the property owners to get to a design that meets historic district standards and a building placement that meets Zoning and Building Code requirements. The application materials provide information on the historic accessory structures they are using as their reference. The building materials and design utilize an architectural vocabulary that links to historic accessory structures in the historic district and to the historic structure on the property.

The principal structure is a two-story Colonial Revival house, constructed by A.H. Peterson in 1949. The building features clapboard siding and an arched stoop for the front door. The application materials show several single-story accessory structures that have either a flat roof or a low-pitch, front-facing shed roof. While most are utilitarian structures, several of them are more ornamental. The primary reference point they are using is the garage at 2122 Chadbourne. While the house at that property is also a clapboard-clad, side-gabled Colonial Revival building, the garage features shingle siding and decorative corbels at the roof line:



2122 Chadbourne

The proposed accessory structure at 1716 Chadbourne would have a very similar design. The new materials will allow it to read as a product of its time. The unpermitted structure will need to be removed and replaced with the new structure being proposed.

A discussion of relevant standards follows:

41.27 STANDARDS FOR NEW STRUCTURES.

(1) General.

(a) Primary Structures. The design for a new structure in a historic district shall be visually compatible with other historic resources within two hundred (200) feet in the following ways:

1. Building Placement. The proposed accessory structure is proposed to be in the rear corner of the lot, which is typical of historic accessory structures in the district.
2. Street Setback. N/A
3. Visual Size. The low-profile single-story structure is in keeping with the size of historic accessory structures in the district.
4. Building Form. The proposed accessory structure follows a similar form to other historic accessory structures in the immediate vicinity.
5. Architectural Expression. The proposed accessory structure replicates the architectural expression of historic accessory structures in the district, including one on a very similar property.

(b) Accessory Structures.

1. This project appears to comply with the requirements for new primary structures and uses other historic accessory structures as comparables.
2. The new accessory structure would be minimally visible from the developed public right-of-way.
3. The structure would be clearly secondary to the primary structure.

(3) Exterior Walls.

(a) General.

1. The materials proposed for the exterior replicate those used on other historic accessory structures, but the new materials will differentiate it from the old.

(4) Roofs.

(a) Form.

1. The style of roof replicates those found on other historic accessory structures in the vicinity.

(b) Materials.

1. The EPDM roof is typical for such low-pitched roofs.
2. An EPDM roof is allowed for this low-pitched roof.

(c) Skylights.

1. The skylights will not be visible from the developed public right-of-way.
2. These skylights are allowed and will not be visible from pedestrian line-of-sight.

(5) Windows and Doors.

(a) General.

1. The door and window styles both reference the forms found on the historic house on the property and those found on similar accessory structures in the district.

(b) Windows and Storm Windows.

1. The multi-light windows have simulated divided lights with muntin grids on the exterior and interior with spacer bars between the panes of glass.

(f) Garage Doors.

1. The proposed garage-style doors are of a similar in design, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities prevalent within the historic district.

(7) Building Systems.

(a) Mechanical Systems.

1. There is no information on mechanicals, but the mechanical equipment shall be screened if it is visible from the developed public right-of-way.
3. Grilles, vents, equipment, and meters shall be finished or painted to match adjacent building materials.

(c) Lighting and Electrical Systems.

1. The decorative light fixtures are compatible in style and location with the overall design of the building.

Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Approval are met and recommends the Landmarks Commission approve the project with the following conditions:

1. The unpermitted accessory structure be removed and replaced with this approved accessory structure
2. Final specifications for the skylights submitted to staff for administrative approval