

City of Madison, Wisconsin

---

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION

**PRESENTED:** March 20, 2013

**TITLE:** 304 West Washington Avenue –  
Demolition and New Construction in the  
UMX District for an Addition to an  
Existing Office Building. 4<sup>th</sup> Ald. Dist.  
(28617)

**REFERRED:**

**REREFERRED:**

**REPORTED BACK:**

**AUTHOR:** Alan J. Martin, Secretary

**ADOPTED:**

**POF:**

**DATED:** March 20, 2013

**ID NUMBER:**

---

Members present were: Richard Wagner, Chair; Marsha Rummel, John Harrington, Richard Slayton, Cliff Goodhart and Tom DeChant.

**SUMMARY:**

At its meeting of March 20, 2013, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL** of the demolition and new construction in the UMX District for an addition to an existing office building located at 304 West Washington Avenue. Appearing on behalf of the project was Bill Montelbano, the project architect. Registered in support and available to answer questions were Dan Barker, Andrew Seidel, Pamela Keehn and Patrick Elliott. Registered and speaking in opposition was Richard Rathmann. Revisions to the project include shifting the cupola and attaching it to the four-story building; windows have been added to the cupola and third floor addition; flat roofs are shown to be consistent with other parts of the building; keeping the cornice and brackets of the original building, showing something of the history of the building including a combination of brick and stucco building materials in a portion that is consistent with the Downtown Design Guidelines with the stucco used primarily as a trim; the fascia, windows, railing, and fencing are shown in a copper color. The existing stucco will be painted to match the new stucco. Older elements of brick on the building will be painted to match the new brick. Landscaping modifications have been made to planting materials per the comments of the Urban Design Commission. It was noted that the Commission previously stated adding more windows could balance out the use of stucco. Lighting areas would include the service drive behind the building, a porch area and some ground lighting in the landscaped area.

Richard Rathmann spoke in opposition to the demolition and loss of an attractive building, noting the fact that members of the Freedom From Religion Foundation are atheists.

Comments by the Commission were as follows:

- The patina-esque copper color doesn't look like copper, I would recommend looking at another material.
- This is much more successful than what we saw last time.
- Need a lighting plan.

**ACTION:**

On a motion by DeChant, seconded by Slayton, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL**. The motion was passed on a vote of (5-0). The motion required that the lighting plan be submitted for staff review and approval.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 5, 6, 7 and 7.

**URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 304 West Washington Avenue**

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
<b>Member Ratings</b>	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	6
	-	6	6	-	-	-	-	-
	7	6	7	6	-	6	8	7
	6	5	6	-	-	-	5	5
	7	7	7	-	-	-	7	7

General Comments:

- Loss of neat old 3-flat will be missed. Appreciate design improvements.
- Design has improved substantially from first submission.
- Nice rework of cupola, upper stories – awful green.