

## AGENDA # 3

City of Madison, Wisconsin

---

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION

**PRESENTED:** May 5, 2010

**TITLE:** 750 Hilldale Way – PUD(SIP), Target, Modifications to Previously Approved Materials. 11<sup>th</sup> Ald. Dist. (16448)

**REFERRED:**

**REREFERRED:**

**REPORTED BACK:**

**AUTHOR:** Alan J. Martin, Secretary

**ADOPTED:**

**POF:**

**DATED:** May 5, 2010

**ID NUMBER:**

---

Members present were: Bruce Woods, Marsha Rummel, Todd Barnett, Dawn O’Kroley, Richard Slayton, Richard Wagner, John Harrington, Jay Ferm, Ron Luskin and Mark Smith.

### **SUMMARY:**

At its meeting of May 5, 2010, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED INITIAL APPROVAL** of modifications to previously approved materials for Target located at 750 Hilldale Way. Appearing on behalf of the project were Roxanne Nelson, Jaci Bell and Tom Carrico, representing Target; Mike Sturm, representing Ken Saiki Design; and Alderman Chris Schmidt, District 11. Luskin recused himself from consideration of this item. Nelson presented modifications to the building materials consisting of a change for the use of EIFS as a replacement for the previously approved application of cement board on various areas of the building’s upper elevation. She presented a comparison of the two materials as it relates to the overall materials package to utilize for the Target store. She stated there is some concern about what the freeze/thaw weather of the Midwest might do to the cement board panel and issues with the alignment and fastening along with its crispness and watertight quality as it relates to the metal reveal channels, as well as durability of the painted cement board surface to storm damage. By using EIFS they can vary the panel size as well as the location of the joints, which they could not do with the cement board, allowing them some design flexibility with a system that is watertight and airtight. Comments by the Commission were as follows:

- I don’t see insulation as a problem.
- There are beautiful examples of fiber cement boards (not in Madison).
- Panels can be pre-painted in the factory.
- I believe the panels are offered in a 10-foot length.
- If using EIFS it should be a fine finish. You do lose crispness by using foam to make sure to use a crisper joint.
- Using the combination of materials is acceptable.
- Like the hardi-system but not opposed to the EIFS being used in conjunction as described.
- Sand finish on EIFS really cheapens the look.
- The smaller panels give it a more vertical sense, making the building more attractive.
- I hate to have color influence a decision but it loses some quality and detail; problem with beige color and with panel sizes that are larger than 4’ x 8’.

## **ACTION:**

On a motion by Barnett, seconded by Slayton, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED INITIAL APPROVAL**. The motion was passed on a unanimous vote of (8-0). The motion provided approval for EIFS boards that can be up to 12-feet in size to allow them to align with all the architectural elements, in a fine (smooth) finish with an extruder metal grid system ½” to 1” minimum, with the EIFS panel to be screed to it with the color selection to go beyond “beige” all to be approved by staff.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 5, 6, 7 and 7.

**URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 750 Hilldale Way**

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
<b>Member Ratings</b>	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	7
	-	6.5	-	-	-	-	7	7
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	5
	-	6	-	-	-	-	-	6

General Comments:

- Negotiating over EIFS! Material should be crisp looking.
- Good example of applicant-Commission meeting.
- Keep it crisp!