

**Regarding:** 423 North Carroll Street – Mansion Hill Historic District – Installation of replacement windows. 2nd Ald. District  
**Contact:** Jaclyn Skjervem, Steve Brown Apartments  
**Legistar #29257**

**Date:** April 15, 2013  
**Prepared By:** Amy Scanlon, Preservation Planner

**General Information:**

The Applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for window replacement at the property located at 423 North Carroll Street in the Mansion Hill Historic District. The property is also located within the Mansion Hill National Register Historic District. The Landmarks Commission referred this item at the March 11, 2013 meeting. Staff met with the Applicant and toured the property on March 15, 2013. Staff noted that the exterior show sills are deteriorated, but the original wood sash are in fair condition except that the glass has been replaced in all windows.

**Relevant Landmarks Ordinance sections:**

33.19(10)(d) Regulation of Construction, Reconstruction, Exterior Alteration and Demolition.

The Commission shall act in these matters specifically as they regard the Mansion Hill Historic District in the manner specified by Madison General Ordinance, Sections 33.19(5)(b) and (c).

33.19(5)(b) Regulation of Construction, Reconstruction and Exterior Alteration.

1. *[Not applicable for Landmarks Commission review.]*
2. *[Not applicable for Landmarks Commission review.]*
3. *[Not applicable for Landmarks Commission review.]*
4. Upon filing of any application with the Landmarks Commission, the Landmarks Commission shall determine:
  - a. Whether, in the case of a designated landmark or landmark site, the proposed work would detrimentally change, destroy or adversely affect any exterior architectural feature of the improvement upon which said work is to be done; and
  - b. Whether, in the case of the construction of a new improvement upon a landmark site, the exterior of such improvement would adversely affect or not harmonize with the external appearance of other neighboring improvements on such site; and
  - c. Whether, in the case of any property located in an Historic District designated pursuant to the terms of Subsection (6)(d) hereunder, the proposed construction, reconstruction or exterior alteration does not conform to the objectives and design criteria of the historic preservation plan for said district as duly adopted by the Common Council.
5. *[Not applicable for Landmarks Commission review.]*
6. *[Not applicable for Landmarks Commission review.]*

33.19(5)(c) Regulation of Demolition.

*[Not applicable for Landmarks Commission review.]*

**Staff Evaluation and Recommendations:**

In response to 33.19(10)(d) which references 33.19(5)(b) and (c), Staff finds that only 33.19(5)(b)4.c is applicable. Staff believes that the window replacements will be compatible with the overall historic appearance of the property which is in general conformance with the objectives and design criteria of the Landmarks Ordinance. The previous staff report, prepared for the March 11 meeting, stated that staff believed the window replacements would destroy potentially historic fabric by removing the windows and alter the appearance of the building by reducing the amount of visible glass which is not in conformance with the objectives and design criteria of the Landmarks Ordinance.

Staff toured the building with the Applicants on March 15, 2013 and found that the exterior show sills are deteriorated, that the wood sash are original, that the wood sash are in fair condition, and that the glass has been replaced in every window. These findings confirm that the wood sash are original, but the amount of historic fabric has been reduced due to glass replacement.

Staff requested that the Applicant consider repairing the existing windows and install a storm window. Staff also requested that the Applicant propose a replacement window that had a historically appropriate appearance. Unfortunately, it seems a historically appropriate vinyl window with half screen panel is not available on the market.

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the replacement of windows may be met and recommends that the Landmarks Commission approve the Certificate of Appropriateness.