

## AGENDA # 4

City of Madison, Wisconsin

---

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	<b>PRESENTED:</b> December 21, 2005
TITLE: 2313-2525 East Washington Avenue – Union Corners – PUD(GDP), New Construction in Urban Design District No. 5, Mixed-Use Development	<b>REFERRED:</b> <b>REREFERRED:</b> <b>REPORTED BACK:</b>
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	<b>ADOPTED:</b> <span style="float: right;"><b>POF:</b></span>
DATED: December 21, 2005	<b>ID NUMBER:</b>

---

Members present were: Paul Wagner, Ald. Noel Radomski, Todd Barnett, Bruce Woods, Lisa Geer, Michael Barrett and Lou Host-Jablonski.

### **SUMMARY:**

At its meeting of December 21, 2005, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL** for the Union Corners PUD(GDP) located at 2313-2525 East Washington Avenue in Urban Design District No. 5. Appearing on behalf of the project were Todd McGrath, Lance McGrath, Paul Cuta, John Lichtenheld, Ald. Judy Olson and Dan Melton. Megan Schiesman, Peter Wolff and Nick Schroeder appeared and spoke in opposition. Karen FASTER and Brent Sieling appeared neither in support nor opposition. The development team presented revised plans as a follow-up to a recent meeting of the Schenk-Atwood-Starkweather-Yahara Neighborhood Association (SASYNA) and the previous consideration of the project by the Urban Design Commission at its meeting of December 7, 2005. The revised plans and text featured the following:

- An evaluation of mature tree vegetation around the current location of the French Battery building by Bruce Alison with recommendations for preservation.
- A change in plan to relocate the French Battery building along the westerly side of the realigned Winnebago Street extended, combined with the development of a vehicular turn-around at its intersection with Sixth Street, along with the accommodation of a four-story residential with grade level commercial in the formerly proposed location of the French Battery building. These combined changes allow for the preservation of more trees, in addition to the creation of more greenspace around the adjacent round-about. Pedestrian walkways have been provided to the south crossing railroad right-of-way with connections to Division and Jackson Streets.
- The grocer building has been reconfigured and moved in order to tie it to the corner of East Washington Avenue and Milwaukee Street.
- Massing studies provide for a visual termination to proposed streets with buildings and their architectural elements.
- A zoning text has been provided for the Commission's review as previously requested that reflects all current changes to the General Development Plan as proposed.

Following the presentation of the plans, an array of neighborhood residents, including members of SASYNA, spoke and elaborated on the following:

- Concern with the effect of shadows from proposed development on the existing neighborhood to the east during the summer.
- Continue to work on connectivity issues to the south with entry monuments that are similar to those provided for cars for the adjacent bike path.
- Honor the neighborhood plan supporting five-story heights only.
- Appropriately deal with the grocer to frame the corner and define as a gateway at the intersection of Milwaukee Street and East Washington Avenue.
- The neighborhood is split on the issue to relocate and/or maintain the French Battery building in its current location.
- Building height is still an issue; some neighbors are OK with building heights as proposed along East Washington Avenue.

Following testimony from area residents, the Commission in deliberating on the project, stated the following:

- Specification of building heights and floor area ratio (f.a.r.) information should appear within the zoning text.
- Further consideration of the project's future phases should be accompanied with the provision of cross-sections of development, as well as three dimensional modeling to help get an understanding of building height as it relates to adjacent existing neighborhood development.
- Provide a pedestrian entrance at the corner building adjacent to Milwaukee Street and East Washington Avenue for the grocer tenant or whatever corner tenancy will occupy that space.
- Provide pedestrian connectivity between East Washington Avenue and internal development adjoining the grocer tenant space.
- Consider an art wall landscape screen around the Milwaukee Street surface parking lot.
- In terms of building height, the General Development Plan text should describe maximum floor-to-floor and/or building height.
- Consider tipping the relocated French Battery building to enhance the view of the front or end elevation.
- In favor of constricting streets to control traffic if acceptable to City staff.
- The tearing down of the French Battery building is troubling with concerns raised about the mass of individual buildings, as well as density without huge blocky buildings.

### **ACTION:**

On a motion by Geer, seconded by Host-Jablonski, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL** for the Union Corners PUD(GDP) located at 2313-2525 East Washington Avenue in Urban Design District No. 5. The motion was passed on a unanimous vote of (7-0). The motion provided the following:

- The Pedestrian/Bicycle/Motor Vehicle Commission consideration of the project.
- The Urban Design Commission goes on record to modify the project to reduce public street width.
- Further development of the mixed-use/grocer building at the corner of East Washington Avenue and Milwaukee Street should provide for an architectural statement.

The motion also required that the following be addressed with either any future SIP phase of development or any amendment to the overall GDP as currently proposed:

- Relative to circulation:
  - Eliminate internal bypass, or cure the problem of cut-through.
  - Roads narrowed to reflect surrounding neighborhoods, i.e., 32' curb-to-curb, including parallel parking.
  - Eliminate wide turning radii; turning radii should approximate those of surrounding neighborhoods.
  - Pedestrian bulb-outs shall be provided at every intersection.
  - Division Street right-of-way shall be preserved for pedestrians and bicycles.
  - Provide a Jackson Street pedestrian/bicycle connection.
  - Provide a Farwell pedestrian/bicycle connection.
- Relative to architecture:
  - LEEDS mandatory as proposed by the applicant.
  - Structures should frame street frontage along East Washington Avenue and Milwaukee Street.
  - The French Battery building is to be rebuilt in a manner that strongly resembles current form and façade (no Union Transfer façade-ectomy treatment).
  - Tall buildings should be better articulated to provide large shafts of light to penetrate East Washington Avenue during winter months.
  - Buildings should not come across as office park corporate. Commercial entrances to should be prominent and include features such as large french doors, plazas, terraces, etc.
  - Architecture should not preclude mixed-use, including one major grocery store.
  - Provide better architectural connection to neighborhood southeast.
- Relative to greenspace:
  - Greenspace along the railroad right-of-way should be oriented to public use, including active play, gardening and passive recreation.
  - Save the oaks.
  - Condense greenspace gained by narrowing roads and squaring corners.
  - Green roofs should occupy at least 2/3 of rooftops, with an emphasis on orientation to capture spring and fall sun patterns.
  - Entrance monuments shall be provided for pedestrian/bicycle paths.

A previous motion by Barrett, for initial with stated conditions for final, failed to obtain a second, but were incorporated by reference into the motion for final approval.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 5, 6, 6, 7, 7, 7.5 and 8.

**URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 2313-2525 East Washington Avenue**

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
<b>Member Ratings</b>	7	-	-	-	-	7	7	7
	-	-	-	-	-	7.5	8	7.5
	6	-	6	-	-	6	6	6
	7	6	6	-	-	6	6	6
	8	7	7	9	-	8	9	8
	7	-	6	-	-	8	7	7
	5	5	5	5	-	5	5	5

General Comments:

- Great plan for “urban” redevelopment. Buildings should have varied heights so there is not a very blocky feel to the entire site. Maintain narrow streets.
- Nicely done. We look forward to this as the plan is fleshed out.
- Narrowing of streets is commendable and would recommend it to Traffic and Fire. May want to consider removing the lesser maple tree to emphasize the old oaks being preserved. Wrapping the grocery toward Milwaukee does a better job of anchoring the intersection and helps hide the parking behind. Provide entries to the store from both East Washington and Milwaukee to help the pedestrian connection to the north. Provide a taller element than one story at that corner as well.
- Congratulations on an excellent project.
- The neighborhood’s 3-year involvement and forbearance in allowing the demolition of a neighborhood icon (French Battery building) and its leniency in considering very large, very tall buildings should be highlighted as this process continues.