



Project Name & Address: 1514 Rutledge Street

Application Type(s): Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations in the Marquette Bungalows historic district

Legistar File ID # [62303](#)

Prepared By: Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner, Planning Division

Date Prepared: September 29, 2020

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Roger Smith, Design Coalition Architects

Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a front porch.

Background Information

Parcel Location/Information: The subject site is located in the Marquette Bungalows Local Historic District.

Relevant State Statute Section:

Wisc SS 62.23(7)(em)2m. In the repair or replacement of a property that is designated as a historic landmark or included within a historic district or neighborhood conservation district under this paragraph, a city shall allow an owner to use materials that are similar in design, color, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities.

Relevant Ordinance Sections:

41.25 MARQUETTE BUNGALOWS HISTORIC DISTRICT.

- (5) Standards for the Review of Exterior Alterations and Repairs. All exterior alterations and repairs must be compatible with the historic character of the structure and the Marquette Bungalows Historic District.
- (a) **Re-Siding.** Re-siding with aluminum or vinyl that replaces or covers clapboards or non-original siding on structures originally sided with clapboards will be approved by the Landmarks Commission provided that the new siding imitates the width of the original clapboard siding to within one inch and provided further that all architectural details including, but not limited to, window trim, wood cornices and other ornament either remain uncovered or are duplicated exactly in appearance. All trim must continue to project out beyond the plane of the siding. Brick, stucco, and half-timber detailing shall match the original in appearance. Original wood shingle siding should be repaired or replaced to match the original in appearance, whenever possible; however, covering wood shingles with double-four vinyl or aluminum may be approved.
 - (b) **Roof Materials.** Reroofing shall be done with asphalt shingles, fiberglass shingles or other rectangular composition shingle similar in appearance to 3-in-1 tab asphalt shingles. Sawn wood shingles may also be approved. Modern style shingles, such as thick wood shakes, Dutch lap, French method and interlock shingles are incompatible with the historic character of the district and are prohibited. Vents shall be located as

inconspicuously as possible and shall be similar in color to the color of the roof. Rolled roofing, tar and gravel and other similar roofing materials are prohibited except that such materials may be used on flat or slightly sloped roofs which are not visible from the ground.

- (c) Skylights. Skylights on street-facing roof slopes are prohibited. Skylights may be permitted on side roof slopes provided the front edge of the skylight is at least ten (10) feet back from the front edge of the main roof. Skylights on any roof area not visible from the street may be permitted. The design should be as simple as possible, of the flat type (not bubble) and painted to blend with the color of the roof.
- (d) Dormers and Other Roof Alterations. New dormers shall be greater than three (3) feet from the front edge of the roof. New dormers shall match original dormers on the structure (or original dormers on similar structures in the district) in roof shape and material, width of overhang, siding, window design and trim details. The ridge line of a new dormer shall not extend above the ridge line of the main roof of the structure. The dormer walls shall not extend beyond the line of the main structure wall below. Shed dormers behind existing dormers or gables on non-street sides of the structure may be approved provided that the roof material, siding, window design and trim details match the original features of the structure. Other roof alterations shall be compatible with the roof shape and other features of the structure, such as siding and trim details, and shall not extend above the ridge line of the structure.
- (e) Chimneys. The exterior appearance of chimneys visible from the street shall be maintained in good repair. The removal of the exterior portions of such chimneys is prohibited. Chimneys not visible from the street may be removed. New chimneys shall be constructed of brick to match as closely as possible the brick on the structure, or if there is no brick on the structure, chimneys may be made of brick similar in dimensions and color to brick on other in the neighborhood. New chimneys not visible from the street may also be constructed of metal or other non-historic material.
- (f) Windows and Doors.
 - 1. General Standards. The original appearance of leaded glass and other non-rectangular decorative windows (e.g., curved top windows) on any facade of the structure shall be retained. Replacement of such windows shall duplicate the original in size, configuration and appearance. Picture windows are prohibited. Trim on new or remodeled windows shall match the original window trim on the structure.
 - 2. Street Facades. Windows and doors on the front or street facade of the structure and on side faces within ten (10) feet of the front facade of the structure shall retain their original or existing appearance, including true muntins where they exist. Replacement windows and doors may be approved if they match the original appearance.
 - 3. Non-Street Side Facades. Retention of the original appearance of windows and doors on the sides of the structure is encouraged. However, if replacement or new windows are proposed, the muntin design of the original windows on the structure may either be replicated with true-divided lights or with exterior or interior applied grids or with grids applied between the panes of glass. New windows shall either be casement windows or double-hung windows. Sash on new windows over four (4) feet square shall be divided by muntins or mullions. Bay windows may be approved if they have sides perpendicular to the wall and if they do not extend beyond the eaves of the roof.

4. Rear Facade. Replacement, remodeling or installation of new doors and windows on the rear facade will not be restricted except as discussed under "General Standards" above.
- (g) Porches. Porches and stairway railings shall match the original railings in appearance wherever possible. Wrought iron railings with vertical balusters at least one-half (1/2) inch in width, wood railings with vertical square balusters spaced no more than three (3) inches apart, and solid wall railings covered in siding to match the structure will be approved. Other designs may be permitted if they blend with the character of the structure and the district. Porches may be enclosed with windows or screens provided that new windows be casements or double-hung units similar in proportion to other windows on the structure. Steps may be constructed of wood, concrete or brick. If wood is used, steps shall have risers and be enclosed on the sides by lattice or a wing wall. Rear yard decks shall have a railing as described above, shall have the underside screened by lattice or evergreen shrubs, and all parts of the deck, except the flooring and steps, shall be painted or opaque-stained in a color to blend with the colors on the structure.
- (h) Second Exits. Second exit platforms and stairways shall be as unobtrusive as possible. No second exit platforms or stairways shall be permitted on the front facade of a structure. When possible, second exit stairways shall be provided on the interior of the structure. When this is not possible, they shall be added onto the rear section of the structure. Railings and design shall follow the railing and deck standards listed under "Porches" above.
- (i) Additions and Other Alterations. New additions on the front of the structure are prohibited. Additions on the sides or rear shall be permitted if they are compatible with the structure in architectural design, scale, color, texture, proportion and rhythm of solids to voids and proportion of widths to heights of doors and windows. Materials and architectural details used in additions and alterations shall duplicate in texture, appearance, and design, the materials and details used in the original construction of the structure or of other structures in the district. The Landmarks Commission may approve an exception to this policy where the existing structure materials and architectural details differ from the original. Additions and exterior alterations that exactly duplicate the original materials in composition are encouraged. Additions or exterior alterations that destroy significant architectural features are prohibited. Side additions shall not detract from the design composition of the original facade.
- (j) Foundations. The original or existing finish on the foundation shall be retained. Brick or stone shall not be covered with a cementitious or other surface. Foundation insulation shall be applied only to the interior. Basement windows may be removed provided that the space is filled with a material to match as closely as possible the appearance of the surrounding foundation and provided that the new material is inset at least one inch from the plane of the wall.
- (k) Tuckpointing and Brick Repair. Mortar and other materials used in brick repair shall match the original in color, hardness and appearance. Brick shall not be painted.
- (l) Storm Windows and Doors. Storm windows and doors shall be enameled, painted or otherwise coated with a colored surface; raw aluminum is prohibited. Storm door designs of wood and glass to match the original design on the structure or on similar structures in the district is encouraged. Storm doors of simple design with no stylistic references (e.g., colonial cross-bars) may also be used. Storm doors with metal grilles may be approved provided that they blend with the style of the structure.

Analysis and Conclusion

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a new front porch as a replacement for the existing stoop. The bungalow was constructed in 1926 as part of the development now known as the Marquette Bungalows Historic District.

The standards for this historic district allow for new front porches. The style of porch is in keeping with the character of porches on other bungalows in the district. The newel posts will be metal, but be of a style that replicates similar porch posts with a simple metal railing. The porch decking is proposed as PVC composite by Timbertech. The Landmarks Commission has approved similar materials for back porches, but denied applications where the style of front porch featured exposed board ends facing towards the street. As this would be a new porch, the applicant is proposing a board placement design that would frame the deck boards and not leave any exposed ends which would display the plastic center of the boards.

A discussion of the relevant ordinance sections follows:

41.25 MARQUETTE BUNGALOWS HISTORIC DISTRICT.

- (5) Standards for the Review of Exterior Alterations and Repairs. All exterior alterations and repairs must be compatible with the historic character of the structure and the Marquette Bungalows Historic District.
- (a) Re-Siding. N/A
 - (b) Roof Materials. N/A
 - (c) Skylights. N/A
 - (d) Dormers and Other Roof Alterations. N/A
 - (e) Chimneys. N/A
 - (f) Windows and Doors. N/A
 - (g) Porches. Historically this house does not appear to have had railings on the front steps. The current front steps feature simple wood railings. The style of metal railings meets the requirements of this standard as they have vertical balusters at least one-half (1/2) inch in width and are of a style that blends with the other historic resources in the district.
 - (h) Second Exits. N/A
 - (i) Additions and Other Alterations. N/A
 - (j) Foundations. N/A
 - (k) Tuckpointing and Brick Repair. N/A
 - (l) Storm Windows and Doors. N/A

Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness are met and recommends that the Landmarks Commission approve the project as proposed.