



City of Madison

City of Madison
Madison, WI 53703
www.cityofmadison.com

Meeting Minutes - Approved TRANSIT AND PARKING COMMISSION

*PLEASE NOTE: This meeting can be viewed in a live webcast of Madison City Channel at
www.madisoncitychannel.com.*

Wednesday, June 8, 2016

5:00 PM

215 Martin Luther King, Jr. Blvd.
Room 260, Madison Municipal Building
(After 6 PM, use Doty St. entrance.)

A. CALL TO ORDER/ROLL CALL

The meeting was called to order at 5:00 PM.

Present: 9 - David Ahrens; Ledell Zellers; Rebecca Kemble; David E. Tolmie; Wayne Bigelow; Gary L. Poulson; Margaret Bergamini; Ann E. Kovich and Kenneth Golden

Please note: There are two vacancies on the Commission, in the positions of First and Second Alternate. Also, please note that Zellers arrived at 5:02 PM, and Kemble arrived at 5:04 PM, after the Minutes were approved.

B. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A motion was made by Kovich, seconded by Bigelow, to Approve the Minutes of the May 11, 2016 meeting. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

C. PUBLIC APPEARANCES - None.

D. DISCLOSURES AND RECUSALS

Being a primary advisor to the largest group of unlimited pass program users as a central part of her employment, Bergamini said she would recuse herself from Item G.1.

E. TRANSIT AND PARKING MONTHLY REPORTS

E.1. [43238](#)

Parking: June 2016 Activity Report, April Revenue/Expenses/Occupancy Reports - TPC 06.08.16

Asst. Parking Utility Manager Sabrina Tolley highlighted the following items in the reports (attached).

- The rate change effective June 1st would be phased in for on-street meters, as they were updated/reprogrammed over the next few weeks.
- Popularity of the new monthly night permits was growing; ten had been sold to date: CSN (2), OC (5), SSCampus (2), SSCap (1).
- HUB had been selected as the vendor for PARCS: a contract for service, software, training would be drafted; and the associated resolution would be brought to TPC.

Bergamini/Kovich made a motion to receive the report. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

E.2. [43239](#) Metro: YTD Fixed and Paratranist Performance Indicators - TPC 06.08.16

Metro Transit General Manager Chuck Kamp discussed the reports (attached).

- Ridership dropped again in April. Staff was tracking this; had found that weekend ridership was down more than week days. When services were more convenient, buses were more attractive. When services were spread out, gas prices were more likely to impact people, esp. those with jobs on the periphery.
- Chargeable accidents were up some, but they were mostly minor and involved newer drivers. At the same time, insurance pay-outs and reserves were down 50% YTD.
- Road calls were down significantly. Still newer buses had more precise environmental controls, which called for more maintenance.
- Fare boxes were having fewer issues.
- Route 80's were down, perhaps related to more apartments on Campus. Even though rides/hour for Route 80 had dropped from 117 to 88, it was still the #1 route.
- Though hard to measure, overcrowding might also be a factor in ridership; as well as a milder winter. Articulated buses were being considered as an option on the next 5-year procurement.
- Fares were not collected on Route 80's, and ridership was counted by the drivers, making these stats less reliable. Differences had been observed in how drivers counted riders. Spot checks and cameras were used to monitor this.
- Since ridership was averaged for the UW staff/students, revenues there had not dropped like ridership. (It was noted that the Route 80's were a separate program and not included in the contract with revenue averaging. But the Route 80's did affect overall ridership stats.)

Bigelow/Tolmie made a motion to receive the report. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

F. NEW BUSINESS ITEMS

F.1. [43208](#) Authorizing the Mayor and City Clerk to execute a long-term parking lease with 202 E. Washington, LLC, for 60-80 parking stalls at Capitol Square North parking garage.

Tolley said the lease agreement provided parking from 6 PM to 7 AM for hotel valet operations, starting in April 2017.

- Flexibility and protection had been built into the agreement, allowing the Utility to terminate if needed (say, for bond issuance or major reconstruction). The initial term was 10 years, with two 5-year renewals.
- The 110% of the resident monthly rate would change when rates changed.
- Per policy, long-term agreements like this could only be set up at facilities with excess capacity. Occupancy at Cap Sq North averaged 10-30% during these hours. Based on excess capacity, the 7-8 AM grace period could be used.
- Annual revenue of \$52-70K was expected. The number of spaces being leased represented 13% of the total spaces there.

A motion was made by Kovich, seconded by Zellers, to RECOMMEND TO COUNCIL TO ADOPT - REPORT OF OFFICER. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

G. UNFINISHED BUSINESS ITEMS

- G.1. [43240](#) Metro: Action on proposed fare changes effective August 28, 2016, inc. review of Fare Equity Policy - TPC 06.08.16

[Please note: Bergamini recused herself at this point in the meeting.] Kamp was joined by Finance Manager Wayne Block and Marketing and Customer Service Manager Mick Rusch, to review the fare equity formula and the original staff proposal, and to present some new fare options created in response to public feedback. (See Highlights at the top of M1, M2 and M3 Alternate Proposals, attached.)

Staff and members discussed the information.

- In the original proposal, % increases were set high in order to reach ~\$500K in 2017, with increases to the 31-day and 10-ride adult passes, and to the commute card, having the biggest impact.
- The impact of increases to the unlimited ride passes wouldn't be felt until the particular contracts came up for renewal.
- With half the feedback opposed to the increase to the 31-day adult pass, alternate proposals were developed, sliding other items around.
- In M3, the 10-ride cards had big increases, making them convenience cards and not discount cards.
- In the original proposal, the EZ Rider pass was not increased because it was identified as an equity sensitive fare. But because it generated a lot of revenue, it was increased somewhat in the alternates in order to reduce the % increase to the 31-day pass.
- The \$2.33/ride revenue for Adult Cash rides was an anomaly. Because the cash fares were all collected together, and the senior and youth rates were assumed to be \$1.00 rides, some Adult-Cash riders seemed to be paying more than \$2, likely by virtue of having only higher denominations.
- When asked for a recommendation, staff said that M2 was the most middle-of-the-road.
- Re: deep discounts and when they would become too small (to be attractive), past elasticity models had been fairly accurate; but if staff learned elasticities needed to change, then next time the new elasticities would be used.
- Re: riders migrating from the 10-ride pass (initially, a popular discounted pass) to the monthly pass, even after the fare for the 31-day pass was increased last time and the 10-ride pass was not, sales of 31-day passes went up the following year.
- This could reflect the impact of transit-dependent millenials. Ridership on Route 75 to Epic was up and those millenial riders used 31-day passes. Yet the 10-ride pass still represented a deep discount, albeit with a small "d".
- Family Care implementation would occur no earlier than January 2018.

Kamp talked about the fare increase as it related to the budget. This year's budget dipped into Metro's Contingency Reserve, due to the delay in the fare increase as well as for other items such as added service, insurance, work on Nakoosa Trail expansion. Because the 2016 budget said that Metro needed to have \$500K in additional revenue by 2017, this was staff's task/goal.

Finance Director David Schmiedicke joined the table to comment further.

- Because the TPC had a process for increasing fares that included public input, it was difficult to propose/put a fare increase in the a budget without it

having gone through the TPC.

- For the 2016 budget, the idea was to allocate a one-time contribution from the Contingency Fund, and look at a commensurate fare increase in 2017 to replenish the use of that one-time money with an ongoing revenue stream from the fare box.
- A larger question was what was going to be the trend from now on, in terms of the level of property tax levy subsidy.
- Looking at what had happened over past few years to build up the reserves, Metro had probably been overbudgeted for salaries/benefits. Commensurate with that, the levy level had been higher. From 2017 forward, this amount needed to be re-based.
- Also, the mix of own-source and levy revenues had to be reviewed, and how that would affect the Fund balance. Other revenue streams, state and federal money, were not growing. So, 20% of the revenue stream, property tax, was supporting all the costs. With levy limits, the General Fund operating budget was under a lot of pressure.
- A few anomalies had occurred in recent years, causing reserves to build up; i.e., No pay increase to Teamsters even though it was budgeted, and one-time money from the premium stabilization fund.
- These factors needed to be considered in terms of the fund balance, what it looked like now (~\$7.5M) and what it would look like in a few years.
- All this was based on the Fund balance being maintained, likely at a lower level; and would be a function of the amount of levy support, and the fact that other revenue streams were not growing.
- Inordinate pressure was being put on the property tax, with severe limits on it, the affordability of taxpayers, and various priorities in the budget.
- In the balance, some element of the equation needed to be fare box revenues. Not everything could be supported by this, but some regularity was needed to help support the overall revenue stream.

Regarding lower-than-expected salaries/benefits, Kamp noted that a record number of drivers had retired over the last 2-3 years, and were replaced by less senior drivers.

Members and staff discussed the Alternatives and budget.

- Kemble: In her experience, the Youth 10-Ride card was bought primarily by lower-income kids, making it equity sensitive. So she preferred Alternative M1. She asked that future surveys disaggregate the Youth 10-Ride from the other types of 10-Ride cards.
- Kovich: At some point, the Commission might want to discuss the Contingency Fund; for what reasons a certain level was appropriate.
- Kamp: It was lately determined that Metro would be staying at their E. Washington location for 20 more years. Costs for deferred maintenance would need to be assessed. Considering this and the Fund draw-down, Metro's overall financial situation indicated that the Fund be preserved.
- Kamp/Kovich: Regarding the fare equity formula and the question of 5% above zero, none of non-equity sensitive fares were now at 0% (exc. the Sr/Dis 10-Ride fare, which was tied to the Sr/Dis Cash fare and should have been identified as equity sensitive).
- Block/Zellers: An automatic 2% turnover reduction was applied to salary/benefit budgeting. But with the length of vacancies, 2% was probably not high enough.
- Rusch/Golden: To determine disabled eligibility for the Senior/Disabled pass,

a doctor's note was presented to Metro who issued the person an eligibility card. No information was available to determine which seniors were low-income.

- Block/Golden: By federal law, the Senior (65+)/Disabled Cash fare had to be half of the Adult Cash fare, during peak hours. This did not apply to passes. The Senior 10-Ride pass was not half of the Adult 10-Ride pass. Metro had always kept the Sr/Disabled 31-Day pass at half of the Adult 31-Day pass, but it wasn't required.
- Golden: Perhaps low-income seniors should participate in the low-income program; and passes for other seniors needn't be subsidized. Also, if not paratransit-eligible, what made a person transit-disabled? Perhaps these areas could be explored.
- Kamp: Some transit systems automatically ID'd seniors over 75 or 80 as low-income, rather than requiring them to fill out forms, etc.
- Transit Service Manager Crystal Martin: State 85.21 funding ID'd "senior" as age 65+. For State 85.20 (human services) funding, the age was 60. Riders migrated to the Sr/Dis 31-Day pass when it was created just 8 years ago. Staff was aware of this.

Kovich/Bigelow made a motion to approve Alternative M2. Kovich felt it provided a good balance relative to feedback.

Kemble opposed M2, and preferred Alternative M1, because the Youth 10-ride and Adult 31-Day passes, which impacted a lot of people and were quite sensitive, were increased less. Changes to the Youth Summer and Day Tripper passes could be borne more easily (vs. M2, which spread changes out).

Ahrens questioned the 0% for the Sr/Dis 10-Ride pass. Kamp said this was done to keep it in line with the Sr/Dis cash fare. Also, it should have been highlighted in yellow. Golden added that the Sr/Dis 10-Ride pass was created for convenience, not for discounting.

Ahrens felt that Alternative M3 best addressed the feedback in opposition to the increase to the Adult 31-Day pass. Kovich noted that each Alternative offered something for each group; and she could support M1, M2, or M3, for different reasons. They would have to decide what was the best balance. Rusch mentioned that of the 35 comments received (inc. at hearing), 17 were about the 31-Day pass. The next largest group of comments (6), opposed the fare increase in general.

Bigelow pointed out that the difference between changes to Youth 10-Ride and Adult 31-Day passes in M1 and M2, amounted to pennies per ride/day. He would go with the staff recommendation. Golden said that as much as he wanted to reduce the Youth 10-Ride, when he played with the numbers, it became a cascade of chaos. A long-time supporter of keeping kids' rates cheap, he was glad that Kemble had raised the issue; but he didn't see how to make the numbers work.

A roll call vote was taken on the motion to approve Alternative M2, which passed 4-3, as follows: Ayes - Golden, Kovich, Bigelow, Tolmie. Noes - Ahrens, Kemble, Zellers. Recused - Bergamini. Non-voting - Poulson.

H. INFORMATIONAL PRESENTATIONS AND DISCUSSION ITEMS

H.1. Metro: MA Waiver Funding and proposed Ad Hoc Committee

Poulson said they would have more information on this in July. A number of members had indicated interest in serving on the committee. Later in the meeting, Deputy Mayor Anne Monks said the draft resolution to form the committee had been sent to all TPC members with a request to serve on it. Bergamini, Golden, and Alders Kemble and Gruber had volunteered. Golden wondered if State Medicaid staff could be invited to provide information to the committee. Martin said a broad list was being formed of people the committee would like to hear from. Kovich asked for regular updates to TPC.

**I. REPORTS OF OTHER COMMITTEES - for information only; no action required.
(Most recent meeting minutes electronically attached, if available)**

[07828](#)

ADA Transit Subcommittee
Contracted Service Oversight Subcommittee
Parking Council for People with Disabilities
Long Range Transportation Planning Committee
Joint Southeast Campus Area Committee
Madison Area Transportation Planning Board (MPO)
TPC Subcommittee (to review issues outlined in Leg. File 37359)
Ad Hoc Transportation Ordinance Review Committee

J. ANNOUNCEMENTS AND FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

J.1. General announcements by Chair (Verbal announcements, for information only)

Poulson noted that Rules and Procedures would be reviewed in July, as part of the Commission's annual organizational meeting. The election of Chair/Vice-Chair would also occur. Poulson said he was willing to serve one more year, but other talented members could do likewise. Reports from members on other committees could begin then as well.

J.2. Commission member items for future agendas

Zellers mentioned a recent email to the TPC from Gillian Nevers, requesting changes to street storage and RP3 parking ordinances, and wondered if the Commission had a process for responding to such requests. Members felt the issue raised in the email centered on street storage. Poulson said ordinance changes were normally initiated by alders, but the TPC could choose to discuss the program if they wished, to generate alder interest in doing something legislatively.

Poulson wanted an update on Metro's advertising program. Kovich wanted an update on Judge Doyle Square.

ADJOURNMENT

A motion was made by Bigelow, seconded by Tolmie, to Adjourn at 6:30 PM. The motion passed by voice vote/other.