



**Project Name/Address:** 1908 Arlington

**Application Type:** Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alteration and new construction (PUBLIC HEARING)

**Legistar File ID #** [44272](#)

**Prepared By:** Amy L. Scanlon, Preservation Planner, Planning Division

**Date Prepared:** September 13, 2016

## Summary

**Project Applicant/Contact:** Michael Webster, Associated Housewrights

**Requested Action:** The Applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for an exterior alteration involving the construction of a rear addition and a detached garage structure in the University Heights Historic District

## Background Information

**Parcel Location:** The subject site is located in the University Heights Historic District.

### Relevant Historic Preservation Ordinance Sections:

**41.24 UNIVERSITY HEIGHTS HISTORIC DISTRICT.**

- (4) Standards for the Review of New Structures in the TR-V1, TR-V2, TR-U1, TR-U2, TR-C2, TR-C3, TR-C4, MNX, TSS, and LMX Zoning Districts.
- (b) Accessory Structures. Accessory structures, as defined in Section 28.211 of the Madison general ordinances, shall be compatible with the design of the existing structures on the zoning lot, shall not exceed fifteen (15) feet in height and shall be as unobtrusive as possible. No accessory structure shall be erected in any yard except a rear yard. Exterior wall materials shall be the same as those for construction of new principal structures as set forth in sec 41.24(4)(a)2.
- (a) Principal Structures.
2. Materials. Materials for the exterior walls shall be the same as or similar to materials prevalent in the University Heights Historic District. Permitted materials include brick, narrow gauge horizontal clapboards four or less inches in exposed width, stone, stucco, smooth shingles or combinations of the above provided the combinations occur in a manner and location similar to the materials on existing structures in University Heights (e.g., brick on first floor with clapboard on second floor). Other materials, such as aluminum or vinyl must be visually compatible with structures within 200 feet of the subject property. The following materials are prohibited: concrete block, asbestos, wide clapboards over four inches in exposed width, diagonal boards, vertical boards, rough sawn wood, rough split shingles, shakes.

- (5) Standards for the Review of Exterior Alterations and Repairs in TR-C2, TR-C3, and TR-C4, Zoning Districts.
- (a) Height. No alterations shall be higher than the existing structure; however, if the existing structure is already a nonconforming one, alteration shall be made thereto except in accordance with Section 28.192 of the Madison General Ordinances. Roof alterations resulting in an increased structure volume are prohibited unless they meet the requirements in sec. 41.24(4)(a)5. and are permitted under Chapter 28 of the Madison general ordinances, or approved as a variance pursuant to sec. 28.184 or approved as a conditional use or as part of a planned residential development.
  - (b) Second Exit Platforms and Fire Escapes. Second exit platforms and fire escapes shall be invisible from the street, wherever possible, and shall be of a plain and unobtrusive design in all cases. In instances where an automatic combustion products detection and alarm system is permitted as an alternative to second exits, use of such a system shall be mandatory.
  - (c) Repairs. Materials used in exterior repairs shall duplicate the original building materials in texture and appearance, unless the Landmarks Commission approves duplication of the existing building materials where the existing building materials differ from the original. Repairs using materials that exactly duplicate the original in composition are encouraged.
  - (d) Restoration. Projects that will restore the appearance of a structure to its original appearance are encouraged and will be approved by the Landmarks Commission if such projects are documented by photographs, architectural or archeological research or other suitable evidence.
  - (e) Re-Siding. Re-siding with aluminum or vinyl that replaces or covers clapboards or nonoriginal siding on structures originally sided with clapboards will be approved by the Landmarks Commission provided that the new siding imitates the width of the original clapboard siding to within one (1) inch and provided further that all architectural details including, but not limited to, window trim, wood cornices and ornament either remain uncovered or are duplicated exactly in appearance. Where more than one layer of siding exists on the structure, all layers except the first must be removed before new siding is applied. If insulation is applied under the new siding, all trim must be built up so that it projects from the new siding to the same extent it did with the original siding.
  - (f) Alterations Visible from the Street and Alterations to Street Facades. Alterations visible from the street, including alterations to the top of structures, and alterations to street facades shall be compatible with the existing structure in architectural design, scale, color, texture, proportion and rhythm of solids to voids and proportion of widths to heights of doors and windows. Materials used in such alterations shall duplicate in texture and appearance, and architectural details used therein shall duplicate in design, the materials and details used in the original construction of the existing structure or of other structures in University Heights of similar materials, age and architectural style, unless the Landmarks Commission approves duplication of the texture and appearance of materials and the design of architectural details used in the existing structure where the existing building materials and architectural details differ from the original. Alterations that exactly duplicate the original materials in composition are encouraged. Alterations that destroy significant architectural features are prohibited. Side alterations shall not detract from the design composition of the original facade.
  - (g) Additions and Exterior Alterations Not Visible from the Street. Additions and exterior alterations that are not visible from any streets contiguous to the lot lines upon which the structure is located will be approved by the Landmarks Commission if their design is compatible with the scale of the existing structure and, further, if the materials used are compatible with the existing materials in texture, color and architectural details. Additions and alterations shall harmonize with the architectural design of the structure rather than contrast with it.

- (h) Roof Shape. The roof shape of the front of a structure shall not be altered except to restore it to the original documentable appearance or to add a dormer or dormers in a location and shape compatible with the architectural design of the structure and similar in location and shape to original dormers on structures of the same vintage and style within the district. Alterations of the roof shape of the sides or back of a structure shall be visually compatible with the architectural design of the existing structure.
- (i) Roof Material.
1. If the existing roof is tile, slate or other material that is original to the structure and/or contributes to its historic character, all repairs thereto shall be made using the same materials. In addition, in all cases any such roof must be repaired rather than replaced, unless the documented cost of repair exceeds the documented cost of re-roofing with a substitute material that approximates the appearance of the original roofing material as closely as possible, in which case re-roofing with a material that approximates the appearance of the original roofing material as closely as possible will be approved by the Landmarks Commission.
  2. If the existing roofing material is asphalt shingles, sawn wood shingles or a nonhistoric material such as fiberglass, all repairs shall match in appearance the existing roof material; however, if any such roof is covered or replaced, re-roofing must be done using rectangular sawn wood shingles or rectangular shingles that are similar in width, thickness and apparent length to sawn wood shingles, for example, 3-in-1 tab asphalt shingles. Modern style shingles, such as thick wood shakes, dutch lap, french method and interlock shingles, that are incompatible with the historic character of the district are prohibited.
  3. Rolled roofing, tar and gravel and other similar roofing materials are prohibited except that such materials may be used on flat or slightly sloped roofs which are not visible from the ground.

## Analysis and Conclusion

### Certificate of Appropriateness for the Garage

The proposed garage is a new structure in the historic district that is over 100 square feet and therefore requires a public hearing.

A brief discussion of 41.24(4)(b) follows:

The garage is compatible with the design of the existing structure on the lot and is being constructed in the rear yard. The exterior wall material is stucco to match the house. The foundation material is poured concrete on the sides and rear. The proposed material for the trim and soffits and fascia is not noted. The window and door material is also not noted. The height shall be reviewed with Zoning.

### Certificate of Appropriateness for the Addition

The proposed addition is less than 100 square feet and does not require a public hearing.

A brief discussion of 41.24(5) follows:

- (5) (a) Height. The proposed addition is not taller than the existing structure.
- (b) Second Exit Platforms and Fire Escapes. NA
- (c) Repairs. NA
- (d) Restoration. NA
- (e) Re-Siding. NA

- (f) Alterations Visible from the Street and Alterations to Street Facades. The proposed addition is visible from the street and is generally compatible with the architectural design of the existing structure. The addition design works with existing architectural details, the existing materials and colors and textures are being replicated, the proportion and rhythm of solids to voids is compatible and the proportion of widths to heights of doors and windows seems to match the existing adjacent doors and windows.
- (g) Additions and Exterior Alterations Not Visible from the Street. NA. The proposed addition is visible from the street.
- (h) Roof Shape. The proposed addition has a simple shed shape that is visually compatible with the architectural design of the existing structure.
- (i) Roof Material. The proposed addition roof shingles will closely match the existing main roof shingles.

## Recommendation

### Certificate of Appropriateness for the Garage

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of the garage may be met and recommends approval by the Landmarks Commission with the following conditions of approval:

1. The Applicant shall specify the proposed trim material, window material, and door details (for side and overhead doors).

### Certificate of Appropriateness for the Addition

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of the addition may be met and recommends approval by the Landmarks Commission with the following conditions of approval:

1. The Applicant shall confirm that the partial porch that is shown to the right of the west elevation is not part of the current proposal.
2. The Commission shall discuss the appropriateness of the proposed skylights in the addition roof. The addition is on the side and is partially obscured by a lower level bump at the corner of the building. Generally the Commission does not approve skylights that are visible from the street.
3. The Applicant shall provide details about the materials of the proposed windows and trim. The proposed windows shall be paired with trim to match the existing paired windows. The elevation drawings do not show the paired windows as they exist.
4. The Applicant shall provide details about the materials and appearance of the proposed door and trim. Please provide manufacturer cut sheet information.
5. Details from the existing front porch shall be simplified and used as the basis for the design of the proposed rear porch at the back door.
6. The Applicant shall work with staff to finalize the details described in the conditions of approval.