

Madison Landmarks Commission

University Heights Historic District
Criteria for the review of additions, exterior alterations and repairs
Parcels zoned R2 and R4A

Address: 207 N Spooner Street
Date: February 17, 2009
Form Prepared By: Rebecca Cnare and Bill Fruhling

Does the project meet the following guideline criteria?

(For the complete text of the criteria, please see Madison General Ordinances Sec. 33.01(12)(d), available on the web at www.cityofmadison.com)

Yes	<u> </u>	No	<u> X </u>	1.	Height.
Yes	<u> n.a. </u>	No	<u> </u>	2.	Second exit platforms and fire escapes.
Yes	<u> n.a. </u>	No	<u> </u>	3.	Solar apparatus.
Yes	<u> X </u>	No	<u> </u>	4.	Repairs.
Yes	<u> n.a. </u>	No	<u> </u>	5.	Restoration.
Yes	<u> ? </u>	No	<u> </u>	6.	Re-siding.
Yes	<u> ? </u>	No	<u> </u>	7.	Additions visible from the street and alterations to street façades.
Yes	<u> X </u>	No	<u> </u>	8.	Additions and exterior alterations not visible from the street.
Yes	<u> </u>	No	<u> X </u>	9.	Roof shape.
Yes	<u> X </u>	No	<u> </u>	10.	Roof material.
Yes	<u> n.a. </u>	No	<u> </u>	11.	Parking lots.

Explanation:

The owners are seeking a variance of the Landmarks Ordinance in order to raise the height of their house and alter the roof shape. The house is a brick two-story vernacular Mediterranean revival style residence erected in 1924. It is located at the intersection of North Street and Summit Avenue.

The owners propose to undertake a major remodeling of the house to create additional living space under a raised roof.

I have heard a few concerns over the telephone from two neighbors who received the public hearing notice, however, at the time of this mailing, have not received any written concerns.

There are several main issues that the Landmarks Commission must consider before granting the variance, and subsequent Certificate of Appropriateness.

X Please see continuation sheet

The criteria for height, additions visible from the street and alterations to street facades, and roof shape in the University Heights Historic District (Sec 33.19(12)(d) read as follows:

1. Height. All additions shall be no higher than the existing building; however, if the existing building is already a nonconforming one, no addition shall be made thereto except in accordance with Section 28.05(3)(c) of the Madison General Ordinances. Roof additions resulting in an increased building volume are prohibited unless they meet the standards in Section 33.01(12)(d)7. and are permitted under Chapter 28 of the Madison General Ordinances, or approved as a variance pursuant to Sections 28.08(2)(e) and 28.12(8)(d) or approved as a conditional use or as part of a planned residential development in accordance with Section 28.085(e).

The addition will be 7'6" higher than the current ridge of the roof. The first floor of the house is several feet higher than the sidewalk, which will help to reduce some of the visibility of the higher roofline of the addition from the street. The slope of the roof and the dormers will also mask some of the new massing, but the addition will still be a very visible addition from both the sidewalk in front of the house, as well as the houses across the street. The architect has provided a rendering of how the new addition will appear to the surrounding area.

2. Additions Visible from the Street and Alterations to Street Facades. Additions visible from the street, including additions to the top of buildings or structures, and alterations to street facades shall be compatible with the existing building in architectural design, scale, color, texture, proportion of solids to voids and proportion of widths to heights of doors and windows. Materials used in such alterations and additions shall duplicate in texture and appearance, and architectural details used therein shall duplicate in design, the materials and details used in the original construction of the existing building or of other buildings in University Heights of similar materials, age and architectural style, unless the Landmarks Commission approves duplication of the texture and appearance of materials and the design of architectural details used in the existing building where the existing building materials and architectural details differ from the original. Additions and exterior alterations that exactly duplicate the original materials in composition are encouraged. Additions or exterior alterations that destroy significant architectural features are prohibited. Side additions shall not detract from the design composition of the original facade.

The proposed new dormers' detailing and design will be in keeping with the style of the house and the neighborhood, as required by ordinance. While the existing small dormer does have wood slat siding, it is not visible from the street. The new dormers, however, will be adding a large amount of cement-board siding (painted to look like wood siding) visible from the street frontage, which will be a departure from the original appearance of the building.

3. *Roof Shape.* The roof shape of the front of a building or structure shall not be altered except to restore it to the original documentable appearance or to add a dormer or dormers in a location and shape compatible with the architectural design of the building and similar in location and shape to original dormers on buildings of the same vintage and style within the district. Alterations of the roof shape of the sides or back of a building or structure shall be visually compatible with the architectural design of the existing building.

The roof shape will be altered from an existing 5/12-pitch to a proposed 12/12-pitch. This is a significant difference from the original shape. At the existing 5/12-pitch, the view of the roof fades quickly away into the background. At a 12/12 pitch the roof will have a much larger presence on both street frontages.

During the Informational Presentation of this project at the January 26th, 2009 Landmarks Commission meeting a recently approved height variance in the University Heights Historic District was raised. In the motion approving that project, the Landmarks Commission noted that, “although the project technically violated the height requirements, the Commission agreed that it met the intent of the criterion since the height of the new addition will be almost impossible to see from the street.” The proposed addition at 207 N Spooner will be easily visible from both Spooner Street and Summit Avenue, as the house sits on a corner lot.

After reviewing the proposal against the criteria of the University Heights Historic District, staff does not believe that the application meets the criteria listed above, especially the underlined passages of criteria 1, and 3, and therefore recommends that the Landmarks Commission deny the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.