



November 6, 2020

Members of the Plan Commission:

Given the conflicts we believe the project currently presents to City of Madison ordinances and land use standards, the representatives of Eno Vino Downtown do not believe that the American Exchange Development project meets the City of Madison ordinance standards for approval recommendation at this time. Due to public noticing errors, the Urban Design Commission has not taken up any discussion regarding the project's design elements relative to the Urban Design District 4 standards. We would like to see the project's rezoning referred by the Plan Commission so that the Urban Design Commission can first take up UDD-4 standards for consideration before the Plan Commission makes any determinations on the rezoning and the project's Planned Development standards.

We also hope that your body will provide detailed and specific comments and directives to improve the project design and provide guidance to encourage the development team to further revise their project design in a mutually beneficial direction. We have provided a detailed letter from November 3 directed to UDC members that outlines a large majority of our concerns regarding this project. We hope that you take the opportunity to review that letter, and we encourage you to read the detailed technical review of the ordinances that we submitted to City of Madison Planning Staff on October 28, 2020. In it we have outlined in significant detail how the project as proposed does not meet the Urban Design District #4 Statement of Purpose, Madison General Ordinance (M.G.O.) 33.02(11)(a), and guidelines (i.), (ii.), and (iii) of M.G.O. 33.02(11)(4)(b).

During the UDC presentational meeting of May 27th, 2020, ULI principal Brad Binkowski testified that ULI's goal in this development was to create a downtown commercial space stronger and better for everyone. That is our goal as well. As the ULI project is currently proposed, it affects the health and vitality of the neighboring property and existing uses. We believe there is a path to success on this project for all parties that can be achieved with project design and massing adjustments. We also ask that you use your jurisdiction as Plan Commission members to evaluate the project's underground parking as it drives the project's massing and building design, and explore its implications to the City of Madison Parking Utility-owned Capitol North Parking Ramp.

COVID-19 has created a limited and unusual environment for stakeholder engagement in community land use decisions. After this project was proposed, we created a Change.org petition to register public sentiment on the community impacts to Eno Vino's space in a COVID-safe way, and as of today, we have received more than 1,340 signatures, of which 631 came from Dane County residents opposed to the project as designed, with more than 420 City of Madison residents registering their opposition. We hope that you will spend some time reviewing the public comments and signature pages we have collected and provided to City Staff regarding the important community asset that would be negatively impacted if the project is built as currently proposed. In addition to the 50 pages of signatures we submitted to UDC, please see the attached for the latest additions to signatures we have received since Tuesday.

This project is a significant \$130 million addition to Madison's most iconic downtown commercial district. The building mass, location, and commercial impacts are significant, and we look forward to a detailed and unhurried public review to ensure the best outcome for all that balances the need for redevelopment amongst existing user groups. We believe that the project design can be adjusted with time and guidance to a mutually beneficial design.



A zoning map amendment is a legislative decision, and the City of Madison and its commissions have broad discretion when deciding whether to approve, deny, or approve with conditions a zoning map amendment. Accordingly, even if ULI's proposal meets all of the standards of the PD District ordinance, which we don't currently believe is the case, City of Madison approving bodies may take into account other factors that relate to the impact on the community and surrounding properties when deciding to approve, deny or approve with conditions.

At this juncture, we believe that it is incumbent upon Plan Commission members to adjudicate inherent conflicts that exist between the proposed project site and its existing surroundings, especially as it relates to the previous land use approvals the AC Hotel project was granted by UDC and Plan Commission in 2015, having met an "exceptional design" standard resulting in the ninth and tenth floors being allowed to be built with public amenities.

This project will establish a 100-year design choice for a vital intersection of Madison's downtown. If leased up successfully, it will bring up to 2,000 employees to the site and more than that 2,255 net new automobile trips daily, per information provided in ULI's traffic study. A project referral with direction for a massing redesign would be warranted to ensure that significant daily impacts to pedestrians, bicyclists, and existing surrounding users of the space are thoroughly addressed before the project proceeds any further. This project significantly impacts the long views of the State Capitol building from the property on the corner of E Washington Avenue, a priority viewshed.

While the project has undergone some design changes, any adjustments made have not mitigated the negative impacts to our adjacent property and its use. In the conversation at UDC, project representatives testified and expressed hesitation towards developing a mid-block massing alternative design because they didn't know how the Landmarks Commission would respond. We would encourage the project and a mid-block massing proposal to be considered by the Landmarks Commission moving forward. As UDC member Christian Harper pointed out, if the massing was acceptable in relation to the landmarked American Exchange Bank building, the massing should be arguably acceptable for other proximity landmarks by the Landmarks Commission as well. Mr. Harper also provided inciteful comments regarding shifting the building mass mid-block and away from E Washington Avenue to allow for improved solar access and exterior rooftop green space amenities.

Urban Land Interest is seeking a PD rezoning of the space and they are customizing the site to serve their specific interests. Our space serves the general public, with more than 171,000 members of the Madison community and visitors to the city having used our space in 2019 alone. As commission members with jurisdiction on conditional use and rezoning, we implore you to hold this project to a higher community design standard that does not negatively impact the experience of thousands of people that regularly use our space.

Thank you for your diligent review and attention to our concerns.

Sincerely,

Jose & Sara Granados, Owners of Eno Vino Downtown
John Smithe, Owner of Eno Vino Downtown

Petition Signatures 11.4-11.6

Name	WI County	City	State	Postal Code	Country	Signed On
Kjirsten Granowski	Dane	Madison	WI	53703	US	11/4/2020
Melissa Lund	Dane	Madison	WI	53703	US	11/5/2020
Ryan Sinsky	Dane	Madison	WI	53144	US	11/5/2020
Terri Lattimer	Dane	Madison	WI	53704	US	11/4/2020
Sara Shapiro	Dane	Madison	WI	53705	US	11/4/2020
Daniel Pirsch	Dane	Madison	WI	53705	US	11/4/2020
Jamie Brud	Dane	Madison	WI	53711	US	11/5/2020
Amanda Stock	Dane	Madison	WI	53716	US	11/4/2020
Jennifer Cameron	Dane	Madison	WI	53719	US	11/4/2020
Grace Mitchell	Dane	Madison	WI	53719	US	11/4/2020
Janessa Katzenberger	Dane	Madison	WI	53719	US	11/4/2020
Dylan Bristol	Dane	Fitchburg	WI	53711	US	11/4/2020
Brianna Weninger	Dane	Sun Prairie	WI	53590	US	11/4/2020
Allan Esser	Dane	Verona	WI	53593	US	11/4/2020
Kristy Suchomel	Dane	Verona	WI	53593	US	11/4/2020
Sarah Goodchild	Dane	Verona	WI	53593	US	11/5/2020
Nara Doxtater	Brown	Howard	WI	54313	US	11/4/2020
Dustin Lochner	Columbia	Lodi	WI	53555	US	11/4/2020
Rachel Munz	Columbia	Poynette	WI	53955	US	11/4/2020
Danielle Frawley	Jefferson	Whitewater	WI	53190	US	11/4/2020
Sandra Sievert	Jefferson	Whitewater	WI	53190	US	11/4/2020
Cortney Sauter	La Crosse	La Crosse	WI	54601	US	11/4/2020
Chris Gerber	Rock	Janesville	WI	53545	US	11/4/2020
Dorothy Gerber	Walworth	Lake Geneva	WI	53147	US	11/4/2020
T Sayer		Apple Valley	CA	92308	US	11/4/2020
Jackie Escalante		Burbank	CA	91505	US	11/5/2020
Joe Mama		Canoga Park	CA	91304	US	11/4/2020
Shakayla Thomas		Compton	CA	90220	US	11/4/2020
erika millan		Fairfield	CA	94534	US	11/4/2020
Taylor McCollum		Lodi	CA	95240	US	11/5/2020
Hannah Baker		Placerville	CA	95667	US	11/4/2020
Nazira Avila		Roseville	CA	95747	US	11/4/2020
kristin breees		Santa Clara	CA	95051	US	11/5/2020
Ilona Asaturova		Aurora	CO	80247	US	11/4/2020
Josh Chavez		Fort Collins	CO	80526	US	11/4/2020

Petition Signatures 11.4-11.6

Name	WI County	City	State	Postal Code	Country	Signed On
Soyeb Rana		Southington	CT	06489	US	11/4/2020
Siani Amedee		Fort Lauderdale	FL	33301	US	11/4/2020
Tawaskin Abrams		Naples	FL	34117	US	11/4/2020
Vanessa Costa		Orlando	FL	32835	US	11/4/2020
Kriss Upton		Buford	GA	30518	US	11/4/2020
Patrícia Oliveira		Davenport	IA	52804	US	11/4/2020
Dale Swanson		Glenview	IL	60025	US	11/4/2020
Jamie Polinski		Joliet	IL	60432	US	11/4/2020
Michelly Amaral		Lake Zurich	IL	60047	US	11/4/2020
Craig Taylor		Omaha	IL	68104	US	11/4/2020
Jenna Fletcher		Saint Louis	IL	63123	US	11/4/2020
Alexa Milkowski		Sycamore	IL	60178	US	11/4/2020
James Storm		Terre Haute	IN	47803	US	11/4/2020
Lyrae Daybrooke		Lexington	KY	40503	US	11/4/2020
Nathan Kirby		Lexington	KY	40514	US	11/4/2020
Jacob Guthrie		Westlake	LA	70669	US	11/4/2020
zaida zeng		Andover	MA	01810	US	11/4/2020
Peter Kahigian		Haverhill	MA	01832	US	11/4/2020
Calie Bridges		Lowell	MA	01851	US	11/4/2020
Salara Galloway		Baltimore	MD	21225	US	11/4/2020
Joey Nolte		Lost Creek	MD	26385	US	11/4/2020
Dylan Page		Sparrows Point	MD	21219	US	11/4/2020
Toby Winston		Winchester	MD	22602	US	11/4/2020
Sage Knudholt		Grand Rapids	MI	49512	US	11/4/2020
Amy LaValley		Minneapolis	MN	55419	US	11/4/2020
Blake Smith		Minneapolis	MN	55423	US	11/4/2020
Matthew Kearns		Wake Forest	NC	27587	US	11/4/2020
Alex MacPherson		North Conway	NH	03860	US	11/4/2020
Souzi Kasaryan		Bergenfield	NJ	07621	US	11/4/2020
Deborah Ahmad		Egg Harbor Town	NJ	08234	US	11/4/2020
Amy S		Glassboro	NJ	08028	US	11/5/2020
Carol Watts		Williamstown	NJ	08012	US	11/5/2020
Connor Mitchener		Brooklyn	NY	11201	US	11/4/2020
Holly Markson		Brooklyn	NY	11201	US	11/4/2020
Klariez S.		New Hyde Park	NY	11040	US	11/4/2020

Petition Signatures 11.4-11.6

Name	WI County	City	State	Postal Code	Country	Signed On
Marco Junior		New York	NY	10028	US	11/4/2020
Emily Schramm		Watertown	NY	13601	US	11/4/2020
Jayden Cadogan		Yonkers	NY	10701	US	11/4/2020
Nick Armstrong		Colombus	OH	43004	US	11/4/2020
Alyssa Kanuch		Willoughby	OH	44094	US	11/4/2020
Nicole Tupitza		Edinboro	PA	16444	US	11/4/2020
Grace Friedman		Mount Pleasant	SC	29464	US	11/4/2020
Shiny Bee		Memphis	TN	38109	US	11/4/2020
Jaquez Norwood		Arlington	TX	76013	US	11/4/2020
Zaynah Baig		Centreville	VA	20120	US	11/4/2020
Baryalai Zia		Manassas	VA	20109	US	11/4/2020
Tyler Hughes		Evanston	WY	82930	US	11/4/2020
aravinda shetty		(unknown)			US	11/4/2020
Glinda Brown		(unknown)			US	11/4/2020
Aeleen Gutierrez		(unknown)			US	11/4/2020
Mia Waid		(unknown)			US	11/4/2020
Robbie D		(unknown)			US	11/4/2020
Heather Hebert del Cuadro		(unknown)			US	11/4/2020