

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION

PRESENTED: July 27, 2016

TITLE: 109 South Fair Oaks Avenue – PD(GDP-SIP), Adaptive Restoration and Reuse of the Historic Garver Feed Mill Including Micro-Lodging, an Olbrich Storage Building and Gardens. 6<sup>th</sup> Ald. Dist. (38227)

REFERRED:

REREFERRED:

REPORTED BACK:

AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary

ADOPTED:

POF:

DATED: July 27, 2016

ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Richard Wagner\*, Chair; Sheri Carter, Cliff Goodhart, Richard Slayton, Tom DeChant, Dawn O’Kroley and Michael Rosenblum.

\*Wagner recused himself on this item. Slayton acted as Chair.

**SUMMARY:**

At its meeting of July 27, 2016, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL** of a PD(GDP-SIP) for the adaptive restoration and reuse of the Historic Garver Feed Mill located at 109 South Fair Oaks Avenue. Appearing on behalf of the project were Lou Host-Jablonski, Vatsal Desai and Tom Rogers, representing Baum Development. The Secretary noted that the HVAC and rooftop screening issues will be dealt with at the administrative level between the Landmarks Commission, Urban Design Commission staff and Zoning. There are 5 distinct groupings of micro-lodges with varying architectural detail or landscape-based characteristics. The team described the landscaping as being formal, relaxed and transition spaces, with the rain garden cluster being the most relaxed. Some of the plantings are used throughout the site while others are used in certain clusters. For the building façade that faces into the site, the Parks Division wants overhead doors. Material samples were shown including patterned metal panel. Oaks, River Birches, Honey Locusts, mixed grasses and Dogwoods are all proposed for the landscaping around the metal building.

Comments and questions from the Commission were as follows:

- The depth of overhang seems smaller and ends pretty sharply.
  - The rendering isn’t very good, it rolls over and there’s a section with depth and it gives a similar shadow line.
- The roof is a seam ribbed roof?
  - It’s the same material.
- Did the Plan Commission have an issue with the galvanized?
  - No they liked that, but they basically said go and look at historic buildings on the east side, of this era. We found that kind of roof has a bit more heaviness to it.
  - (Wendt) When Plan Commission considered their motion to approve, one of the items that they put as a specific condition was having the UDC look at when this building was over here at the back of the site, it was less of a focus. Coming into the site, the visibility of this building now,

with its simple architecture at such a pronounced location, does that make sense? They specifically asked for this body to take a look at this building in its new context and see if the simplicity of it can be treated architecturally to give it some panache as a potential entry feature coming in. There are historic considerations with the Landmarks Commission.

- We have discussed signage on this piece too to add some curb appeal to the entryway, and wayfinding as well. We'll bring in the signage later.
- Are there skylights in the storage?
  - No, OBS didn't ask for that so we didn't go there.
- What's the landscaping for that building, just two trees, how prevalent will the actual building be?
  - When you drive down here this is lined with trees, 30-40 feet, they will effectively screen until you get up there and look to the right. From here there are existing trees that will remain and we've added trees. Were covering up a bit of the building but were not obscuring the entire building.
- Did you take a look at the connectivity to Starkweather Creek?
  - They were asking if it would still be possible to make this route, and yes there would be room. There's also the bike easement, potential future bike trail, that would wrap around here so there would be access. That was the kayak discussion.
  - Long-range the idea is for a bridge over Starkweather Creek.
- What is the plan for the micro-lodges, more of a hotel or residential lodge?
  - We have a partnership with a hotel operator, so the thought process is that there are these 50 very unique and well-sited homes. The guests will have a large selection of their lodging choice. These would be more hotel-based tenancies, a couple of days.
- I would suggest that the building (storage) be painted an earth tone so it wouldn't contrast so much with the trees in the background. Something shiny and white (galvanized) might be really reflective and pop out more than if it was an earth tone.
- Or look at maybe a weathered zinc coating that wouldn't have such brightness but still has that galvanized look. If we have that as the main color palette of the building, your doors, hardware and window frames, those are the pieces you really need to push as industrial, we want to see the barn door hardware, that's where you need to spend to get the quality pieces. Getting quality industrial functioning pieces, hardware and doors. Your gutters and downspouts, don't do the pre-fab, do a ½ round.
- The placement of vegetation around the building will give us as much panache as you'd want to get from the building itself. That it looks like it was part of the historic treatment of the site.
- The plant material isn't decorating the building, but the building is set in this massive community.
  - Most of the beds are large, they're not framing anything.
- Look at any warmth you can bring to adjacent signage features, doors, windows, maybe you add canopies over the doors so you don't see the modern lights. I'd soften everything you can if you're going to use that galvanized finish.
  - I would anticipate would all relate to one another.

### **ACTION:**

On a motion by O'Kroley, seconded by Rosenblum, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL**. The motion was passed on a vote of (5-0). The motion provided for the following:

- Improving the detail of the industrial-type building.
- Incorporating the landscape comments.
- The louvers should be ganged together so it's longer there on the storage building; the doors and hardware should be exterior mounted.

- Signage shall return to the Commission for approval.
- HVAC and rooftop screening will be dealt with between the Landmarks Commission, Urban Design Commission and Zoning.