PLANNING DIVISION STAFF REPORT

December 4, 2023



PREPARED FOR THE LANDMARKS COMMISSION

Project Name & Address:	101 N Hamilton Street
Application Type(s):	Certificate of Appropriateness for a sign
Legistar File ID #	<u>80838</u>
Prepared By:	Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner, Planning Division
Date Prepared:	November 30, 2023
Summary	
Project Applicant/Contact:	Justin Chamberlin; Vital Signs, Inc.
Requested Action:	The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of an illuminated projecting sign

Background Information

Parcel Location/Information: The subject property is a designated landmark.

Relevant Ordinance Sections:

41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.

- (1) <u>New Construction or Exterior Alteration</u>. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
 - (a) In the case of exterior alteration to a designated landmark, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (b) In the case of exterior alteration or construction of a structure on a landmark site, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (c) In the case of exterior alteration or construction on any property located in a historic district, the proposed exterior alteration or construction meets the adopted standards and guidelines for that district.
 - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City's historic resources.
- (3) Signs. The Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for signs if it finds that the following are true:
 - (a) Signs are located within the façade areas set aside for signs as part of the façade design or are integrated and compatible with the structure where the façade areas have not been set aside for signs;
 - (b) New signs shall be consistent with the traditional signage pattern locations on a structure or a property, and shall feature materials and style of illumination typical of the period of significance for the property or district;
 - (c) Signs shall comply with Chapter 31, MGO;
 - (d) Signs shall comply with specific standards and guidelines adopted for historic districts under this ordinance.

Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation

1. A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment.

- 2. The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.
- 3. Each property shall be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken.
- 4. Most properties change over time; those changes that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved.
- 5. Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved.
- 6. Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.
- 7. Chemical or physical treatments, such as sandblasting, that cause damage to historic materials shall not be used. The surface cleaning of structures, if appropriate, shall be undertaken using the gentlest means possible.
- 8. Significant archeological resources affected by a project shall be protected and preserved. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures shall be undertaken.
- 9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.
- 10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

Analysis and Conclusion

The proposed project is to install an illuminated projecting sign on the side of the Draper Brothers Block building. The Italianate masonry building was constructed in 1867. In 2021, the Landmarks Commission approved a rehabilitation of the building to allow it to continue to adapt for new uses. As part of that approval, there was a concept of projecting signage at approximately the same location as proposed. The commission required that future signage would need to return for an approval.

The proposed signage is illuminated on both sides of the sign face with frosted bulbs that are nested in the projecting frame. This allows a full cut off of the lights in order to comply with City signage and lighting ordinances. Page 18 of the application shows a third sign face that does not show elsewhere in the application materials. A third sign face would not meet the Sign Ordinance.

A discussion of relevant standards follows:

41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.

- (3) <u>Signs</u>. The Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for signs if it finds that the following are true:
 - (a) The signage is located on the side of the building in an area where we would expect to see signage on the building, and it aligns with the previous concept reviewed by the Landmarks Commission in 2021.
 - (b) The new signage aligns with traditional signage patterns of commercial properties on the square and is of a style with historic precedent downtown.

Legistar File ID #80838 101 N Hamilton St December 4, 2023 Page **3** of **3**

- (c) The proposed signage (minus a third face) aligns with Chapter 31, MGO;
- (d) N/A

Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation

- 1. The property is continuing in its commercial use.
- 2. The proposal will not remove historic features or materials.
- 3. While the proposed sign replicates a historic appearance, it will read as a product of its time.
- 4. The project will not change components on the building that have acquired significance over time.
- 5. The work will not destroy distinctive finishes or materials. The signage should be installed in the masonry joints with stainless steel fasteners.
- 6. N/A
- 7. N/A
- 8. N/A
- 9. The new work will read as new and is of a size and location that will integrate with the building.
- 10. If the signage is installed at the masonry joints with stainless steel fasteners, it can be removed in the future without damaging the building.

Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness are met and recommends the Landmarks Commission approve the project with the following conditions.

- 1. Sign will be attached to the building at masonry joints using stainless steel fasteners
- 2. A third sign face is not approved