



Project Address: 1049 Rutledge Street
Application Type: Certificate of Appropriateness for an exterior alteration in an historic district
Legistar File ID # [32001](#)
Prepared By: Amy L. Scanlon, Preservation Planner, Planning Division

Summary

Applicant/Property Owner: Steve Larson

Requested Action/Proposal Summary: The applicant requests that the Landmarks Commission grant a Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of shingle siding on the dormer of the residence located at 1049 Rutledge Street in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District.

Applicable Regulations & Standards: Section 33.19 of the Madison General Ordinances (see below)

Review Required By: Landmarks Commission

Background Information

Parcel Location: The subject site is located in the Third Lake Ridge (local) Historic District and in the Orton Park National Register Historic District.

Relevant Landmarks Ordinance Sections:

33.19(11)(i) Guideline Criteria for Exterior Alteration in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.

1. Alteration of any existing structure shall be evaluated according to all criteria listed in Sec. 33.01(11)(g).
2. Alteration of the surface material, pattern and texture in the facade(s) of any existing structures shall be compatible with the original or existing historical finishes.
3. Alteration of any existing structure shall retain or be compatible with the original or existing historical rhythm of masses and spaces.
4. Alteration of any existing structure shall retain the existing historical landscape plan or shall develop a new plan which is compatible with the plans of the buildings and environment within its visually related area.
5. Alteration of the street facade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical proportional relationships of door sizes to window sizes.

33.19(11) (g) Guideline Criteria for Exterior Alteration in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Commercial Use.

1. Alterations of the height of any existing structure shall be visually compatible with the buildings and environment within its visually related area.
2. Alterations of the street facade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical rhythm of solids and voids.
3. Alterations of the street facade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical materials.
4. Alterations of the roof of any existing structure shall retain its existing historical appearance.

Analysis and Conclusion

A brief discussion of 33.19(11)(i) follows:

1. Section 33.19(11)(g) discussion is below.
2. The shingle siding would provide a different pattern and texture than the existing beveled siding.
3. The historical rhythm of masses and spaces is not being affected.
4. Not applicable.
5. The installation of shingle siding will not affect the original or existing historical proportional relationships of door sizes to window sizes.

A brief discussion of 33.19(11)(g) follows:

1. The height is not being affected by the installation of shingle siding.
2. The installation of shingle siding will not affect the original or existing historical rhythm of solids and voids.
3. The existing beveled siding is presumably the original siding and must remain in situ with the shingle siding installed over it. If the existing siding has another earlier layer of siding below it, the existing beveled siding may be removed and the new siding type must match the existing earlier siding type. The installation of shingle siding does not meet this criterion unless there is earlier shingle siding present underneath. The use of shingle siding on a later rear addition enclosure is not a reason to use the same material on a street facing façade unless there is physical evidence that shingle siding was previously used on the dormer.
4. The roof is not being altered.

Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the exterior alterations are not met and recommends that the Landmarks Commission consider approval of the request only with the following condition of approval:

1. The Applicant shall provide evidence that shingle siding existed on the dormer.