

AGENDA # 5

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: LANDMARKS COMMISSION

PRESENTED: July 6, 2015

TITLE: 2131 Chadbourne Avenue – University Heights Historic District – Convert a sleeping porch into a conditioned space, convert an enclosed porch into an open porch, and other exterior alterations. 5th Ald. Dist.
Contact: Tracy & Cayle Tompkins

REFERRED:

REREFERRED:

REPORTED BACK:

AUTHOR: Amy Scanlon, Secretary

ADOPTED:

POF:

DATED: July 6, 2015

ID NUMBER: 37498

Members present were: Stu Levitan, Chair; Christina Slattery, Jason Fowler, David McLean, and Marsha Rummel

SUMMARY:

Cayle Tompkins, registering in support and wishing to speak. Tompkins explained that they found evidence on site to suggest that the hip roof was framed on the front porch in 1936 and that the parapet was added at that time also. He explained that there is diamond lath on the two known features that relate to the 1936 alterations (the columns above the garage and the front porch parapet). He explained that the removal of the parapet would allow the building to return to a more Dutch Colonial appearance. Tompkins explained that it is difficult to determine what was there in 1923.

Staff clarified the request before the Commission includes the entire treatment of the front porch – the replacement of the French doors, the removal of the windows enclosing the porch, the removal of the parapet and the repair of the stucco if necessary. Staff explained that the proposed roof treatment was not in the Dutch Colonial style and that it is not visually appropriate, but would be better than complete removal. She explained that there was likely a rail structure in this location that was replaced in 1936 and that without knowing the 1923 condition, it would not be appropriate to approve a parapet of conjecture or remove the parapet altogether.

There was general discussion about the treatment of roofs with railings as decorative elements in University Heights.

Tompkins explained that the hip roof is a later addition and that the flat roof is the original design. There was general discussion about the evidence and the proposed exterior alteration work.

McLean suggested that the pent may have been added in 1936.

Darren Vollmer, representing Cayle and Tracy Tompkins, registering in support and available to answer questions.

ACTION:

A motion was made by McLean, seconded by Rummel, to approve the certificate of appropriateness for exterior alterations to the front porch including the replacement of the doors, the removal of the later windows, removal of the existing parapet and the retention of the front porch hip roof as submitted. The motion passed by voice vote.