

AGENDA # 2

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: LANDMARKS COMMISSION

PRESENTED: 1/31/22

TITLE: 704 E Gorham St - Addition to a
Designated Madison Landmark
(Collins House); 6th Ald. Dist.

REFERRED:

REREFERRED:

REPORTED BACK:

AUTHOR: Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner

ADOPTED:

POF:

DATED: 2/7/22

ID NUMBER: 69203

Members present were: Anna Andrzejewski, Richard Arnesen, Katie Kaliszewski, Ald. Arvina Martin, David McLean, and Maurice Taylor.

SUMMARY:

Bob Klebba, registering in support and wishing to speak

David Waugh, registering in support and wishing to speak

Bailey described the proposed work to construct a rear addition with rooftop patio; remove the existing rear shed; replace the rear windows on the 2nd and 3rd floors; replace the roof with metal shingles; and rebuild the front porch brick wall, floor, and cantilevers. She showed plans for the single-story addition off the basement level with a rooftop patio and pointed out that the back of a structure is where we want to see additions. She discussed the materials proposed for the addition, which have a similar architectural vocabulary to the historic structure but are differentiated enough to read as new. She said that she reviewed a sample of the metal shingles and thought they adequately replicated asphalt shingles because of their narrow profile and matte finish. She said that some windows proposed for replacement are nonhistoric, but some are historic windows that look like they could be repaired; if windows are repairable, they should be repaired rather than replaced. She discussed the applicable Secretary of the Interior's Standards and said that staff recommends approval with conditions that replacement brick match the historic in color, size, and composition and all new mortar match the historic/adjacent in profile, color, and composition; cladding on new addition must be stucco, not EIFS; and applicant will work with staff to identify which windows are repairable and which are deteriorated beyond repair, therefore requiring replacement.

Andrzejewski asked for clarification on where the stucco is located. Bailey pointed out areas of proposed stucco on the new addition. Kaliszewski asked where the metal shingles will be installed. Bailey said the applicants are proposing to reroof the historic structure using metal shingles.

Andrzejewski opened the public hearing.

Waugh spoke about their bed and breakfast and their goal of providing guests better connectivity to the lake through this project. They said that the windows on the back of the house are failing; rain can penetrate them during storms and cold air comes in during winter. They said they would work with staff on assessing which windows can be repaired vs. replaced. They described their work on preserving historic properties in Madison.

Klebba spoke about the proposed plans for the addition, which is sympathetic to and distinguished from the historic structure. They said that they will know more about the condition of the windows once their contractor

completes a proposal in spring. In response to staff's recommendations, they agreed that they will definitely use stucco rather than EIFS on the addition.

Kaliszewski asked if the applicants were willing to work with staff on all recommendations in the staff report. Klebba said they were. Andrzejewski clarified that beyond the stucco, the recommendations also included brick matching and looking into window conditions.

Andrzejewski closed the public hearing.

McLean said that he was happy to see this work being done and thanked the applicants for their care of historic properties. Andrzejewski agreed and said that it is work the commission likes to see, in terms of meeting the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, and she was grateful to see projects like this that take care of the city's historic resources.

ACTION:

A motion was made by McLean, seconded by Martin, to approve the request for the Certificate of Appropriateness with the conditions that replacement brick match the historic in color, size, and composition and all new mortar match the historic/adjacent in profile, color, and composition; cladding on new addition must be stucco, not EIFS; and applicant will work with staff to identify which windows are repairable and which are deteriorated beyond repair, therefore requiring replacement. The motion passed by voice vote/other.