

AGENDA # 11

City of Madison, Wisconsin

| | |
|---|--|
| REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION | PRESENTED: March 8, 2006 |
| TITLE: 1135 Erin Street - PUD(GDP-SIP) for 40- Unit Cohousing Project. 13th Ald. Dist. | REFERRED: REREFERRED: REPORTED BACK: |
| AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary | ADOPTED: POF: |
| DATED: March 8, 2006 | ID NUMBER: |

Members present were: Paul Wagner, Chair; Ald. Noel Radomski, Lou Host-Jablonski, Todd Barnett, Lisa Geer, Robert March and Michael Barrett.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of March 8, 2006, the Urban Design Commission **RECEIVED AN INFORMATIONAL PRESENTATION** on a PUD(GDP-SIP) for a 40-unit cohousing project located at 1135 Erin Street. Host-Jablonski abstained from consideration on this item. Appearing on behalf of the project was Roger Smith. The project provides for the development of several combined improved parcels containing six single-family homes, one of which is to be relocated elsewhere on the site to provide for the development of a 13-unit common house and 17-unit residential building including the maintenance of an existing 3-unit building on the combined sites. The development plan combines the collective lots into a residential housing community as part of an overall PUD development by "Arboretum Cohousing" on properties obtained from St. Mary's Hospital. Conceptual details of the proposed common house and Orchard Street residential building were previewed in context with existing residential development on the site's Orchard Street and Erin Street frontages. The cohousing group will develop the common house, Orchard Street residential building and maintain the existing houses on the combined site; where it is anticipated that the relocated home will be developed by Habitat for Humanity. Both the common house and Orchard Street residential facility will be LEEDS certifiable. Following the presentation of the plans, the Commission expressed concerns on the following:

- Create an interaction with surrounding neighborhood and existing residential structures by providing stoops to the street.
- The flat roof section on the Orchard Street residential building appears out of place. Consider some type of framework that takes a look of a gable end or add color to provide more interest.
- The parking garage door is an issue. Consider the extension of an adjoining vertical column to the overlying deck with attention to the look and design of the garage door considered.
- The stairway off of the Orchard Street residential building looks severe; consider combining porches.

ACTION:

Since this was an **INFORMATIONAL PRESENTATION**, no formal action was taken by the Commission.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 6, 9.5.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 1135 Erin Street

| | Site Plan | Architecture | Landscape Plan | Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc. | Signs | Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular) | Urban Context | Overall Rating |
|-----------------------|-----------|--------------|----------------|--------------------------------|-------|-------------------------------------|---------------|----------------|
| Member Ratings | 7 | 6 | 7 | - | - | 6 | 7 | 6 |
| | 10 | 9 | 9 | - | - | 9 | 10 | 9.5 |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |

General Comments:

- Orchard Street façade needs more work. Flat roof brick portion doesn't fit. Stairs look too severe. Make garage door less prominent. Erin Street elevations looks great!
- Nice use of a steep sloping site – relates well to neighborhood.
- Very nice development which references and complements existing neighborhood. One exception: way too much parking for an urban site.