

AGENDA # 1

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	PRESENTED: January 20, 2010	
TITLE: 1574 West Broadway – Comprehensive Design Review of signage for Broadway Station. 14 th Ald. Dist. (17123)	REFERRED:	
	REREFERRED:	
	REPORTED BACK:	
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	ADOPTED:	POF:
DATED: January 20, 2010	ID NUMBER:	

Members present were: Marsha Rummel, Dawn Weber, Todd Barnett, Bruce Woods, Ron Luskin, Jay Ferm, John Harrington, R. Richard Wagner, Richard Slayton and Mark Smith.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of January 20, 2010, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL** of a signage package for 1574 West Broadway. Appearing on behalf of the project was Eric Marty. Prior to the presentation by Marty, staff summarized the issues related to the request for “Comprehensive and Design Review” associated with the development of a uniform signage package for a commercial/retail/office development located on the site. Staff noted that the Urban Design Commission had previously reviewed the actual development proposal at the request of the Plan Commission which, at the time, the project fell below the required square footage providing for its review by the Urban Design Commission as a “Planned Commercial Site/Conditional Use”. The need for the Urban Design Commission’s approval under the provisions for Comprehensive and Design Review are based on a request to provide for signage areas for wall signage that exceed the maximum allowance of 30% of the signable area. It is the applicant’s request to allow for wall signage based on the previous code allowance of 2 square feet per lineal foot a tenant building frontage. Staff noted that use of this provision was eliminated for developments exceeding 25,000 square feet based on the recent adoption of the revised Sign Control Ordinance, Chapter 33, MGO. Marty provided a review of the signage package elements consisting of upper and lower tenant signage as well as a monument style ground sign featuring a multiple tenant display. Marty had noted that there would be an allocation for one wall sign per tenant located above each of the lower level entry doors with limited signable signage areas for the second floor tenancies. The wall signage package consists of both illuminated and non-illuminated signage consisting of individual white-faced lettering both times utilizing a uniform colored backer panel. Marty then provided the review of the details of the multiple tenant monument ground sign which features the name of the center, “Broadway Station” and incorporates the potential for tenant identification panels.

Following the presentation the Commission noted the following:

- The script type on the “Broadway Station” graphic on monument sign is hard to read typographically. Question the use of all capital letters on wall signage. Recommend the use of upper and lower case lettering which is easier to read.
- Question how the varying size and location of wall signs will be justified. For example, centered to right or to the left, Marty noted that they would probably be centered for appearance sake.
- On the upper building signable areas don’t go beyond the edge or border of windows. Marty noted acceptance of this limitation but wanted to base the maximum size of the signable area on the full size

which extend beyond the edges of the window which would not be utilized for the specific location of the sign.

Additional comments by the Commission during deliberation noted the following:

- Need language and motion that provides benchmark for top and bottom of sign by establishing a uniform height and locale of the backer panel with centering the sign vertically and horizontally in the sign bay.
- Tenant signage on monument is too hard to read. The monument sign should be only the “Broadway Station” and address; where other signage is illegible.
- The monument sign’s profile could be more simplified.
- Need to provide a border around the wall signage utilizing the existing brick within the existing inset panel.

ACTION:

On a motion by Wagner, seconded by Luskin, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL**. The motion was passed on a vote of (7-1) with Smith abstaining. The motion required the following:

- The blue coded signable area as proposed for the second floor wall signage are acceptable but the actual location for the signage within the signable area shall not extend beyond the outer edge of the underlying windows.
- The monument sign shall be modified to display the “Broadway Station” text and address only, with no provision for any multiple tenant signage.
- Wall signage on the first floor elevation that is code referenced in red within the packet shall be on panels centered horizontally and vertically with a minimum of 10”-12” clearance on the top and bottom and a 12”-16” side clearance to allow for exposure of the existing materials within the inset panel such as the brick.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 6, 5, 5, 6, 6, 5 and 6.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 1574 West Broadway

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings					6			6
					5			5
								5
					6			
					6			6
					6			6
					5			5
					6			6

General Comments:

- Building signage well integrated with architecture.
- Simplify – get the main “message” out.