



Project Name & Address: 3902 Regent Street, Hoyt Park

Application Type(s): Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations to a Designated Madison Landmark

Legistar File ID # [62824](#)

Prepared By: Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner, Planning Division

Date Prepared: November 10, 2020

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Sarah Close, City of Madison Parks Division

Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the repair of stairs and construction of retaining walls.

Background Information

Parcel Location/Information: The subject site is a Designated Madison Landmark

Relevant State Statute Section:

Wisc SS 62.23(7)(em)2m. In the repair or replacement of a property that is designated as a historic landmark or included within a historic district or neighborhood conservation district under this paragraph, a city shall allow an owner to use materials that are similar in design, color, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities.

Relevant Ordinance Sections:

- 41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS.** A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.
- (1) New construction or exterior alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
 - (a) In the case of exterior alteration to a designated landmark, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (b) In the case of exterior alteration or construction of a structure on a landmark site, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (c) In the case of exterior alteration or construction on any property located in a historic district, the proposed exterior alteration or construction meets the adopted standards and guidelines for that district.
 - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City’s historic resources.

Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation

1. A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment.
2. The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.
3. Each property shall be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken.
4. Most properties change over time; those changes that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved.
5. Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved.
6. Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.
7. Chemical or physical treatments, such as sandblasting, that cause damage to historic materials shall not be used. The surface cleaning of structures, if appropriate, shall be undertaken using the gentlest means possible.
8. Significant archeological resources affected by a project shall be protected and preserved. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures shall be undertaken.
9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.
10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

Analysis and Conclusion

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for replacement of missing or damaged steps on either side of the overlook at Hoyt Park, and introduction of fieldstone retaining walls to prevent additional erosion from the site. Care will be taken to not disturb additional areas of the site or the existing native vegetation.

Hoyt Park was designated as a Madison Landmark in 1995. The site of the park was originally a quarry for Madison sandstone building materials that were used across the city. As quarry operations wound down, the City took control of the property and began to transition the site to becoming a city park. Architects A.F. Nerlinger and Ferdinand Kronenberg designed the site improvements for this Works Progress Administration park site, which was constructed in 1935. Typical of the WPA Rustic style, the park features native stone in all of the structures and site improvements. The overlook features randomly coursed ashlar and stone steps, set onto a hillside with evidence of a rubble foundation.

The proposal is to replace severely deteriorated stone steps with materials that match the existing, install new gravel for the walking paths and install fieldstone retaining walls. Staff walked the site to get a feel for the setting and investigate additional details of the overlook structure. There are occasional blocks of natural, unfinished sandstone throughout the park. The base of the overlook structure appears to have some rubble foundation, which looks like it has deteriorated away down the hillside over time. The introduction of a fieldstone retaining wall to prevent further erosion would fit with the natural setting and the materials found

throughout the site. The current steps do need an intervention in order to provide safe and accessible egress from the overlook to the trails and the method proposed would replace failed materials with appropriate replacements.

A discussion of the relevant standards follows:

Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation

1. There will be minimal changes to the site and the structure in order to preserve the ongoing use of the property as a park site.
2. The proposal would only remove failed materials and replace them in-kind. The additional support to the overlook structure will blend with the natural landscape and prevent further erosion.
3. The proposal would not introduce conjectural details. The fieldstone is fitting to the character of the site, but will read as a new feature. The stone steps will replicate the look of the missing and failed steps on the overlook structure.
4. N/A
5. The retaining wall will provide additional support for the site on which the overlook stands and the replacement of failed steps will help to preserve the remaining historic materials.
6. The proposal will only replace failed materials that cannot be salvaged.
7. N/A
8. There are no known significant archaeological resources in the vicinity of the work, but the proposal is to mitigate any impacts to the landscape architecture of the site, which would also mitigate any impacts to unknown archaeological resources.
9. The new work will be differentiated but compatible with the historic.
10. The fieldstone retaining wall is an addition to the site, but the work could be reversed or altered in the future.

Recommendation

Staff believes the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness are met and recommends that the Landmarks Commission approve the project as proposed.

Staff Site Photos

