



Project Name/Address: 2030 Chadbourne Avenue

Application Type: Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations in historic district

Legistar File ID # [37903](#)

Prepared By: Amy L. Scanlon, Preservation Planner, Planning Division

Date Prepared: April 7, 2015

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Mark Helgeson Collin

Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations involving an addition to the residence in the University Heights Historic District

Background Information

Parcel Location: The subject site is located in the University Heights Historic District.

Relevant Landmarks Ordinance Sections:

33.19(12)(d) Criteria for the Review of Additions, Exterior Alterations and Repairs in TR-C2 and TR-C3 and TR-C4 Zoning Districts.

1. Height. All additions shall be no higher than the existing building; however, if the existing building is already a nonconforming one, no addition shall be made thereto except in accordance with Section 28.192 of the Madison General Ordinances. Roof additions resulting in an increased building volume are prohibited unless they meet the standards in Section 33.19(12)(d)6. and are permitted under Chapter 28 of the Madison General Ordinances, or approved as a variance pursuant to Sections 28.08(2)(e) and 28.12(8)(d) or approved as a conditional use or as part of a planned residential development in accordance with Section 28.184.
2. Second Exit Platforms and Fire Escapes.
3. Repairs. Materials used in exterior repairs shall duplicate the original building materials in texture and appearance, unless the Landmarks Commission approves duplication of the existing building materials where the existing building materials differ from the original. Repairs using materials that exactly duplicate the original in composition are encouraged. (Renum. by ORD-08-00122, 11-22- 08)
4. Restoration.
5. Re-Siding. Re-siding with aluminum or vinyl that replaces or covers clapboards or nonoriginal siding on buildings originally sided with clapboards will be approved by the Landmarks Commission provided that the new siding imitates the width of the original clapboard siding to within one (1) inch and provided further that all architectural details including, but not limited to, window trim, wood cornices and ornament either remain uncovered or are duplicated exactly in appearance. Where more than one layer of siding exists on the building, all layers except the first must be removed before new siding is applied. If insulation is applied under the new siding, all trim must be built up so that it projects from the new siding to the same extent it did with the original siding. (Renum. by ORD- 08-00122, 11-22-08)
6. Additions Visible from the Street and Alterations to Street Facades. Additions visible from the street, including additions to the top of buildings or structures, and alterations to street facades shall be

compatible with the existing building in architectural design, scale, color, texture, proportion of solids to voids and proportion of widths to heights of doors and windows. Materials used in such alterations and additions shall duplicate in texture and appearance, and architectural details used therein shall duplicate in design, the materials and details used in the original construction of the existing building or of other buildings in University Heights of similar materials, age and architectural style, unless the Landmarks Commission approves duplication of the texture and appearance of materials and the design of architectural details used in the existing building where the existing building materials and architectural details differ from the original. Additions and exterior alterations that exactly duplicate the original materials in composition are encouraged. Additions or exterior alterations that destroy significant architectural features are prohibited. Side additions shall not detract from the design composition of the original facade.

7. Additions and Exterior Alterations Not Visible from the Street. Additions and exterior alterations that are not visible from any streets contiguous to the lot lines upon which the building or structure is located will be approved by the Landmarks Commission if their design is compatible with the scale of the existing building and, further, if the materials used are compatible with the existing materials in texture, color and architectural details. Additions and alterations shall harmonize with the architectural design of the building rather than contrast with it. (Renum. by ORD-08-00122, 11-22-08)
8. Roof Shape. The roof shape of the front of a building or structure shall not be altered except to restore it to the original documentable appearance or to add a dormer or dormers in a location and shape compatible with the architectural design of the building and similar in location and shape to original dormers on buildings of the same vintage and style within the district. Alterations of the roof shape of the sides or back of a building or structure shall be visually compatible with the architectural design of the existing building.
9. Roof Material.
 - a. If the existing roof of a building or structure is tile, slate or other material that is original to the building or structure and/or contributes to its historic character all repairs thereto shall be made using the same materials. In addition, in all cases any such roof must be repaired rather than replaced, unless the documented cost of repair exceeds the documented cost of re-roofing with a substitute material that approximates the appearance of the original roofing material as closely as possible, in which case re-roofing with a material that approximates the appearance of the original roofing material as closely as possible will be approved by the Landmarks Commission.
 - b. If the existing roofing material is asphalt shingles, sawn wood shingles or a nonhistoric material such as fiberglass, all repairs shall match in appearance the existing roof material; however, if any such roof is covered or replaced, re-roofing must be done using rectangular sawn wood shingles or rectangular shingles that are similar in width, thickness and apparent length to sawn wood shingles, for example, 3-in-1 tab asphalt shingles. Modern style shingles, such as thick wood shakes, Dutch lap, French method and interlock shingles, that are incompatible with the historic character of the district are prohibited.
 - c. Rolled roofing, tar and gravel and other similar roofing materials are prohibited except that such materials may be used on flat or slightly sloped roofs which are not visible from the ground.

Analysis and Conclusion

Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of the addition to the residence

A brief discussion of the related sections of 33.19(12)(d) follows:

1. Height. The rear addition requires that the ridge height be increased. The submission materials indicate that the height is being increased 3" over the existing ridge height.
2. Second Exit Platforms and Fire Escapes. NA

3. Repairs. NA
4. Restoration. NA
5. Re-Siding. NA The siding on the proposed addition will match the existing adjacent shingle siding.
6. Additions Visible from the Street and Alterations to Street Facades. The only addition/alteration that will be visible from the street relates to the roof alteration. The proposed alteration to the roof is compatible with the existing architectural design of the building. The roof shingles in the area of the roof addition will match the existing adjacent roof shingles and be compatible with other roof materials in the historic district. The roof addition will not destroy significant architectural features.
7. Additions and Exterior Alterations Not Visible from the Street. The addition and the window alteration will not be visible from the street. The design of the addition and the proposed window are compatible with the scale of the existing building and the materials will match the existing materials in texture, color and architectural details.
8. Roof Shape. The overall roof shape will remain a low sloped hipped roof, but the roof shape is technically being changed. The language of this standard allows the roof shape to be modified by the addition of dormers “in a location and shape compatible with the architectural design of the building.” The language also allows alterations of the roof shape of the sides or back of a building if they are visually compatible with the architectural design of the existing building. The roof shape is being modified because of an addition on the back and the ability to modify the roof shape on this roof form with the addition of dormers would not be appropriate.
9. Roof Material. The drawings do not indicate the replacement of the roof shingles, but it is assumed that the proposed addition would suggest that a new roof will be installed at the new roof areas. .

Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed exterior alterations may be met and recommends that the Landmarks Commission approve the requests as submitted.