LANDMARKS COMMISSION MEETING REPORT

December 4, 2023

Agenda Item #: 7

Project Title: Buildings Proposed for Demolition

Legistar File ID #: 75031

Prepared By: Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner

Members: Present: Richard Arnesen, Edna Ely-Ledesma, Molly Harris, Ald. Amani Latimer Burris, Jacob

Morrison, and Maurice Taylor Excused: Katie Kaliszewski

Summary

Ethan Schwenker, registering in support and wishing to speak
Kurt Stege, registering neither in support nor in opposition and wishing to speak
Doug Geurts, registering in support and wishing to speak
Lynn Bjorkman, registering in opposition and not wishing to speak
Arnold Alanen, registering in opposition and not wishing to speak

Kurt Stege, Madison Trust for Historic Preservation, spoke in opposition to the demolition of the six buildings at W Mifflin and N Fairchild Streets.

Applicant Doug Geurts, Hovde, spoke in support of the demolition of the six buildings at W Mifflin and N Fairchild Streets. They said they were willing to include pieces of salvageable terracotta in a future development.

Bailey said that staff recommended a finding of no known historic value for the buildings at 15 Ellis Potter Court and 2413 S Park Street.

Bailey discussed the buildings as 117-125 W Mifflin Street and recommended a finding of historic value for their architectural significance, as buildings that the Keeper of the National Register determined are contributing to a proposed National Register historic district, represent the work of an architect of note (Philip M. Homer), and as an intact example of arcade-style building that is rare in Madison.

Bailey said that the building at 15 N Fairchild Street was part of the Wisconsin Power and Light building, now Hovde Building, facing W Washington Ave before being separately addressed. This wing was the mail room where shipping and receiving was done for Wisconsin Power and Light. The building was designed by Law, Law, and Potter in the Art Deco style. She said that the amended staff recommendation is that the building has historic value related to the vernacular context of Madison's built environment, as the work/product of an architect of note (Law, Law, and Potter), but the building itself is not historically, architecturally, or culturally significant.

Morrison requested confirmation from Hovde that they would include the terracotta elements from the W Mifflin buildings in future development. He said that as the building stands, it is not the same as it was historically and has lost some parapet detail. He asked if they would restore that detail or reuse it as it is currently. Geurts said that terracotta is brittle and tends to crack, so they will try to use a portion of this terracotta or other terracotta elements in the future design. They said they will not know the state of the existing terracotta until they try to remove it, but it could crumble. Morrison asked if they were open to using new terracotta in similar color and dimension to what was there currently. Geurts said they could not commit, but it is something they would be open to.

Arnesen asked if the Hovde Building was a local landmark. Bailey responded that it was not.

Regarding 15 N Fairchild Street, Morrison said that while it is part of the overall building and has some intrinsic value, he didn't think that removing it would diminish the Hovde Building at all. He pointed out that the N Fairchild street front is just blank walls, while the real value lies in the main building facing W Washington Avenue. He didn't think the building facing N Fairchild carried any historic significance.

Latimer Burris suggested they include the action report from the Landmarks Commission's 2019 demolition review of these buildings.

Action

A motion was made by Harris, seconded by Ely-Ledesma, to recommend to the Plan Commission that the buildings at 15 Ellis Potter Court and 2413 S Park Street have no known historic value. The motion passed by voice vote/other. Morrison recused himself from the vote on 15 Ellis Potter Court.

A motion was made by Harris, seconded by Ely-Ledesma, to recommend to the Plan Commission that the buildings at 117 W Mifflin Street, 119 W Mifflin Street, 121 W Mifflin Street, 123 W Mifflin Street, and 125 W Mifflin Street have historic value for their architectural significance, as buildings that the Keeper of the National Register determined are contributing to a proposed National Register historic district, represent the work of an architect of note (Philip M. Homer), and as an intact example of arcade-style building that is rare in Madison. The Landmarks Commission recommends that the applicant preserve as much of the terracotta as possible for future reuse if the building is approved for demolition. The motion passed by voice vote/other, with Taylor voting no.

A motion was made by Morrison, seconded by Taylor, to recommend to the Plan Commission that the building at 15 N Fairchild Street has no known historic value due to a dramatic loss of historic integrity. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

AGENDA#4

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: LANDMARKS COMMISSION PRESENTED: 7/8/19

TITLE: Buildings Proposed for Demolition - 2019 **REFERRED:**

REREFERRED:

REPORTED BACK:

AUTHOR: Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner ADOPTED: POF:

DATED: 7/9/19 **ID NUMBER:** 54302

Members present were: Stuart Levitan, Anna Andrzejewski, Richard Arnesen, Arvina Martin, and David

McLean. Excused was Katie Kaliszewski.

SUMMARY:

Bailey provided background information on the buildings at 119, 121, 123, and 125 W Mifflin Street. She explained that while they are not listed in the National Register, they are considered contributing to the potential State Street National Register Historic District. She said that she received public comments regarding these properties, and people are opposed to the demolition. Arnesen asked if a new project for the site has been submitted. Bailey said that there is no real plan yet, but there are work orders on the property due to deferred maintenance, so the owners are proposing demolition. Arnesen said that the Plan Commission should be against that. Bailey said that the owners are coming up with some temporary use possibilities, but it is in flux. Levitan said that the properties clearly have architectural significance and were determined to be contributing structures in a potential National Register Historic District. Andrzejewski said that the buildings are the work of an architect of note. Levitan said that they are also an intact example of a certain architectural style. Bailey said that one often sees this style of building in other cities, but Madison does not have a lot of buildings with a glazed terra cotta façade.

Bailey said that she received multiple public comments regarding 6226 N Highlands Avenue. While the City and State do not have preservation files on the property, public comments from Alex Saloutos say that the architect of the property, Carl Gausewitz, was a Taliesin fellow. Bailey said that there is a motel and another house associated with the architect, but she has no other information. Andrzejewski said that it is pretty great, and Levitan and Arnesen agreed. Levitan asked if the building itself is architecturally significant, and Andrzejewski and McLean said that they think it is. Andrzejewski said that it is clearly a Taliesin building, and Levitan said that gives it cultural significance as well. Andrzejewski said that there are a lot of similar "meeting house" buildings, so it could also be related to the vernacular context. Bailey said that while the building itself is not historically, architecturally, or culturally significant, and on its own it wouldn't necessarily be called out as a landmark property, it is part of a context. Commission members agreed.

Bailey explained that the property at 645 South Point Road was constructed in 1880, though she does not know the year the barns were built. She pointed out that there are no close-up photos of the house, but one can see a brick chimney and side of a house that looks to be of that era, with later additions on the other side. There was general consensus that the property has no known historic value.

There was brief discussion of the properties at 2711 Waunona Way and 30 Nob Hill Road, and it was determined that they have no known historic value.

ACTION:

A motion was made by Andrzejewski, seconded by McLean, to recommend to the Plan Commission that the buildings at 119 W Mifflin Street, 121 W Mifflin Street, 123 W Mifflin Street, and 125 W Mifflin Street have historic value based on architectural significance, cultural significance, historic significance, as the work/product of an architect of note, its status as a contributing structure in a National Register Historic District, and as an intact or rare example of a certain architectural style or method of construction; the building at 6226 N Highlands Avenue has historic value related to the vernacular context of Madison's built environment, or as the work/product of an architect of note, but the building itself is not historically, architecturally, or culturally significant; and the buildings at 645 South Point Road, 2711 Waunona Way, and 30 Nob Hill Road have no known historic value. The motion passed by voice vote/other.