

ADDENDUM
PLANNING UNIT REPORT
DEPARTMENT OF PLANNING AND DEVELOPMENT
October 31, 2005

ZONING MAP AMENDMENT, I.D. 01851 LOCATED AT 1833 WINNEBAGO STREET:

1. Requested Action: Approval to rezone property from R3 One and Two-Family Residence District to PUD(GDP-SIP) Planned Unit Development-Specific Implementation Plan District to allow for the demolition of four existing residential buildings and the construction of a four-story, 42-unit condominium building.
2. Report Drafted By: Peter Olson, Planner II.

ANALYSIS, EVALUATION AND CONCLUSION:

At their October 10, 2005 meeting the Plan Commission requested additional information regarding this proposed development. Commissioners were concerned that the proposed development exceeded the recommendations of the adopted Schenk-Atwood Neighborhood Business District Master Plan and also exceeded zoning criteria to the extent that this application could not meet the Planned Unit Development District standards. Commissioners requested a comparison of the proposed project with other recently approved projects within the Schenk-Atwood Neighborhood Business District. Staff has compiled a table of recently approved developments located at 1912 Atwood Avenue, 2037 Atwood Avenue, and 2132 Atwood Avenue. All three projects had their General Development Plans submitted prior to the adoption of the Inclusionary Dwelling Unit Ordinance. It should be noted, however, that the Kennedy Place development (also developed by Joe Krupp, the applicant for this development proposal) provided 20% of the dwelling units as affordable housing units at the 50% of County median income level.

All developments are located on sites of less than one acre. The numbers of dwelling units approved yields densities ranging from approximately 53 units per acre to approximately 60 units per acre, compared to this application, which yields 68.4 dwelling units per acre. It should be noted, however, that the projects at 1912 Atwood Avenue and 2037 Atwood Avenue both include first floor office space which would effectively increase the density or intensity of use. The floor to area ratio allows this comparison to be made.

The subject property is proposed to be 4-stories in height. The Kennedy Place development and the apartment building at 2132 Atwood Avenue (aka 280 Division Street) are 4-stories and 3-stories in height, respectively. Both of these developments are located within the heart of the Schenk-Atwood Neighborhood Business District. The development proposal at 1912 Atwood Avenue consists of two phases. Phase one is predominantly two and three-stories in height, with a small fourth floor area for a community room and access to an outdoor rooftop terrace. The second phase of this development will include 50 additional dwelling units and will be a full four-stories in height. This project, as is the subject property, is located on the edge of the

Schenk-Atwood Neighborhood Business District adjacent to existing, predominantly two-story residential buildings.

The floor area ratio (also an indicator of building bulk, along with numbers of dwelling units per acre) varies amongst these four developments. The 4-story Kennedy Place project has a floor area ratio of approximately 1.4. The Nelson housing development at 1912 Atwood Avenue provides a floor area ratio of 1.70, however, with the inclusion of a full fourth story phase two development, this ratio will exceed 2.0 (actual building floor area numbers for phase two are not yet available). The building at 2132 Atwood Avenue provides a floor area ratio of approximately 2.5, however, this building is only three-stories in height and has significant lot coverage. The FAR of Kennedy Point is 2.27.

Building coverage (which reflects building setbacks and surface parking provisions) ranges from a low of 0.48 for the Kennedy Place development to a high of 0.84 for the 280 Division Street apartment development. The Kennedy Point proposal at 0.75 is toward the upper end of this building coverage range. It should also be noted that the building coverage ratio for the Nelson Housing development at 1912 Atwood Avenue will increase once the phase two building is constructed due to its larger size and inclusion of a large entry plaza with the phase one development.

The building coverage ratio is also related to the amount of usable open space being provided, except that open balconies and rooftop decks may also be included in the usable open space calculation. A comparison of the ratio of the usable open space required to support the quantity of dwelling units provided versus the amount of usable open space actually provided by the development proposal ranges from a low of 0.31 for the 280 Division Street apartment project, to a high of 0.44 for the Nelson Housing apartment project. This specific application (Kennedy Point), with a ratio of 0.40, compares favorably with the other three approved development projects within the Schenk-Atwood Neighborhood Business District.

The proposed development provides a total of 58 off-street parking stalls, all contained within an underground parking garage. No surface parking stalls for delivery or visitor use are provided on this property. The applicant has informed staff that he has negotiated with Trinity Lutheran Church who own an off-street parking facility located approximately one block northwest of the subject property to utilize their surface parking facility during non-church peak use hours for short-term parking needs. Both the Nelson Housing project and the Kennedy Place project provided surface parking facilities. Both of these developments, however, also provide first floor office space and a significant portion of the surface parking facility is devoted to office use. The apartment building at 2132 Atwood Avenue does not provide any surface parking facilities and relies on the drive aisle as a loading zone. The subject property also provides a loading zone for large vehicles (e.g. moving vans) within the drive aisle approach to the underground parking garage. The off-street parking provision, devoted to the residential uses for these projects, range from a ratio of 1.13 parking stalls per dwelling unit to a high of 1.46 parking stalls per dwelling unit. This application, which provides 1.38 parking stalls per dwelling unit compares favorably with these other approved projects.

At the time of the preparation of the Schenk-Atwood Neighborhood Business District Master Plan during the summer and fall of 2000, the subject property was identified as a prime redevelopment site which could accommodate 18-20 dwelling units, possibly of affordable

10-11

housing. The other three projects included within this evaluation table are also within the boundaries of the Schenk-Atwood Neighborhood Business District Master Plan. The property at 1912 Atwood Avenue was envisioned for senior housing with a total of 40-60 dwelling units. The General Development Plan approval for this site includes a total of 89 market rate apartment units and 7,775 square feet of office space at a density of 59 units per acre. The subject property as discussed in the original staff report exceeds the original master plan recommendation by a ratio of approximately 2.1 to 2.33. This compares favorably to the Nelson Housing apartment development approval. The Kennedy Place and 280 Division Street developments do not have specific density recommendations within the master plan. These two sites were identified as a four-story mixed-use development site and a three-story mixed-use development site, respectively. It is difficult to make direct comparisons between these two developments and the subject property relative to the master plan recommendations, however, the 280 Division Street apartment project does exceed the Kennedy Point development proposal, both in floor area ratio and in building coverage on the site, while providing a smaller off-street parking ratio per dwelling unit and a smaller usable open space ratio versus that required by the Zoning Code to support the number of dwelling units provided.

In summary, staff are led to conclude by these statistics that the proposed development does not vastly exceed the development intensity of other recently approved developments which are also located within the area covered by the Schenk-Atwood Neighborhood Business District Master Plan.

A Comparison of 1833 Winnebago Street with Other Recent Schenk - Atwood Developments

ADDRESS	1912 ATWOOD	2037 ATWOOD	2132 ATWOOD	1833 WINNEBAGO
PROJECT NAME	<u>NELSON HOUSING</u>	<u>KENNEDY PLACE</u>	<u>280 DIVISION ST</u>	<u>KENNEDY POINT</u>
APPROVAL DATE	October, 2004*	June, 2003	May, 2003	(Pending)
LOT SIZE (Sq Ft)	28579 (Phase 1)	42952	11094	26745
ACRES	0.656	0.986	0.255	0.614
# DWELLING UNITS	39 (+7,775 Office)	52 (+19,000 Office)	15	42
DENSITY (DU/ACRE)	59.44	52.74	58.90	68.41
# BEDROOMS	60 (phase 1)	82	57	62
# IZ UNITS	0 (Exempt)*	10**	0 (Exempt)*	0 (Waiver Request)
STORY HEIGHT	2&3 (Phase 2 = 4)	4	3	4
TOTAL BLDG SQ FT	48570 (Phase 1)	60674	28089	60648
FLOOR AREA RATIO	1.70	1.41	2.53	2.27
GROUND FLR AREA	20130	20724	9363	20184
BLDG COVERAGE	0.59	0.48	0.84	0.75
GARAGE PARKING	46	98	17	58
SURFACE PARKING	37	46	0	0
TOT PARKING	83	144	17	58
PARKING RATIO ***	1.46	1.23	1.13	1.38
U.O.S. PROVIDED	4220	4622	1360	4003
U.O.S. REQUIRED	9600	11360	4320	10080
U.O.S. RATIO	0.44	0.41	0.31	0.40
FRONT YARD	5'	2'	5'	11'
SIDE YARDS	0' & 0'	7' & 0'	3' & 3'	12' & 1'-8"
REAR YARD	(Large - for Phase 2)	71'	12'	0
NEIGH PLAN	Senior Housing - 40 to 60 Units	4 Sty - Mixed Use	3 Sty - Mixed Use	18-20 Units

* GDP approved prior to IZ requirements

** 20% of units (per project letter of intent)

*** Net residential parking ratio (less office parking requirement)

10-11