



Project Name/Address: 138 S Franklin
Application Type: Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alteration and addition in historic district
Legistar File ID # [43002](#)
Prepared By: Amy L. Scanlon, Preservation Planner, Planning Division
Date Prepared: June 1, 2016

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Daniel Gorman
Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed exterior alteration which includes the removal of a portion of the residence and an addition in the First Settlement Historic District.

Background Information

Parcel Location: The subject site is located in the First Settlement Historic District.

Relevant Landmarks Ordinance Section:

41.26 FIRST SETTLEMENT HISTORIC DISTRICT.

- (5) Standards for the Review of Exterior Alterations and Repairs. All additions, exterior alterations and repairs must be compatible with the historic character of the structure and the First Settlement Historic District. The standards listed below are intended to maintain a historically accurate appearance. Modern materials that do not meet the exact requirements of the standards but which duplicate the historic appearance may be considered on an individual basis for a variance as listed in sec. 41.19 of this chapter.
- (a) Porches. Porches that are original to the structure, or that pre-date 1930 and blend with the historic character of the structure, shall be retained, rehabilitated or rebuilt to match the original in all details. Porches on street facades may be enclosed with wood-framed screens, on the condition that the railing must be retained or restored in a design compatible with the historic character of the structure. Porches on street facades shall not be enclosed as a heated space. If a porch is on a street facade and the owner can demonstrate to the Landmarks Commission that it is beyond repair, then a new porch must be constructed in its place. Construction of new porches to approximate the dimensions of original porches is encouraged.

All porches shall present a finished appearance, e.g., all floor joists shall be hidden from view and all porches shall be finished with ceilings and frieze boards. Porch ceilings shall have the appearance of narrow beaded boards, unless another original material is approved by the Landmarks Commission. First floor porch flooring shall be tongue-in-groove boards; carpeting and two-by-four (2 x 4) decking are prohibited. All wood on exterior porches, except flooring and stair treads, shall be painted or opaque stained.

All railings on porches shall be constructed of wood, or another material that duplicates the appearance of wood, with top and bottom rails. Bottom rails shall be raised above the floor level and shall be no higher than three and one-half (3 1/2) inches from the floor. All balusters on porch railings shall be square posts, unless the owner can demonstrate to the Landmarks Commission that a different design is original to the structure. If the building code requires a forty-two (42) inch high railing, the lower portion of the railing may be solid framed panels. Railings on stairways may be either wood to match the railings on the porch or wrought iron with one-by-one (1 x 1) plain vertical balusters. Twisted or other decorative wrought iron is prohibited. All balusters shall be constructed such that a four (4) inch ball may not pass through the railing at any point. All balusters shall be located in between the top and bottom rail and shall not extend across the face of either. Siding on porch rails is prohibited unless the existing rail is sided. Porch posts shall be trimmed with decorative molding at the top and bottom of the posts.

All porches and stairways shall be enclosed between the frieze under the first floor and the ground with a framed lattice of crisscross design, narrow vertical boards or other openwork design. The lattice shall be designed such that a three-(3) inch ball could not pass through any portion of the lattice. All stairways shall have solid wood risers.

Porches on street facades may be enclosed by storm windows. Storm windows on porches shall have the appearance of double-hung windows, with or without a transom, and shall fill the space between the top of the railing and the upper frieze board. When porches are enclosed, the railing area underneath may be filled in with solid framed panels. Porches on street facades shall not be enclosed as a four-season heated space.

- (b) Decks. Decks in rear yards will be approved by the Landmarks Commission provided that the design complies with par. 1., except that tongue-in-groove flooring is not required. Decks in front and side yards may be permitted if they are not replacing an entrance porch, do not detract from the historic character of the structure and neighborhood, and if they comply with par.1.
- (c) Accessibility Ramps. Not applicable
- (d) Windows. On the front facade and on side facades within ten (10) feet of the front facade, all original windows or pre-1930 windows that are compatible with the historic character of the structure shall retain their existing historic size, appearance, and trim detail. If any of the original windows or pre-1930 windows that are compatible with the historic character of the structure have true divided lights (i.e., with small panes of glass between muntin bars), replacement sash shall duplicate the existing appearance and have true divided lights. If windows have been altered in the past, restoration to the original appearance is encouraged. On side facades not within ten (10) feet of the front facade and on rear facades of the structure, the sills of original windows or pre-1930 windows that are compatible with the historic character of the structure may be raised to serve bathrooms and kitchens. In other respects, the design shall duplicate the original appearance of the existing window. On side facades more than ten (10) feet from the front facade and on rear facades, new windows in locations where no window previously existed may be approved, provided they retain a similar ratio of height to width as original windows on the structure, are the same type of window as others on the structure (e.g., double-hung or casement), and are trimmed and finished to match the appearance of the other windows.
- (e) Entrance Doors. If the entrance door is original or is pre-1930 and blends with the historic character of the structure, it should be retained unless the owner can demonstrate to the Landmarks Commission that it is beyond repair. Metal doors may be

approved, provided they blend with the historic appearance of the structure. Unpaneled, modern-style doors, and doors with a fake wood grain are prohibited. All doors shall be painted or varnished.

- (f) Double or Multiple Doors. Not applicable
- (g) Storm Windows and Doors. Storm windows and doors shall be enameled, painted or otherwise coated with a colored surface to resemble a painted surface. Raw aluminum or other metallic finishes on storm windows and doors are prohibited. Painted or varnished storm doors of wood and glass to match the original design on the structure or on similar structures in the district are encouraged. Storm doors of simple design with no stylistic references may be used. Full view storm doors will be permitted. Storm doors with metal grills are prohibited.
- (h) Skylights. Not applicable.
- (i) Roof Materials. Reroofing shall be done with asphalt. Fiberglass or other rectangular composition shingles similar in appearance to 3-in-1- tab asphalt shingles. Sawn wood shingles also may be approved. Modern style shingles such as thick wood shakes, Dutch lap, French method, and interlock shingles are prohibited. Vents shall be located as inconspicuously as possible and shall be similar in color to the color of the roof. Rolled roofing, tar-and-gravel, rubberized membranes, and other similar roofing materials are prohibited, except that such materials may be used on flat or slightly sloped roofs that are not visible from the ground.
- (j). Dormers and Other Roof Alterations. New dormers shall match the appearance of original dormers on the structure in roof shape and material, width of overhang, siding, window design, and trim details whenever feasible. If the original roof shape is not practical, another shape may be approved, provided that it does not detract from the historic character of the structure or the neighborhood. New dormers shall be no less than twelve (12) feet from the front edge of the roof. The ridge line of a new dormer shall not extend above the ridge line of the main roof of the structure unless such higher roof line is not visible from the ground. Shed dormers behind existing dormers or gables on non-street sides of the structure may be approved, provided that the roof material, siding, window design and trim details match the original features of the structure. Other roof alterations shall be compatible with the roof shape and other historic features of the structure, such as siding and trim details, and shall not extend above the ridge line of the structure unless such extension is not visible from the ground.
- (k) Chimneys. The exterior appearance of original or pre-1930 chimneys visible from the street shall be maintained in good repair. The removal of the exterior portions of such chimneys is prohibited. Chimneys not visible from the street may be removed. New chimneys shall be constructed of brick, stone, stucco, or other compatible material. Metal chimneys are prohibited.
- (l) Siding. Original wood siding or pre-1930 siding that blends with the historic character of the structure shall be retained and restored as necessary, except that if the owner can demonstrate to the Landmarks Commission that the original siding is beyond repair, it may be replaced with wood, composite wood, or concrete clapboard siding to match the original or existing pre-1930 appearance. Restoration of original wood decorative details is encouraged. Soffits may be replaced or sided with wood or artificial materials, provided the appearance of the proposed material matches as closely as possible the original appearance.

Original brick, stone and stucco siding shall be retained. Installation of artificial siding on such structures is prohibited. Painting of unpainted brick is prohibited. Mortar and other materials used in brick repair shall match the original in color, hardness, and appearance.

- (m) Foundations. All original foundation masonry, such as brick, stone, or rusticated concrete block, shall be retained unless the owner can demonstrate to the Commission that significant repairs are required, in which case replacement with materials to duplicate the original appearance is encouraged. If duplicating the original appearance is not practical, other materials may be approved, provided they blend with the historic character of the structure and the district.
- (n) Additions. Additions on the front of the structure are prohibited, except for open porches. Additions on the sides or rear shall be permitted if they are compatible with the structure in architectural design, scale, color, texture, proportion and rhythm of solids to voids, and proportion of widths to heights of doors and windows. Additions that exactly duplicate the original materials in composition are encouraged. Additions that destroy significant architectural features are prohibited. Side additions shall not detract from the design composition of the main facade. Siding on new additions shall be the same as the structure, unless the structure is masonry, in which case narrow-gauge clapboards will be permitted. Foundation material on additions shall duplicate the original foundation material whenever practical. Other foundation materials may also be permitted, provided they do not detract from the historic character of the structure.
- (o) Fire Escapes and Rescue Platforms. Fire escapes and rescue platforms shall be located such that they are as unobtrusive from the street as possible. No fire escapes or rescue platforms shall be permitted on the front facade of a structure unless the owner can demonstrate to the Landmarks Commission that no other location is practical. The design of fire escapes and rescue platforms shall comply with the requirements of par. 1., except that balusters on fire escapes and second exit platforms may be metal with one-by-one plain vertical balusters, painted to blend with the colors of the structure. Twisted or other decorative wrought iron is prohibited.
- (p) Lighting Fixtures. Lighting fixtures that are visible from the street shall be of a design that is compatible with the historic appearance of the structure.
- (q) Permanently Installed Air Conditioners. Permanently installed air conditioners shall be as inconspicuous as possible. Ground air conditioners shall be screened with landscaping where possible.
- (r) Shutters. Not applicable
- (s) Repairs. Repairs to structures shall either match the existing or the original appearance. Restoration to the original appearance is encouraged.
- (t) Alterations to Post-1930 Structures. Not applicable

Analysis and Conclusion

As described in the submission materials, the applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the removal of the rear one story shed roof portions of the existing residence and the construction of a rear addition.

According to the preservation file, the existing residence was constructed circa 1880 as an investment property for George B. Smith and W.L. Smith who were a family of prominent attorneys. The preservation file also notes that during the survey performed in 1983, there were abstract floral motifs in the bargeboard and original windows present.

A brief discussion of the standards of 41.26(5) follows:

- (a) Porches. It is unlikely that the existing front porch is original, but the porch may be the same size and/or in the location of the original porch. Portions of the existing porch may pre-date 1930, but it has been altered and the resulting porch does not complement the historic character of the residence. . The

existing front porch is on the side of the gabled building on the street facade and does not run along the entire length of the side of the residence. The proposed new front porch is located away from the front corner. To meet this ordinance standard, staff believes the proposed porch should have a similar width as the existing porch and have the same relationship with the street façade elevation.

The front porch for the residential unit toward the back is shown in elevation with an upper deck, but without a door to access the deck. In addition, the floor plans do not show a deck or roof at the upper level of this porch. The Applicant shall confirm the treatment of this porch at the upper level.

It is not clear from the submission materials that the porch floor joists will be hidden from view by the use of a narrow beaded board ceiling. The submission materials call out 5/4 x 6 composite deck boards instead of tongue and groove boards as specified in the ordinance and the deck board and column materials are called out as composite materials instead of wood with painted or opaque stained finish.

The porch railings are proposed to be constructed of composite materials that appear to duplicate the appearance of wood with a few exceptions that should be discussed. The composite collar trim at the newel posts and columns does not have the appearance of traditional wood construction methods. The collar trim does not meet the standard of having the porch posts trimmed with decorative molding at the top and bottom of the posts.

The submission materials indicate that the lower portions of the porches will be covered with framed lattice panels. In the development of the construction details, staff encourages the applicant to construct the lattice panels with a frame that can be attached to the porch structure. The submission materials do not indicate the material to be used on the porch stairs.

- (b) Decks. The entrance porch related to the residential unit located in the back could have 5/4 x 6 deck boards, but all other comments related to porches are applicable to this porch.
- (c) Accessibility Ramps. Not applicable
- (d) Windows. The submission materials indicate that all windows are being replaced. The windows on the front façade will retain their existing historic location, size, appearance, and trim detail. All other proposed windows will retain a similar ratio of height to width as original windows and will be the same window type. The submission materials show the window trim “picture-framed” around the windows which does not match the appearance of the traditional window. The windows should have a projecting show sill with head and jamb trim that terminates into the top of the show sill. The head and jamb trim should not be mitered. The submission materials indicate that the windows on the front façade will have trim details that match the existing original trim. The submission materials also show a slider window at the rear basement areaway and an opening on the front elevation that should be discussed.
- (e) Entrance Doors. The submission materials do not provide any information about the existing entrance door except that its location is being removed and infilled. The applicant shall provide information about the existing entrance door for Commission review. The ordinance states, “If the entrance door is original or is pre-1930 and blends with the historic character of the structure, it should be retained unless the owner can demonstrate to the Landmarks Commission that it is beyond repair.” The submission materials show 6 paneled exterior doors, but the material of the doors is unspecified. The applicant shall provide information about proposed new exterior doors.
- (f) Double or Multiple Doors. Not applicable
- (g) Storm Windows and Doors. Storm windows and storm doors are not specified in the submission materials and are therefore not approved.
- (h) Skylights. Not applicable.
- (i) Roof Materials. Reroofing shall be done with asphalt. Fiberglass or other rectangular composition shingles similar in appearance to 3-in-1- tab asphalt shingles. Sawn wood shingles also may be approved. Modern style shingles such as thick wood shakes, Dutch lap, French method, and interlock shingles are prohibited. Vents shall be located as inconspicuously as possible and shall be similar in color to the color of the roof. Rolled roofing, tar-and-gravel, rubberized membranes, and other similar roofing materials are prohibited, except that such materials may be used on flat or slightly sloped roofs that are not visible from the ground.

- (j) Dormers and Other Roof Alterations. The roof of the existing historic resource is not being altered. The rear addition is taller than the existing ridge and the addition will be visible from the ground. Generally, the roof of the addition is compatible with the existing roof in slope, material, and form. The addition roof has compatible but different eave details to differentiate it from the historic portion.
- (k) Chimneys. The non-original, but possible pre-1930 existing chimney will remain.
- (l) Siding. The existing siding is non-original composite siding known as transite. The submission materials do not indicate if the original wood siding is under the transite or if the original siding or transite siding is in a condition that could be repaired. The applicant is proposing to remove the existing non-original siding and install new vinyl siding. The ordinance allows the use of wood, composite wood, or concrete clapboard replacement siding if the original siding is beyond repair. It does not allow vinyl siding. As the non-original siding is removed, the applicant shall document ghosts and nailing patterns that will inform the location of missing original decorative features and craftsmanship.
- (m) Foundations. The existing foundation is parged and the original foundation material is unknown. The submission materials indicate that the existing foundation is concrete block which may be inconsistent with the original construction date of 1880. The existing foundation walls are being retained. The proposed addition will have poured concrete walls that will have a similar appearance to the parged existing walls.
- (n) Additions. The addition is a rear addition, but it is visible from the sides and the front. Generally the addition is compatible with the historic resource in architectural design, scale, color, texture, proportion and rhythm of solids to voids, and proportion of widths to heights of doors and windows. The construction of the addition requires the removal of existing one-story shed roof portions on the rear, but these portions do not appear to be significant architectural features. While the addition is visible from the side, it is set behind the existing resource which allows the main façade of the historic resource to read along the street without the proposed addition detracting from its historic context. The design of the main façade is affected by the rear addition, but it is not affected in a negative way as the language of this standard suggests.
- (o) Fire Escapes and Rescue Platforms. The applicant is treating the upper level of the front porch as a potential rescue platform, but not in the way that this standard intends; therefore, this standard is not applicable.
- (p) Lighting Fixtures. The submission materials do not specify any exterior light fixtures; therefore, fixtures are not being approved at this time.
- (q) Permanently Installed Air Conditioners. The site plan shows that exterior HVAC equipment will be located on the north elevation. The site plan does not indicate landscape screening or other screening.
- (r) Shutters. Not applicable
- (s) Repairs. The proposed alterations to the structure are more involved than a repair. Generally, the alterations to the existing historic resource will match the existing or original appearance.
- (t) Alterations to Post-1930 Structures. Not applicable

Recommendation

Staff believes that there is currently not enough information to conclude that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the removal of the rear one-story shed roof portions and the construction of the rear addition and related alterations are met and recommends that the Landmarks Commission refer the request to a future meeting to allow the applicant to provide additional information.

If the Commission finds that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness may be met with the information provided by the Applicant at the meeting, staff recommends that the Landmarks Commission approve the Certificate of Appropriateness with the following conditions of approval:

1. Work with staff to finalize all details related to this staff report and the relevant discussion of this item during the Landmarks Commission meeting.

2. The Applicant shall modify the proposed front porch to have a similar width as the existing porch and have the same relationship with the street façade elevation as the existing porch.
3. The front porch for the residential unit toward the back is shown in elevation with an upper deck, but without a door to access the deck. In addition, the floor plans do not show a deck or roof. The Applicant shall confirm the treatment of this porch.
4. The Applicant shall confirm the treatment and materials of porch components to meet the ordinance standards including that the porch floor joists will be hidden from view by the use of beaded board ceilings, the use of tongue and groove deck boards, and the use of wood deck boards and columns with painted or opaque stained finish.
5. The Applicant shall provide information about the materials and details to be used on the stairs.
6. The Applicant shall provide information about the existing entrance door for Commission review. The ordinance states, "If the entrance door is original or is pre-1930 and blends with the historic character of the structure, it should be retained unless the owner can demonstrate to the Landmarks Commission that it is beyond repair."
7. The Applicant shall provide additional information about the proposed exterior doors.
8. The Applicant shall provide information about exterior light fixtures for staff review and possible approval.
9. The Applicant shall describe proposed screening for the exterior HVAC equipment.
10. As the non-original siding is removed, the applicant shall document "ghosts" and nailing patterns that will inform the original craftsmanship and possible locations of missing original decorative features.
11. The Landmarks Commission shall discuss the use of the slider window at the rear basement areaway and the Applicant shall modify drawings to reflect the Commission's discussion as needed.
12. The Landmarks Commission and the Applicant shall discuss the treatment of an existing masonry opening in the foundation of the front elevation.