



Project Name/Address: 2112 Regent Street

Application Type: Certificate of Appropriateness for new construction in University Heights Historic District

Legistar File ID # [53581](#)

Prepared By: William Fruhling, Acting Preservation Planner, Planning Division

Date Prepared: November 14, 2018

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Barbara Fischer

Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a garage in the University Heights Historic District

Background Information

Parcel Location: The subject site is located in the University Heights Historic District.

Relevant State Statute Section:

Wisc SS 62.23(7)(em)2m. In the repair or replacement of a property that is designated as a historic landmark or included within a historic district or neighborhood conservation district under this paragraph, a city shall allow an owner to use materials that are similar in design, color, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities.

Relevant Historic Preservation Ordinance Sections:

- 41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS.** A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.
- (1) New construction or exterior alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
 - (a) In the case of exterior alteration to a designated landmark, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (b) In the case of exterior alteration or construction of a structure on a landmark site, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (c) In the case of exterior alteration or construction on any property located in a historic district, the proposed exterior alteration or construction meets the adopted standards and guidelines for that district.
 - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City's historic resources.

41.24 UNIVERSITY HEIGHTS HISTORIC DISTRICT.

41.24 UNIVERSITY HEIGHTS HISTORIC DISTRICT.

(4) Standards for the Review of New Structures in the TR-V1, TR-V2, TR-U1, TR-U2, TR-C2, TR-C3, TR-C4, MNX, TSS, and LMX Zoning Districts.

(a) Principal Structures.

2. Materials. Materials for the exterior walls shall be the same as or similar to materials prevalent in the University Heights Historic District. Permitted materials include brick, narrow gauge horizontal clapboards four or less inches in exposed width, stone, stucco, smooth shingles or combinations of the above provided the combinations occur in a manner and location similar to the materials on existing structures in University Heights (e.g., brick on first floor with clapboard on second floor). Other materials, such as aluminum or vinyl must be visually compatible with structures within two hundred (200) feet of the subject property. The following materials are prohibited: concrete block, asbestos, wide clapboards over four inches in exposed width, diagonal boards, vertical boards, rough sawn wood, rough split shingles, shakes.

(b) Accessory Structures. Accessory structures, as defined in Section 28.211, MGO, shall be compatible with the design of the existing structures on the zoning lot, shall not exceed fifteen (15) feet in height and shall be as unobtrusive as possible. No accessory structure shall be erected in any yard except a rear yard. Exterior wall materials shall be the same as those for construction of new principal structures as set forth in sec 41.24(4)(a)2.

Analysis and Conclusion

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a 22' x 14' detached garage in the rear yard of the house at 2112 Regent Street. The location, size, and design of the garage are appropriate. Pursuant to an email from the applicant (dated October 22, 2018) included in the submittal materials, the siding materials will be smooth faced with a four inch reveal. A subsequent phone conversation with the applicant confirmed that the siding material will be fiber cement and the shingles will be asphalt to match the house.

A discussion of the relevant ordinance section of Chapter 41.24 follows:

41.24 UNIVERSITY HEIGHTS HISTORIC DISTRICT.

41.24 UNIVERSITY HEIGHTS HISTORIC DISTRICT.

(4) Standards for the Review of New Structures in the TR-V1, TR-V2, TR-U1, TR-U2, TR-C2, TR-C3, TR-C4, MNX, TSS, and LMX Zoning Districts.

(b) Accessory Structures. The design of the proposed garage is compatible with the design of the house on the zoning lot and is in an unobtrusive location at the end of the existing driveway in the rear yard. The proposed garage is less than fifteen (15) feet in height. The siding material will be a smooth faced fiber cement clapboard. Although the clapboard siding on the house has a wider exposure, the proposed garage siding will have a 4-inch exposure.

Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed new construction are met and recommends that the Landmarks Commission approve the request subject to the following condition:

- 1) The overhead door, service door, and window specifications shall be submitted for approval by staff. Staff recommends that the overhead door not include square panels, but utilize flush horizontal panels, although windows as shown are permissible.