

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION

PRESENTED: June 25, 2014

TITLE: 4802 East Washington Avenue -
Exterior Remodeling in UDD No. 5 for
"Ginza's of Tokyo." 17th Ald. Dist.
(34430)

REFERRED:

REREFERRED:

REPORTED BACK:

AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary

ADOPTED:

POF:

DATED: June 25, 2014

ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Richard Wagner, Chair; Cliff Goodhart, Lauren Cnare, Tom DeChant, Melissa Huggins and Richard Slayton.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of June 25, 2014, the Urban Design Commission **REFERRED** consideration of an exterior remodeling in UDD No. 5 located at 4802 East Washington Avenue. Appearing on behalf of the project was Travis Malneg, representing Richard Lynn Properties. The Secretary noted that remodeling and extension of the parapet had begun at this site without permits over one year ago. This was a building with a large horizontal sign band that has now been extended to make it higher. The applicant is looking to screen HVAC equipment so extended the parapet, which in effect gives a larger sign band area. They would also be adding five windows to the front of the building. The building will be painted and "cleaned up" with an EIFS product.

Comments and questions from the Commission were as follows:

- The current sign band seems more proportional to the building, even if you see the rooftop. This picture here is very heavy. It looks like a building with heavy eyebrows.
- The building is top heavy with the detailing of the cornice not appropriate to the building.
- You should look for more vertical elements to break up the horizontal façade.
- It looks like 50/50. The bottom edge could go up a foot or two. I'm not sure what the cornice, that detailing is doing. It doesn't seem appropriate to the building.
- It looks like an EIFS building sitting on a masonry building or base. If that is a load-bearing block wall, why not continue that up like what I see in the original photo, and then bring a sign band out in front of it. When it comes around to the side it won't be so abrupt and you won't have that funky cornice thing at the top.
- This to me is not an enhancement.
- Extend the sign band with masonry, not EIFS.

ACTION:

On a motion by Huggins, seconded by Slayton, the Urban Design Commission **REFERRED** consideration of this item in order to address comments made on the project and the following:

- Extend with masonry not EIFS, with no decorative form on the cornice.
- Consider metal frame parapet wall with sign band attached to the front as was previously shown; use metal panel as sign band.

The motion was passed on a vote of (5-0).

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall rating for this project is 5.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 4802 East Washington Avenue

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	-	5	-	-	-	-	-	5