

AGENDA # 5

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	PRESENTED: September 5, 2007
TITLE: 336 South Point Road – Public Building; New Fire Station No. 12. 9 th Ald. Dist. (07436)	REFERRED: REREFERRED: REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	ADOPTED: POF:
DATED: September 5, 2007	ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Paul Wagner, Jay Ferm, Bruce Woods, Marsha Rummel, Todd Barnett and Lou Host-Jablonski.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of September 5, 2007, the Urban Design Commission **RECEIVED AN INFORMATIONAL PRESENTATION** on a public building, new fire station located at 336 South Point Road. Appearing on behalf of the project were Steve Kieckhafer and John Holz.

According to Kieckhafer the project provides for the construction of a new Madison Fire Department Station #12 to be located on South Point Road on City-owned property which currently contains a salt storage and brush collection facility. The fire station site is approximately 2.25 acres in size and will provide for the development of a 12,350 square foot building. It is intended that the project will attempt to be to obtain a LEED Platinum Certification.

Holz provided a detailed review of the proposed development plan including building elevations and complete overview of the green amenities provided with the project.

The presentation and Commission noted the following:

- There is no shading for the building provided by trees; provide deciduous trees in layers especially for the areas adjacent to the west side of the building.
- Make stormwater area more natural form, not a square or rectangle element.
- Like materials, overall massing of the façade but there is not way of obviously getting in and out of the building; no front door not welcoming especially community room. Need to open up to the front street side façade.
- Public entry should be moved to the east elevation not on the northwesterly corner of the building where there are issues with the northwesterly winter winds. In addition, extend roof overhang toward South Point.
- Make the turnaround off the southwesterly corner porous concrete.
- Kudos on LEED certification for the building but look at trucks that can support greener community design. Ask the Chief to look at greener community design for use with smaller streets and easier turning access.

- Resolve issue of freezing of rainwater with the above grade tanks beyond the alternative of heating with the photovoltaic solar panels, seasonal use or burial.
- Consider combining harvested rainwater in combination with use with the HVAC system.
- Take a relook at the pergola around the hedge herb garden to be more than a structure for photovoltaic solar panels in combination with the underlying garden. Appreciate the City taking the lead for the private sector in regards to sustainability and green amenities in association with the proposed LEED Platinum Certification.
- Make the flagpole space more of a gathering area.
- Reexamine the educational aspects of the facility in terms of the station's operation as a sustainable LEED certified facility versus a conventionally designed facility.
- Look at LEED's credit for use of certified wood.
- Provide for access to the southerly areas of the site in association of the redesign of the pond.
- Double-load area adjacent to the rear garage entry for parking in order to reduce stalls located at the rear of the fire station living area.
- Limit public access to the rear of the building intended for use by only fire fighters with the narrowing of the access lane to provide a cue for non-public use.
- Consider locating rain barrels along the south elevation to provide for their need and use for gardens within this area; now limited only to those located on the north elevation.
- Pull meeting room entry further to the street and incorporate an enhanced gathering space.
- Look at introducing green strips within the front driveway apron for fire trucks as a means to reduce pavement.
- Introduce a strip of glass into the overhead doors at eye level.
- On back elevation, window groupings should not be symmetrical.
- The offset within the roof line between the apparatus room and living quarters requires more of a separation. Separate slope roof of garage from controlled entry feature (pop-up) in addition to reworking the upper proportions, slope, and overhang.
- The garden and potential water sources; above grade rain barrels are on opposite sides of the building.
- Consider the use of porous paving for walkways.

ACTION:

Since this was an **INFORMATIONAL PRESENTATION**, no formal action was taken by the Commission.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 6, 7 and 8.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 336 South Point Road

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	6	7	-	8	-	6	-	-
	7	7	-	-	-	6	9	8
	7	8	-	-	-	7	7	7
	6	7	-	7	-	5	5	6

General Comments:

- Great presentation. Attention to sustainable practices/LEED platinum is excellent signal of City “taking the lead.” Next...green fire trucks to serve green community.
- Great to see the City moving ahead of the private sector for sustainability.
- Great start.
- Wonderful start. “L” shaped retention area? Cistern for herb garden? Sidewalk to fire station door. Double loaded service stalls. Study fascia profiles of 2, 5/12 and 1/12. Roof pitch components.
- Front façade lacks welcoming front door. Good integration of sustainable technique into architecture. Great opportunity to create a teaching building for students, design pros, and other fire departments. Need to improve relationship of community room to street and plaza around flagpole. Very good start.
- LEED platinum – makes me proud to be a Madisonian! Plus very good architecture to boot. Design and function need some tweaks, but a great beginning.